CITY OF ATLANTA

LESLIE WARD
City Auditor
lward1@atlantaga.gov

AMANDA NOBLE
Deputy City Auditor
anoble@atlantaga.gov

TO: Honorable Mayor, City Council President, and members of the City Council

FROM: Leslie Ward, City Auditor

DATE: July 13, 2016

SUBJECT: Audit: Renew Atlanta Bond Program—Program Management Plan

The purpose of this memo is to communicate the results our performance audit of the Renew Atlanta Program Management Plan (PMP). The PMP documents the design of the internal control system of the Renew Atlanta 2015 Infrastructure Bond Program. We undertook this audit to ensure that Renew Atlanta's internal control system is designed to address areas recommended by best practice. According to the GAO publication *Standards for Internal Control in the Federal Government*, known as the Green Book, internal control is a process used by management to help an entity achieve its objectives, including operational objectives, reporting reliable information about operations, and complying with applicable laws and regulations. The Green Book sets internal control standards for federal entities and the federal Office of Management and Budget *Uniform Guidance* for federal awards encourages recipients of federal funds to follow these standards. Our objective was to answer the following question:

- Does the Renew Atlanta Program Management Plan provide a framework to establish an effective system of internal control consistent with the criteria established in the GAO Green Book?

Background

The city identified a more than $1 billion backlog of transportation and facility projects as of January 2015. To begin to address this backlog, the city held a vote to authorize bonds to fund about a quarter of the work. Citizens voted in favor of the $250 million Renew Atlanta Infrastructure Bond on March 17, 2015. Transportation projects, including bridge and sidewalk

repair and reconstruction, account for $184.1 million of the $250 million. Facility projects, such as renovation and repair of municipal facilities and recreation centers, account for $65.9 million of bond funds. The city intends to use the $250 million to attract state and federal grants and other funding sources to help address the remaining backlog.

The projects are split into citywide projects and into local projects for council districts. Citywide projects total nearly $182.6 million; local projects account for the remaining $67.4 million, with approximately $5.6 million planned for each council district. Renew Atlanta broke ground on its first project in late July 2015.

Exhibit 1: Renew Atlanta Program Funding Breakdown ($ millions)

	Citywide Projects	Local Projects	Total
Transportation	134.5	49.6	184.1
Facility	48.1	17.8	65.9
Total	182.6	67.4	250.0

Source: 15-R-3527 and Oracle Financials (Oct. 2015)

City Council passed ordinance 15-R-3343, which requires the City Auditor to establish a capital project and construction audit function to monitor the Renew Atlanta Infrastructure Bond program over its five-year lifespan, issuing reports at six month intervals. This report focusing on internal controls is the second in the series. The first report focused on contract terms, which establish controls in the contract environment. Subsequent reports will focus on areas such as contractor practices, projected and actual schedules and costs, and alignment with program goals.

Methodology

We conducted this audit in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards. Our audit methods included:
- identifying 17 control principles that compose the five components of internal control, as detailed in the GAO Green Book (*Standards for Internal Control in the Federal Government*)
- assessing the Renew Atlanta Program Management Plan for complete coverage of these elements

Generally accepted government auditing standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objective. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives.

The Program Management Plan Addresses the Five Components of Internal Control

The Renew Atlanta Program Management Plan provides a nearly complete framework for establishing an effective system of internal control consistent with criteria based on the GAO Green Book. The PMP addresses most aspects of internal control; adding processes to assess risks of fraud and significant change as well as periodically reviewing and updating the internal control system would strengthen the document.

Design of the Control Environment is Mostly Consistent with Recommended Practices

The PMP establishes a tone of commitment to ethical conduct and defines responsibilities of key roles and business units, consistent with Green Book attributes of the principle of control environment. The PMP does not document the responsibilities of existing oversight bodies. GAO defines the control environment as the foundation for an internal control system that provides the discipline and structure affecting the overall quality of internal control. Management and those responsible for oversight of an organization should establish a positive tone regarding internal control, as well as establish and demonstrate a commitment to ethical conduct. The oversight body should provide direction for the internal control system. The internal control system should define structure, assign responsibility, and delegate authority for key roles and functional business units. Processes should be in place for recruiting, developing, and retaining a competent workforce. Evaluation of performance and accountability for internal control responsibilities are integral to the control environment.

The PMP establishes a tone of integrity at the top, but does not define an oversight body. The PMP establishes standards covering legal, ethical, conflict of interest, quality, and performance—as well as processes for addressing deviations from these standards. The document mitigates risk that excessive pressure could result in personnel cutting corners to meet goals by focusing on open, direct communication; prioritization of tasks; reasonable commitments; and cooperation and adaptability. While the PMP establishes the Project Control Board, comprising senior management from Renew Atlanta and from client departments, the board has no formal responsibility for overseeing the internal control system or for providing input to remediate deficiencies in the internal control system. There are several bodies providing oversight for the Renew Atlanta Infrastructure Bond Program, but this oversight is not documented in the PMP. An oversight body scrutinizes and questions management activities and can provide alternative perspectives.

The PMP clearly defines roles and responsibilities, but lacks staffing succession and contingency plans. The PMP describes the organization of the Renew Atlanta program team, defining roles and responsibilities for each of the component groups and key positions of the team: General Manager (and direct reports to the General Manger), Project Management Officer, Program Management Team groups (*e.g.*, project controls, contracts, finance), Project Managers, and Construction Managers. The PMP directs management to hire competent contractors, consultants, and service providers. The Renew Atlanta program is procuring a Project Management Team to complement city staff. The PMP lacks consideration of succession or staffing contingency plans, and provides few specifics to speak to staff development and retention. These plans address personnel change risks.

The PMP defines forms of documentation for the internal control system and establishes accountability for internal and external parties. The internal control system is documented primarily in the PMP itself; the form and use of various authorizing documents are also described, along with the structure of the information controls (*e.g.*, the Work Breakdown Structure). The Work Breakdown Structure is a hierarchical organization of the scope of Renew Atlanta. Internally, accountability for nodes of the Work Breakdown Structure is tracked such that one individual is accountable for each node —for example, the General Manager is responsible for the single node at the top level of the hierarchy, the Program Management Officer for sets of projects (*e.g.*, all bridges or all repaving), and project managers for individual projects. External accountability is primarily established through contract terms, including liquidated damages, offsets, and withheld payments. These methods depend on sufficiently strong contract terms and monitoring.

PMP Defines Risk Assessment Procedures but Overlooks Fraud and Change Risks

The Renew Atlanta internal control system, as designed, defines objectives, risk tolerances, and risk responses, along with processes for identifying and analyzing risks. The PMP, however, does not address fraud risk or processes to assess the potential for systemic change. Management should assess risks that could affect the achievement of stated objectives. This risk assessment requires the definition of objectives and the definition of risk tolerances with regard to those objectives. Once this has been accomplished, management should assess, analyze, and develop responses to risks. Among the risks assessed, management should ensure specifically that processes exist within the internal control system to consider the risks of fraud and of significant changes that could affect the internal control system.

The PMP defines objectives, risk tolerances, and risk responses. The PMP defines objectives at both a program-wide, strategic level and at an operational level. The PMP lists five primary goals: scope, schedule, budget, diversity, and working environment. The PMP details well-defined, measurable risk tolerances for scope, schedule, and budget. Risk tolerance for diversity is the responsibility of the Office of Contract Compliance to define. The PMP describes a process to identify and analyze risks at the project level and documents options for responding to risk—primarily the use of alternative project delivery/contract types to allocate risk and reward between the city and contractors or other entities. These might include, among others, the Georgia Department of Transportation, community improvement districts, or Atlanta BeltLine. The use of contracts as a risk response tool reinforces the importance of previous audit recommendations on contract terms.

The PMP contains no processes to assess fraud risk or the potential for significant program-wide change. The design of an internal control system should explicitly consider risk of fraud within an organization. Fraud includes any deliberate act to deprive another of property or money by deception or other unfair means. The PMP does not explicitly define processes to assess fraud risk factors and types. Risk assessment should also consider the potential for significant changes that might affect the internal control system. The PMP defines change management procedures at the project-level and in the contract environment (*e.g.*, change orders), but provides no mechanism to identify potential program-wide changes. Change assessment is crucial and can be overlooked during normal operations.

Control Activities Address Most Risks

The PMP defines control activities to appropriately respond to identified risks and establish integrity of the information system. Management establishes and documents control activities in policies and procedures to respond to risks and achieve organizational objectives. The design of the internal control system should ensure that control activities are of an appropriate type to respond to identified risks, occur at various levels throughout the entity, and adequately ensure segregation of duties where appropriate. Special consideration should be given to controls over the information system, including people, processes, and technology. Once designed, control activities should be implemented through policies and periodically reviewed for effectiveness.

Control activities are well designed to address most risks. The PMP defines control activities that span a variety of types and are appropriate to the risks they address. The control activities are designed to be performed at various levels of the organization and appropriately consider segregation of duties. Roles are defined throughout the document, especially for financial management and invoice payment. Responsibilities are very well documented through policies—such as for key roles, for functional groups, for contracting, and for financial management. The PMP does not speak to periodic review of control activities. As circumstances change, management should revise control activities as needed.

The PMP defines appropriate controls over most aspects of the information system. The information system is well defined in the PMP—with robust descriptions of communication and the flow of information, as well as of the information technology system. Controls are designed to validate input to the information systems, to maintain the integrity of data in the system, and to review reporting output from the system. Information security is addressed from the perspective of information technology and from the perspective of controls on release of technical, proprietary, or business-sensitive information. The PMP lacks, however, documentation of processes for information technology acquisition, development, and maintenance. These procedures should prevent unauthorized modifications to information technology.

PMP Describes Methods and Forms of Information and Communication

The PMP addresses communication, data reliability, and information flow. Quality information and effective communication are necessary for an internal control system to function. An internal control system should identify information requirements; specify controls to ensure that reliable, relevant data is processed into quality information; and establish appropriate methods of communication throughout the entity and with external parties as necessary.

The PMP addresses the use of quality information in the information system and for all communications. The PMP identifies the information required for meetings, reporting, and to be handled by the ORION system. The Program Controls group is responsible for determining ongoing information requirements and developing systematic processes to collect, develop, and report information. Staff and management at multiple levels are responsible for ensuring the validity of information entered into the ORION system.

Expectations, requirements, and processes for internal and external communication are well defined. Various aspects of internal communication are well documented in the PMP, including meetings, liaisons with city departments, IT systems, and reporting. Consideration is also given to the forms of communication—both formal requirements and tone. The PMP emphasizes open communication and an environment in which any employee can report an issue without fear of reprisal. Inclusion of the city's ethics hotline (800-884-0911) could further advance an environment of open communication. The PMP documents various types of external meetings, procedures for release of technical or proprietary information to external parties, and outreach. Certain roles are assigned responsibility for external interfaces, such as with contractors or the public. Methods of communication are considered as well. However, there is no documentation of procedures relating to communication through the public-facing website.

PMP Does Not Explicitly Define Monitoring Processes to Periodically Review and Update the Internal Control System

The PMP should include processes to identify and correct deficiencies in the design, implementation, or operation of the internal control system. Internal control should not be static by design; it should be able to adapt to changing circumstances. The design of the internal control system should be adjusted as necessary to achieve the goals of the organization. The PMP, as the documentation of the design of the internal control system, should be thought of as a "living document" and should include processes for monitoring the performance of the internal control system itself and for updating it as needed.

The PMP establishes baselines and mechanisms to monitor business activities, but lacks explicitly defined processes to monitor the overall effectiveness of the internal control system itself. The PMP defines a structure to evaluate the results of operational monitoring (*e.g.*, financial transactions or performance measurements), but does not speak to the monitoring of the control system itself. Similarly, the PMP defines processes to set baselines for operational information (*e.g.*, project scopes, schedules, budgets, etc.), but not to set a baseline for the performance of the internal control system itself. While the PMP does not specifically address overall monitoring of the internal control system to identify and address needed changes, controls to address operational issues could flag control system issues. Staff is encouraged to report issues, which are to be assessed for significance, potential reporting, root cause, and potential actions to prevent or mitigate recurrence. Additionally, the program is responsible for responding to audit report findings and recommendations in a timely manner, providing commitments to take corrective action and prevent recurrence, and assuring corrective action is taken.

We recommend that Renew Atlanta consider additions or modifications to the Program Management Plan to address these gaps in internal control, according to GAO Green Book standards.

If you have questions you may call Amanda Noble at 404/330-6750, or you may reach me at 404/330-6804. We appreciate the staff's courtesy and cooperation throughout the audit.

Recommendations

1. We recommend that the Program Management Plan document and define the bodies responsible for oversight of the Renew Atlanta Infrastructure Bond program.

2. We recommend that the Program Management Plan document the responsibility of the oversight body for the Renew Atlanta organization to oversee the internal control system and to provide input for the remediation of any deficiencies.

3. We recommend that the Program Management Plan document policies regarding the retention of staff and succession or contingency plans.

4. We recommend that the Program Management Plan include the City of Atlanta Ethics Hotline number.

5. We recommend that the Program Management Plan document policies for assessing the risk of fraud.

6. We recommend that the Program Management Plan document policies for assessing the risk of potential significant changes which might affect the internal control of the organization.

7. We recommend that the Program Management Plan document policies for the acquisition, development, and maintenance of the information technology used within the Renew Atlanta organization.

8. We recommend that the Program Management Plan document procedures relating to communication through the public-facing website.

9. We recommend that the Program Management Plan document policies to provide for periodic review of the design, implementation, and operating effectiveness of internal control activities and the internal control system.

10. We recommend that the Program Management Plan document procedures to evaluate any issues which may be found during review of the internal control system and to update the Program Management Plan to address those issues.

Renew Atlanta Management Review and Response to Audit Recommendations

Report # 16.03	Report Title: Renew Atlanta Bond Program: Contract Language	Date: June 2016

Recommendation Responses – Renew Atlanta General Manager

Rec. # 1	We recommend that the Program Management Plan document and define the bodies responsible for oversight of the Renew Atlanta Infrastructure Bond program.	Agree

	Proposed Action:	Incorporated in PMP Section 2.1. (Please see attached.)
	Implementation Timeframe:	Ongoing
	Comments:	
	Responsible Person:	Faye DiMassimo, Renew Atlanta General Manager

Rec. # 2	We recommend that the Program Management Plan document the responsibility of the oversight body for the Renew Atlanta organization to oversee the internal control system and to provide input for the remediation of any deficiencies.	Agree

	Proposed Action:	Incorporated in PMP Section 2.1. (Please see attached.)
	Implementation Timeframe:	Ongoing
	Comments:	
	Responsible Person:	Faye DiMassimo, Renew Atlanta General Manager

Rec. # 3	We recommend that the Program Management Plan document policies regarding the retention of staff and succession or contingency plans.	Agree

	Proposed Action:	Renew Atlanta will continue to coordinate with the City's Human Resources Department for retention of staff and succession/contingency plans consistent with those used throughout the City. Renew Atlanta will incorporate this information into the Program Management Plan as received from HR.
	Implementation Timeframe:	Ongoing
	Comments:	
	Responsible Person:	Faye DiMassimo, Renew Atlanta General Manager

Rec. # 4	We recommend that the Program Management Plan include the City of Atlanta Ethics Hotline number.	Agree

	Proposed Action:	Incorporated in PMP Section 9.7. (Please see attached.)
	Implementation Timeframe:	Ongoing
	Comments:	
	Responsible Person:	Faye DiMassimo, Renew Atlanta General Manager and Jim Drinkard

Rec. # 5	We recommend that the Program Management Plan document policies for assessing the risk of fraud.	Agree

	Proposed Action:	The Renew Atlanta Bond Program Project Control Board will review the business processes in the following areas: Approval/acceptance of changes to the scope of work or contract terms; Approval/acceptance of work performed;

Approval of invoices; and Issuance of payment of invoices. If any risk of fraud is identified in the reviews, the Project Control Board will work with Finance, the DOP and the departments that are or will be administering Renew Atlanta Bond Program contracts to develop a process to mitigate the risk. The Project Control Board will further identify the appropriate person to execute the duties which mitigate the risk in a manner so as to avoid a conflict of interest. Incorporated in PMP Section 4.4. (Please see attached.)

Implementation Timeframe: Ongoing
Comments:
Responsible Person: Chief of Procurement Adam Smith and Karen Thomas

Rec. # 6	We recommend that the Program Management Plan document policies for assessing the risk of potential significant changes which might affect the internal control of the organization.	Agree

Proposed Action: Ongoing implementation of the Program Management Plan provides the framework and procedures for the assessment of risk of potential significant changes which might affect the internal control of the organization. Renew Atlanta management will coordinate the resolution of identified risks through the city's management structure as necessary.
Implementation Timeframe: Ongoing
Comments:
Responsible Person: Faye DiMassimo, Renew Atlanta General Manager

Rec. # 7	We recommend that the Program Management Plan document policies for the acquisition, development, and maintenance of the information technology used within the Renew Atlanta organization.	Agree

Proposed Action: AIM will work with the Renew Atlanta to utilize the AIM's PMO Governance and Review boards to acquire, build and maintain technology solutions to comply with industry best practices and SDLC methodologies. Incorporated in PMP Section 2.3.5. (Please see attached).
Implementation Timeframe: Ongoing
Comments:
Responsible Person: AIM CIO Samir Saini

Rec. # 8	We recommend that the Program Management Plan document procedures relating to communication through the public-facing website.	Agree

Proposed Action: Incorporated in PMP Section 9.12 and Appendix D. (Please see attached).
Implementation Timeframe: Ongoing
Comments:
Responsible Person: Faye DiMassimo, Renew Atlanta General Manager and Briana Davis

Rec. # 9	We recommend that the Program Management Plan document policies to provide for periodic review of the design, implementation, and operating effectiveness of internal control activities and the internal control system.	Agree

Proposed Action: Incorporated in PMP Section 2.1. (Please see attached).
Implementation Timeframe: Ongoing
Comments:

	Responsible Person: Faye DiMassimo, Renew Atlanta General Manager and Jim Drinkard	
Rec. # 10	We recommend that the Program Management Plan document procedures to evaluate any issues which may be found during review of the internal control system, and to update the Program Management Plan to address those issues.	Agree

Proposed Action: Incorporated in PMP Section 2.1. (Please see attached).
Implementation Timeframe: Ongoing
Comments:
Responsible Person: Faye DiMassimo, Renew Atlanta General Manager and Jim Drinkard

Renew Atlanta Management Review and Response to Audit Recommendations – Assigned PMP Sections

Recommendation #1: We recommend that the Program Management Plan document and define the bodies responsible for oversight of the Renew Atlanta Infrastructure Bond program.

Recommendation #2: We recommend that the Program Management Plan document the responsibility of the oversight body for the Renew Atlanta organization to oversee the internal control system and to provide input for the remediation of any deficiencies.

Recommendation #9: We recommend that the Program Management Plan document policies to provide for periodic review of the design, implementation, and operating effectiveness of internal control activities and the internal control system.

Recommendation #10: We recommend that the Program Management Plan document procedures to evaluate any issues which may be found during review of the internal control system, and to update the Program Management Plan to address those issues.

Addressed in PMP Section 2.1: *Renew Atlanta 2015 Bond Program Organization and Program Oversight*

Program Oversight

Oversight of the Renew Atlanta Bond Program generally mirrors how all City Departments are led, managed, and monitored.   This oversight is performed primarily by the Executive Branch through the Chief Operating Officer, with additional oversight by City Council and advisory input from the Renew Atlanta Technical Advisory Committee as described below:

- **The Executive Branch, through the Chief Operating Officer (COO)**

The Chief Operating Officer (COO) for the City of Atlanta directly manages and oversees all city operating departments and related agencies including Aviation, Police, Fire, Corrections, Parks, Recreation and Cultural Affairs, Planning and Community Development, Public Works, **Renew Atlanta**, Watershed Management, Human Resources, Procurement, Information Technology, Sustainability and Enterprise Assets.

The COO's office oversees, monitors and provides input for the remediation of any deficiencies in the internal control system of Renew Atlanta through:

1. annual and semi-annual performance reviews of the Renew Atlanta General Manager (note: These performance reviews serve as the primary event for the periodic and scheduled review of the design, implementation and operating effectiveness of the internal control system).,
2. weekly Cabinet meetings with monthly departmental updates,
3. monthly update meetings on each portfolio (Horizontal and Vertical)
4. bi-weekly participation on the Renew Atlanta Project Control Board (see Section 2.4)
5. review and approval of annual operating and capital budgets, and
6. review and approval of all procurements and contract awards.

Renew Atlanta Management Review and Response to Audit Recommendations – Assigned PMP Sections

- **Atlanta City Council**

In addition to legislation, the Atlanta City Council works hard to ensure that city government works for its citizens. <u>Through the various Council Committees, the council assesses various government programs and agencies</u>. Each year, the Council is in charge of holding budget hearings in which the City's budget, recommended by the Mayor, is strictly reviewed prior to being voted on by the Council. Input for the remediation of deficiencies of Renew Atlanta from City Council can be received through:

1. the Council Committee system at regularly scheduled meetings, through the committee with the appropriate oversight (could be Utilities, Transportation or Finance/Executive),
2. in work sessions with these Committees, or,
3. in meetings with individual Council members.

- **Technical Advisory Committee (TAC**)

City Council has established through Resolution 15-R-3285, the "Renew Atlanta Infrastructure Bond Technical Advisory Committee" for the purpose of monitoring, providing assistance and assuring that the Bond projects are completed in a matter that assures quality control, timeliness, and costs effectiveness. . Input for the remediation of deficiencies of Renew Atlanta through the Technical Advisory Committee will be received in the TAC's regularly scheduled meetings.

Independent Oversight by City Auditor's Office

Section 11.2 of this document describes further oversight of Renew Atlanta that was assigned through official City Council legislation.

Changes to Internal Control System

Any changes to the internal control system as a result of the above described periodic reviews will be documented and approved by the Renew Atlanta General Manager through the issuance of directives to the Renew Atlanta team and will be incorporated in future updates to this Program Management Manual.

Renew Atlanta Management Review and Response to Audit Recommendations – Assigned PMP Sections

Recommendation #4: We recommend that the Program Management Plan include the City of Atlanta Ethics Hotline number.

Addressed in PMP Section 9.7: *Open Communication*

The Program recognizes that timely addressing workplace issues and concerns are essential to the safe, efficient and effective execution of the Program. In order to safeguard the health and safety of Program participants and the public, ensure compliance with applicable laws and regulations, and support the Renew Atlanta 2015 Program mission in a safe, efficient and cost effective manner, Renew Atlanta 2015 Program promotes and encourages open and honest communication on issues and concerns that have the potential to adversely affect the site or its participants.

Requirements

Program participants shall have the responsibility to identify and seek appropriate resolution of workplace issues and concerns, have the right to receive a timely response to their issues and concerns, and receive protection from adverse consequences as a result of reporting such matters. Management shall create and foster an atmosphere where Program participants feel comfortable in openly communicating their workplace issues and concerns. Renew Atlanta has "zero tolerance" for workplace issues such as intimidation, harassment (sexual or otherwise), and discrimination, as well as any associated real or threatened reprimand or reprisal in a response to suppress these issues.

Any employee working for the City of Atlanta or for a consultant or contractor retained by the City on Renew Atlanta should immediately report any incident to his/her supervisor, directly to the Renew Atlanta General Manager, or to the City's Diversity Manager. An investigation and associated actions will then be conducted in conformance with applicable City Code of Ordinances.

The City's Ethics Hotline (800-884-0911) is also available to Renew Atlanta team members for any instance where a team member feels he or she has observed unethical behavior on the Renew Atlanta program.

Recommendation #5: We recommend that the Program Management Plan document policies for assessing the risk of fraud.

Addressed in PMP Section 4.4: *Risk of Fraud Protections and Policy*

The City's standard terms and conditions for construction contracts include provisions that protect the City. Additionally, it is standard practice to require the contractor sign a payment application with a sworn statement that the quantities and payments being requested are true and accurate. The City is further protected under the Georgia False Claims Act (or Federal False Claims Act if federally funded), which provides statutory remedies if false information is provided without the need to establish "fraud".

Renew Atlanta Management Review and Response to Audit Recommendations – Assigned PMP Sections

Renew Atlanta Policy for Assessing the Risk of Fraud
The Renew Atlanta Bond Program Project Control Board led by the Renew Atlanta General Manager will continually review the business processes in the following areas:

> Approval/acceptance of changes to the scope of work or contract terms;
> Approval/acceptance of work performed;
> Approval of invoices; and
> Issuance of payment of invoices.

If any risk of fraud is identified in the reviews, the Project Control Board and General Manager will work with Finance, the DOP and the departments that are or will be administering Renew Atlanta Bond Program contracts to develop a process to mitigate the risk. The Project Control Board will further identify the appropriate person to execute the duties which mitigate the risk in a manner so as to avoid a conflict of interest.

Recommendation #7: We recommend that the Program Management Plan document policies for the acquisition, development, and maintenance of the information technology used within the Renew Atlanta organization.

Addressed in PMP Section 2.3.5: *Program Specialist Groups*

Atlanta Information Management (AIM)
The Department of Atlanta Information Management (AIM) oversees and guides all technology-related activities associated with the delivery of products and services managed by every department of the City, including Renew Atlanta. The department provides a strategic framework and direction for leveraging technology to create business value.

Responsibilities
- Work with Renew Atlanta to utilize the AIM's PMO Governance and Review boards to acquire, build and maintain technology solutions to comply with industry best practices and SDLC methodologies

Recommendation #8: We recommend that the Program Management Plan document procedures relating to communication through the public-facing website.

Addressed in PMP Section 9.12: *Public Outreach Procedures* **and Appendix D**

Renew Atlanta Website Procedures
There are two types of updates made to the Renew Atlanta website – project information updates and content updates. Project information updates are completed monthly. The Data Analyst pulls reports from the Project Management Information System that generates information inputted by Project Managers about all Transportation and Municipal Facilities projects. The reports are then cross-referenced with the existing project information listed on the website. A project update list is created and then reviewed by the Senior Business Systems Analyst.

Renew Atlanta Management Review and Response to Audit Recommendations – Assigned PMP Sections

The Renew Atlanta's Communications team, in collaboration with the Mayor's Office of Communications, revises the content as necessary. The Program Management Officers make the final approval before the updated project information is posted to the website.

General content updates are made upon request by project managers and upper management, including the General Manager and Program Management Officers. These updates occur on an as-needed basis.

Renew Atlanta Social Media Procedures
The Communications Team uses a social media schedule to track all Renew Atlanta social media posts. All posts are drafted and sent two weeks before they are scheduled to post. The schedule is revised bi-weekly and sent to the Mayor's Office of Communications, along with photos, for revision and approval. Once approved, content is posted to the City of Atlanta's official twitter account by the Mayor's Office of Communication and re-tweeted onto the Renew Atlanta twitter account by the Renew Atlanta Communications team.

See Appendix D for more detailed information on the External Communications Alignment Strategy.

RENEW ATLANTA BOND PROGRAM – CITY OF ATLANTA
EXTERNAL COMMUNICATION ALIGNMENT STRATEGY (Revised)
FEBRUARY 2016 – DECEMBER 2017

RENEW ATLANTA COMMUNICATION GOALS	KEY EXTERNAL AUDIENCE/STAKEHOLDERS	COMMUNICATION BASELINE	ACTION ITEMS		TIMELINE	

GOALS:
1. Be effective, efficient, and transparent in all external capacities.
2. To communicate to external stakeholders and the public-at-large by communicating the value and impact of vertical and horizontal projects completed, underway, and in planning from Renew Atlanta bond inception to bond completion.
3. To identify and devise positive messaging strategies regarding projects with proactive and real-time information easily accessible and available to stakeholders and the public-at-large. This involves pushing people to the website, interactive GIS map, and other RA social media platforms.
4. Define and build alliance with stakeholders affected by, or benefitting from, completed and upcoming projects to join as tentacles sharing positive public-facing messaging.
5. Build progressive Renew Atlanta-specific relationships with television, radio and print media utilizing social media tagging and email so that media talent will be knowledgeable about upcoming projects and look forward to their inbox.
	All external communication should occur only after the intended information has been provided to internal stakeholders.
	
	COA Councilors, President 16
	CIDs 3
	NPUs 20
	ACP Dozens
	COA residents 500,000
	Atlanta Public Schools xxx
	Charter/Private Schools xxx
	Private Schools xx
	Marta 438,900
	Higher Education 51,300
	Health Facilities
	Convention Visitors Bureau
	Pedestrians
	Bicyclists (ABC)
	Libraries
	Visiting General Public
	Miscellaneous
		• ID COMPLETED projects, promote value via web and social media channels. PR/S
		• ID upcoming projects and promote value via web, social, video and media channels. PR/S
		• ID tools appropriate to promote specific project value. PR/S
		• ID tentacle(s) to promote and share positive messaging about project and program. PR/S
		• Collegiate intern assistance for youth infusion of ideas. FOE
		• Renew Atlanta tagline, "Renew Atlanta, thank YOU for your support!" on outgoing COA emails. PR
			Social Media (Active)
			  Facebook
			  Twitter
			  Instagram
			Media (Active)
			  Television – Traffic Talent
			  Radio Traffic Reporters
			  Print Reporters
			Web Content (Passive)
			Video Content Series
			Press Releases
			Opinion Editorials
			Public Meetings
			External email taglines
			Published articles
			Channel 26
				High
				High
				High
				Med
				High
				High
				Med
				High
				High
				High
				Med
				Med
				Low
				Low
				Low
				Med
					Active
					Active
					Active
					Create
					Weekly
					Weekly
					As needed
					Monthly
					Weekly
					Monthly
					As needed
					As needed
					As needed
					Ongoing
					Quarterly
					Weekly
						Feb 2016>
						Feb 2016>
						Feb 2016>
						Feb 2016>
						Feb 2016>
						March 2016>
						March 2016>
						March 2016>
						Ongoing
						Feb 2016>
						Ongoing
						April 2016>
						
						March 2016>
						April 2016>
						Feb 2016>

MASUREMENT LINE: • Website visits via Google Analytics	**MEDIA STAKEHOLDERS** Media will be informed by the Mayor's	• Paint COA construction cones with Renew Atlanta. PR	**COMMUNICATION TOOL CHEST** Renew Atlanta Project Presser		**BEGIN FEBRUARY 2016** External Communications- Amy	

RENEW ATLANTA BOND PROGRAM – CITY OF ATLANTA
EXTERNAL COMMUNICATION ALIGNMENT STRATEGY (Revised)
FEBRUARY 2016 – DECEMBER 2017

• Amount of both negative and positive feedback – through social media, website, constituent calls – on a monthly basis • Utilize comments cards at all public-facing events, such as public meetings, off-site presentations, etc. • Amount of media coverage on a monthly basis	Communications staff. Information will be fed through Amy Ellison or Faye DiMassimo. WSB AJC WAGA FC Daily Report WXIA Atlanta Intown WPCH Creative Loafing WPBA NPU Newsletters WGCL Biz1150 WATC WAEC	• F2F meetings, when needed, with key stakeholders before project begins. S/T/FOE • Renew Atlanta table with staff, tablet and leave behinds at events. PR/S/FOE • Placement placards at Renew Atlanta construction zone. PR • Develop monthly newsletter to key stakeholders with Renew Atlanta project updates. • Video stories showcasing a positive outcome of a project	Renew Atlanta bookmark Redline Project Map Facebook Posts Instagram Periscope Twitter Posts Web Content F2F Meet and Greet Story Mapping Placement Placards Renew Atlanta banner for table Develop Renew Atlanta Newsletter Renew Atlanta cones taglines Video Storytelling	Internal Communications- Briana **BEGIN MARCH 2016** Social Media Schedule (March 2016)- Briana/Amy Outreach Materials- Amy/Briana Website feature updates (Ongoing)- Briana
CHANNEL 24, FB, Twitter **RENEW ATLANTA STORY SERIES**	**ACRONYMS**	**BE THINKING OF CIRCLES OF INFLUENCE FOR EACH PROJECT**	**TIME MANAGEMENT CONTENT FOCUS**	**PRIORTIES**

RENEW ATLANTA BOND PROGRAM – CITY OF ATLANTA
EXTERNAL COMMUNICATION ALIGNMENT STRATEGY (Revised)
FEBRUARY 2016 – DECEMBER 2017

Placement of video content will include Channel 24 as well as critical tags on Facebook and Twitter to attract NPUs, councilors, businesses and media to act as tentacles for positive messaging.	**ACP** – Atlanta Committee for Progress **APS** – Atlanta Public Schools **CAP** - Central Atlanta Progress **CID** – Community Improvement District **FB** - Facebook **F2F** – Face to Face **FOE** – Focus on Engagement, a best practice used to engagement stakeholders in the communication process	Who are the stakeholders most affected by the project underway? Who influences and what motivates the stakeholder group?	**NEWS MEDIA (Active) FOE** [One/Two-way Communication] Print Radio Television NPU Newsletters Patches YouTube	Messaging – WHAT is your message Video Content is a priorty Photograph opps are a priority
STORY 1 District xxx School Zone Beacons Dr. Marquenta Sands-Hall APS	**ID** - Identify **NPU** – Neighborhood Planning Unit **PR** – Public Relations benefit	How can the district councilors effectively help push positive messages on social media? How can NPU's help push positive messages on SM and F2F?	**SOCIAL MEDIA (Active/Passive) FOE** [Two-way Communication] FB posts and live Twitter Instagram Periscope	Talking to each other Brainstorming Silo sharing
STORY 2 District xxx Sidewalks on Lynnhurst Drive Mary Houston, Resident	Simple steps go a long way in quality public relations that push out positive messages about each project **PS** – Periscope	How can you turn negative feelings and comments by stakeholders into positive opportunities for coverage?	**VIDEO CONTENT (Active/Passive) FOE** [One/Two-Way Communication] Design strategy where to put it Most shared content Stakeholder participation Documentation	Building relationships with community affected by big projects Email Management
STORY 3 District xxx AWDA Roof and Interior Upgrades Michael Sterling, Executive Director APS	**S** – Involve Stakeholders before, during and after a project to keep them in the know. Stakeholders are on the front line and have the most invested in the completion of a project.	How will we measure reach? Who are we trying to reach?		
STORY 4 District xxx CID Midtown Kevin Green, CEO Midtown Atl	**SM** – Social Media includes Facebook, Instagram, Twitter **T** – Tentacles, by involving stakeholders and media, they will act as tentacles and push positive messaging for COA.		**WEB CONTENT (Passive)** www.renewatlantabond.com [One-way Communication] Accountability Transparency One Way communication Public Service COA Citizen Information Have "Renew Atlanta, thank YOU for your support!" at top of website	
STORY 5 District xxx Art Program Nucleus Sculpture Studio	**VC** – opportunities for video content are a priority **WC** – Web Content, most WC is for accountability and transparency **2016>** - and onward			
Painting Cones I'd like to suggest painting "Renew Atlanta" on	**Thank YOU quote!** The quote "Renew Atlanta, thank YOU	**Online Video Content** It's a new day where the public	**Table Teams (once a month)** Now that the bond is passed, it's the	

RENEW ATLANTA BOND PROGRAM – CITY OF ATLANTA
EXTERNAL COMMUNICATION ALIGNMENT STRATEGY (Revised)
FEBRUARY 2016 – DECEMBER 2017

all construction cones in Renew Atlanta project areas. It's great PR and free advertising.

COA Email Tags
Tag all outgoing COA emails with "Renew Atlanta, thank YOU for your support." People will say yes to future bonds when they know their past votes have been appreciated. Also keeps the name out there. Free PR.

B-Roll Ready
When video is shot, it can be saved as what's called b-roll for future stories when it comes time to asking for another bond/SPLOST to be passed. Broll can also be placed on social media sites moving forward in the future.

Libraries
Libraries are great PR vehicles for sharing information. Providing them with bookmarks about where to go to get Renew Atlanta information is great marketing.

for your support!" should be front and center on www.renewatlantabond.com. As noted prior, people are more likely to say yes to a future vote when they know a past vote is appreciated. It can also be in Mayor Reed's message as a pullout box that is front and center. You can never say thank you enough.

Active and Passive Communication Tools
Active tools are tools used where the public is actively engaged in pushing positive content. It's a give and take between communications and the public. The public are active participants. The more active tools, the better for focus on engagement. Passive communication is where we tell a story where the public is an active reader or listener.

One and Two-Way Communication
One way communication is necessary for pushing out large amounts of content to 'check a box.' It is necessary for transparency and accountability. Example, pushing content on the bond website.
For messaging and active engagement, two-way communication is the best practice. Example, social media is a great tool for two way communication.

craves video content. By 2017, video will account for **69% of all consumer internet traffic** according to Cisco. (source: The Guardian). **One minute of video is worth 1.8 million words** (source: Forrester research). So let's use to show people where their money is going. Video content takes time to plan, shoot and edit so it must be taken as a priority with regard to labor.

And lastly, **Pew Research shows 87% of young adults aged (30-49) watch or download online video**. It's not the future -- it's a way of life NOW. How can we make every opportunity a video source?

Placement of video will be critical and should include a dense social media push, not just YouTube.

Bicycle Groups
The perfect storm to push messaging. These people have always rallied to the charge in pushing positive messaging. Let's join them to the fullest.

perfect time to calculate where your energy is used to continue to push the message when you're not asking for money. It'd be smart to pick an event a month – just one a month – where a team of two can provide leave behinds and roll video to the public so they can see the wonderful things you're accomplishing. Also a great chance to push social media and website and of course…"Renew Atlanta, thank YOU for your support!" Suggestions: Mayor's breakfast, lunch events, CID events