	Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 7	0 Filed 09/30/20 Page 1 of 22
1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Raul Perez (SBN 174687) Raul.Perez@capstonelawyers.com Tarek H. Zohdy (SBN 247775) Tarek.Zohdy@capstonelawyers.com Cody R. Padgett (SBN 275553) Cody.Padgett@capstonelawyers.com Trisha K. Monesi (SBN 303512) Trisha.Monesi@capstonelawyers.com Capstone Law APC 1875 Century Park East, Suite 1000 Los Angeles, California 90067 Telephone: (310) 556-4811 Facsimile: (310) 943-0396 Attorneys for Plaintiffs Michael Livingston and Sharon McGill	
10	UNITED STATES	DISTRICT COURT
11	NORTHERN DISTR	ICT OF CALIFORNIA
12	MICHAEL LIVINGSTON and SHARON MCGILL, individually, and on behalf of a class of	Case No.: 4:18-cv-05993-JST
13	similarly situated individuals,	Hon. Jon S. Tigar
14	Plaintiffs,	PLAINTIFFS' NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION FOR FINAL APPROVAL OF
15 16	v. MITAC DIGITAL CORPORATION, a California	CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT; MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT
10	corporation,	Date: November 4, 2020
17	Defendant.	Time: 2:00 p.m. Place: Courtroom 6
19		Trace. Courtooni o
20		
20		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		
	MOTION FOR FINAL APPROVAL O	F CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

TO THE COURT, ALL PARTIES, AND THEIR ATTORNEYS OF RECORD:

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that on November 4, 2020, at 2:00 p.m., in Courtroom 6 of the abovecaptioned Court, located at 1301 Clay Street, Oakland, California 94612, the Honorable Jon S. Tigar presiding, Plaintiffs Michael Livingston and Sharon McGill will, and hereby do, move this Court to: (1) enter an order finally approving the settlement described in the Settlement Agreement (Dkt. No. 62-1) preliminarily approved by the Court on April 29, 2020; (2) finally certify the Settlement Class; (3) enter a judgment to dismiss the action.

This Motion is based on: (1) this Notice of Motion and Motion; (2) the Memorandum of Points and Authorities in Support of Motion for Final Approval of Class Action Settlement; (3) the Declaration of Raul Perez; (4) the Declaration of Melinda Yang Regarding the Class Notice and Claims Administration; (5) the [Proposed] Order and [Proposed] Judgment filed concurrently herewith; (6) the records, pleadings, and papers filed in this action; and (7) on such other documentary and oral evidence or argument as may be presented to the Court at the hearing of this Motion.

5 Dated: September 30, 2020

Respectfully submitted,

By: /s/ Trisha K. Monesi Raul Perez Tarek H. Zohdy Cody R. Padgett Trisha K. Monesi **CAPSTONE LAW APC**

Attorney for Plaintiffs Michael Livingston and Sharon McGill

		Case 4	4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70 Filed 09/30/20 Page 3 of 22	
1			TABLE OF CONTENTS	
2				
3	I.	INTR	RODUCTION	.1
4	II.	FAC	TS AND PROCEDURE	.1
5		A.	Overview of the Litigation	.1
6		B.	The Parties Conducted a Thorough Investigation of the Factual and Legal	
7			Issues	2
8		C.	The Parties Settled at a Mediation Before a Retired Judge	3
9		D.	The Settlement Class and the Principal Terms of the Settlement	3
10			1. Composition of the Settlement Class	3
11			2. Settlement Consideration	4
12			3. Release by Plaintiffs and the Settlement Class	.4
13		E.	The Notice and Claims Administration Processes Were Completed	
14			Pursuant to the Court's Order	5
15	III.	ARG	UMENT	6
16		A.	Class Certification Requirements Are Met	6
17		B.	The Court Should Grant Final Approval of the Class Settlement	6
18			1. Class Representatives and Plaintiffs' Counsel Have Adequately	
19			Represented the Class and the Settlement Was Negotiated at	
20			Arms'-Length	8
21			2. The Settlement Provides Valuable Relief to the Class	8
22			(a) The Relief Provided for the Class Is Fair, Adequate, and	
23			Reasonable Considering the Costs, Risks, and Delay of	
24			Trial and Appeal	9
25			(b) The Method of Distribution, Attorneys' Fees, and Other	
26			Agreements1	.1
27			3. The Settlement Treats Class Members Equitably1	2
28			4. The Extent of Discovery Completed Supports Final Approval1	2
			Page i	
			MOTION FOR FINAL APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT	

1 5. The Views of Experienced Counsel Should Be Accorded 2 Substantial Weight 3 6. The Reaction of Class Members to the Proposed Settlement. 4 C. The Settlement Satisfies the Bluetooth Factors. 5 IV. CONCLUSION 6 7 7 7 8 7 9 7 10 7 11 7 12 7 13 7 14 7 15 7 16 7 17 7 18 7 19 7 10 7 11 7 12 7 13 7 14 7 15 7 16 7 17 8 18 7 19 7 12 7 12 7 13 7 14 7 15 7 <			Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70 Filed 09/30/20 Page 4 of 22	
2 Substantial Weight	1		5 The Views of European Councel Should De Assended	
3 6. The Reaction of Class Members to the Proposed Settlement. 4 C. The Settlement Satisfies the Bluetooth Factors. 6 1 7 1 8 9 9 1 10 1 11 1 12 1 13 1 14 1 15 1 16 1 17 1 18 1 19 1 10 1 11 1 12 1 13 1 14 1 15 1 16 1 17 1 18 1 19 1 20 1 21 1 22 1 23 1 24 1 25 1 26 1 27 1 28 1 <td></td> <td></td> <td>_</td> <td>12</td>			_	12
4 C. The Settlement Satisfies the Bluetooth Factors				
5 IV. CONCLUSION 6				
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28				
7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28		IV.	CONCLUSION	15
8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 23 22 23 23 24 25 26 27 28				
9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28				
10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28				
11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28				
12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28				
13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28				
14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28				
15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28				
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28				
17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28				
18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28				
19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28				
20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28	18			
21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28	19			
22 23 24 25 26 27 28	20			
23 24 25 26 27 28	21			
24 25 26 27 28	22			
25 26 27 28	23			
26 27 28	24			
27 28	25			
28	26			
	27			
Page ii	28			
			Page ii	
MOTION FOR FINAL APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT			MOTION FOR FINAL APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT	

	Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70 Filed 09/30/20 Page 5 of 22	
1	TABLE OF AUTHORITIES	
2		
3	FEDERAL CASES	
4	Adoma v. Univ. of Phoenix, Inc., 913 F. Supp. 2d 964 (E.D. Cal. 2012)	
5	Allen v. Bedolla, 787 F.3d 1218 (9th Cir. 2015)	
6	Amchem Prod., Inc. v. Windsor, 521 U.S. 591 (1997)	11
7	Bayat v. Bank of the W., No. C-13-2376-EMC, 2015 WL 1744342 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 15,	
8	2015)	
9	Chambers v. Whirlpool Corp., 214 F. Supp. 3d 877 (C.D. Cal. 2016)	
10	Class Plaintiffs v. City of Seattle, 955 F.2d 1268 (9th Cir. 1992)	6
11	Corson v. Toyota Motor Sales U.S.A., Inc., No. CV 12-8499-JGB (VBKx), 2016 WL	
12	1375838 (C.D. Cal. Apr. 4, 2016)	9, 14
13	Eisen v. Porsche Cars North American, Inc., No. 11-09405-CAS, 2014 WL 439006 (C.D.	
14	Cal. Jan. 30, 2014)	12, 13
15	Grannan v. Alliant Law Grp., P.C., No. C10-02803 HRL, 2012 WL 216522 (N.D. Cal.	
16	Jan. 24, 2012)	14
17	Hanlon v. Chrysler Corp., 150 F.3d 1011 (9th Cir. 1998)	6,7
18	Hensley v. Eckehart, 461 U.S. 424 (1983)	15
19	In re Bluetooth Headset Prods. Liab. Litig., 654 F.3d 935 (9th Cir. 2011)	14
20	In re Extreme Networks, Inc. Sec. Litig., No. 15-04883, 2019 WL 3290770 (N.D. Cal. July	
21	22, 2019)	7
22	In re Hyundai & Kia Fuel Econ. Litig., 926 F.3d 539 (9th Cir. 2019)	6, 11
23	In re Linkedin User Privacy Litig., 309 F.R.D. 573 (N.D. Cal. 2015)	14
24	In re Nexus 6P Prods. Liab. Litig., 293 F. Supp. 3d 888 (N.D. Cal. 2018)	10
25	In re Online DVD-Rental Antitrust Litig., 779 F.3d 934 (9th Cir. 2015)	8
26	In re Pac. Enters. Sec. Litig., 47 F.3d 373 (9th Cir. 1995)	13
27	In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Practices, & Prod. Liab. Litig., 895 F.3d 597	
28	(9th Cir. 2018)	15
	Page iii	
	MOTION FOR FINAL APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT	
	I	

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70 Filed 09/30/20 Page 6 of 22

1	Lane v. Facebook, Inc., 696 F.3d 811 (9th Cir. 2012)	
2	Linney v. Cellular Alaska Partnership, 151 F.3d 1234 (9th Cir. 1998)	12
3	Mazza v. Am. Honda Motor Co., 666 F.3d 581 (9th Cir. 2012)	11
4	Milligan v. Toyota Motor Sales, U.S.A., No. 09-05418-RS, 2012 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 189782	
5	(N.D. Cal. Jan. 6, 2012)	13
6	Moore v. Verizon Commc'ns Inc., No. 09-1823, 2013 WL 4610764 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 28,	
7	2013)	14
8	Officers for Justice v. Civil Service Comm'n, 688 F.2d 615 (9th Cir. 1982)	8
9	Perez v. Asurion Corp., 501 F. Supp. 2d 1360 (S.D. Fla. 2007)	14
10	Rodriguez v. West Pub. Corp., 463 F.3d 948 (9th Cir. 2009)	8, 9
11	Rose v. Bank of Am. Corp., No. 5:11-CV-02390-EJD, 2014 WL 4273358 (N.D. Cal. Aug.	
12	29, 2014)	14
13	Sadowska v. Volkswagen Group of America, No. 11-00665-BRO, 2013 WL 9500948	
14	(C.D. Cal. Sep. 25, 2013)	9
15	Simon v. Toshiba Am., No. C 07-06202 MHP, 2010 WL 1757956 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 30,	
16	2010)	14
17	Spillman v. RPM Pizza, LLC, No. CIV-A-10-349-BAJ, 2013 WL 2286076 (M.D. La. May	
18	23, 2013)	14
19	Sullivan v. DB Invs., Inc., 667 F.3d 273 (3d Cir. 2011)	14
20	<i>Tomek v. Apple Inc.</i> , 636 F. App'x 712 (9th Cir. 2016)	10
21	Warner v. Toyota Motor Sales U.S.A., No. 15-02171-FMO (C.D. Cal. May 21, 2017)	9
22	Wilson v. Hewlett-Packard Co., 668 F.3d 1136 (9th Cir. 2012)	10
23	Zakskorn v. Am. Honda Motor Co., No. 2:11-CV-02610-KJM, 2015 WL 3622990 (E.D.	
24	Cal. June 9, 2015)	9, 14
25		
26	FEDERAL STATUTES	
27	Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(a)	6, 7
28	Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(b)(3)	6, 11
	Page iv	
	MOTION FOR FINAL APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT	

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70 Filed 09/30/20 Page 7 of 22

1	Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(e)(2)7	
2	Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(e)(2)(A)	
3	Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(e)(2)(B)	
4	Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(e)(2)(C)	
5	Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(e)(2)(D)	
6	Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(e)(3)	
7	Fed. R. Civ. Pro. 23(b)(3)11	
8		
9	SECONDARY AUTHORITIES	
10	https://www.orrick.com/en/Practices/Class-Action-Defense	
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22 23		
23 24		
24		
26		
20		
28		
_0		
	Page v MOTION FOR FINAL APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT	

1 2 3 4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES

I. INTRODUCTION

On April 29, 2020, this Court granted preliminary approval of the Amended Joint Stipulation of Class Action Settlement and Release,¹ and approved distribution of the Notice of Class Action Settlement to all Class Members. Class Members were given 60 days to object to, or opt out of, the Settlement. Now that the 60-day deadline has passed, Plaintiffs Michael Livingston and Sharon McGill are pleased to report that no Class Members objected to the Settlement, and only four individuals opted out of the Settlement Class. (Declaration of Melinda Yang ["Yang Decl."] ¶ 27.) Plaintiffs accordingly move the Court to grant this motion for final approval of the class action settlement. This motion is unopposed by Defendant MiTAC Digital Corporation ("Defendant") (collectively with Plaintiffs, the "Parties").

If approved, the Settlement will provide Class Members with immediate and valuable relief consisting of: (1) free map updates; (2) reimbursement for previously purchased Map Updates; and (3) notice of Magellan's terms and conditions (as explained in the FAQ), and that the terms and conditions do not apply to RoadMate Navigators with Free Lifetime Map Updates purchased before June 30, 2019. Plaintiffs and their counsel believe the Settlement is fair and reasonable, and provides Class Members similar, if not superior, remedies to what they could otherwise have expected to receive if the case had been successfully tried, but without the delay and risks associated with continued litigation and trial.

By granting preliminary approval, this Court has already determined that the Settlement is fair and reasonable, subject to objections. With no objections to the Settlement, the Court's preliminary assessment has been separately endorsed by the Settlement Class. Accordingly, the Court should grant final approval.

21 || **II.**

FACTS AND PROCEDURE

A. Overview of the Litigation

Since at least 2010, Defendant designed, manufactured, marketed, distributed, and sold Magellan RoadMate Navigator GPS devices with "free lifetime map updates" ("Magellan RoadMate FLM" or "devices").² (*See* First Amended Complaint (Dkt. 21) ("FAC") ¶ 29.) Under Defendant's original policy,

¹ Hereinafter, the "Settlement" or "Settlement Agreement." Unless indicated otherwise, capitalized terms used herein have the same meaning as those defined by the Settlement Agreement.

² Defendant also manufactured, marketed, distributed, and sold Magellan RoadMate Navigator

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70 Filed 09/30/20 Page 9 of 22

purchase of a device "entitles" owners to "up to four (4) map updates per year, for the life of the GPS receiver or until Magellan no longer receives relevant map data." (*Id.* ¶ 32.)

In June 2018, Defendant changed the Terms and Conditions of its lifetime map subscriptions to state, "lifetime refers to the useful lifetime of the device, considered to be 3 (three) years from the date of manufacture."³ (FAC ¶ 4, 36.) After the self-designated 3-year "lifetime of the device" period, Plaintiffs and other owners of Magellan RoadMate FLM devices were required to pay for each map update. (FAC ¶ 5, 11, 17, 35.)

Plaintiffs filed this class action in the United States District Court for the Northern District of California on September 28, 2018. (Dkt. 1.) The operative FAC asserts claims for: (1) violations of California's Consumers Legal Remedies Act ("CLRA"); (2) violations of Unfair Competition Law, California Business & Professions Code sections 17200, *et seq.* ("UCL"); (3) breach of express warranty pursuant to California Commercial Code section 2313; (4) breach of written warranty pursuant to the Magnuson-Moss Warranty Act; (5) trespass to chattels; and (6) unjust enrichment. Although the operative FAC alleges six causes of action, they are all predicated on these operative facts—that Defendant marketed and sold the devices with "free lifetime map updates," but stopped providing free lifetime map updates after only three years, when it began to charge for updates instead.

B.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

The Parties Conducted a Thorough Investigation of the Factual and Legal Issues

The Settlement is the product of informed negotiations following extensive investigation by Plaintiffs' Counsel. Before and after filing the Complaint, Plaintiffs' Counsel investigated and researched the claims of Plaintiffs and Class Members relating to the "free lifetime map updates" offered in connection with Defendant's devices. (Declaration of Raul Perez ["Perez Decl."] ¶ 4.)

After filing the complaint, Plaintiffs' investigation entailed an exchange of information pursuant to formal and informal discovery methods, including document requests and the deposition of Defendant's corporate representative pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 30(b)(6). Plaintiffs' discovery and investigation focused on identifying the universe of models of the Magellan RoadMate FLM devices and determining

26

27

28

³ In or around August 2018 the FAQ was changed to state that "lifetime refers to the useful lifetime of the device, considered to be three (3) years from the date of first use." (FAC \P 5.)

GPS devices without the "free lifetime map updates" feature. Consumers of such devices would have to pay to update the maps. Such consumers are not putative class members in this action.

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70 Filed 09/30/20 Page 10 of 22

which of those devices were, and are still able, to download and use new map updates. (Perez Decl. § 5.)

Plaintiffs also requested and received evidence concerning the: (1) number of devices sold by Defendant in the United States during the Class Period; (2) the number of devices shipped to third-party distributors during the Class Period; (3) the number of Eligible Devices that were registered to Defendant, and Defendant's ability to identify Class Members through those registration records; and (4) all details and communications to Class Members regarding Defendant's June 2018 FAQ (the "FAQ"), which purported to limit the "useful lifetime" of the devices purchased by lifetime subscribers to 3 years. (Perez Decl. ¶ 6.)

The extensive document and information exchanges allowed Plaintiffs' Counsel to appreciate the strengths and weaknesses of the claims alleged against Defendant and the benefits of the proposed Settlement. (Perez Decl. ¶ 7.)

C.

The Parties Settled at a Mediation Before a Retired Judge

Prior to their mediation, the Parties engaged in several months of preliminary settlement negotiations, during which they discussed the tentative terms and the structure of proposed class action settlement. Then, on May 8, 2019, the Parties attended a day-long mediation before the Honorable Jay C. Gandhi (Ret.) at JAMS. With Judge Gandhi's assistance, the Parties were able to negotiate a complete settlement of all claims at issue. (Perez Decl. ¶ 8.)

Plaintiffs filed a motion for preliminary approval of the settlement on July 12, 2019. (Dkt. 45.) The Court found the matter suitable for disposition without oral argument. (Dkt. 51.) The Court then issued an Order on December 4, 2019, outlining a number of deficiencies in the settlement and the motion for preliminary approval. (Dkt. 55.) In response to the Order, the Parties amended the settlement to address the Court's concerns. The Court preliminarily approved the amended settlement on April 29, 2020.

D.

The Settlement Class and the Principal Terms of the Settlement

1. Composition of the Settlement Class

The Settlement defines the Settlement Class as "all persons who purchased an Eligible Device in the United States of America at any time within the Class Period." (Settlement Agreement ¶ 4.) An "Eligible Device" is defined as "a Magellan RoadMate Navigator device purchased with Free Lifetime Map Updates purchased within the Class Period." (*Id.* ¶ 11.) The Class Period is defined as September 28, 2014 to June 30, 2019. (*Id.* ¶ 6.) The Settlement Class only releases claims accruing through June 30,

2019.⁴ (Settlement Agreement ¶ 19.)

3.

The Settlement Class includes those individuals who purchased a device in the U.S., as opposed to all individuals in the U.S. who purchased a device. The location of the purchase rather than the location of the customer is key in identifying the maximum number of potential class members, i.e. those who purchased a device in the United States and were exposed to the alleged advertising as described in Plaintiffs' operative complaint.

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2. **Settlement Consideration**

Plaintiffs and Defendant have agreed that Class Members will receive three principal kinds of consideration: (1) free map updates; (2) reimbursement for previously purchased Map Updates; and (3) notice of Magellan's terms and conditions (as explained in the FAQ), and that the terms and conditions do not apply to RoadMate Navigators with Free Lifetime Map Updates purchased before June 30, 2019. Class Members who paid out-of-pocket for map updates are also eligible for cash reimbursements. (Settlement Agreement ¶ 29.)

Release by Plaintiffs and the Settlement Class

In exchange for the settlement consideration, Class Members who do not opt out will agree to release all claims arising out of the FAC during the Class Period. The Settlement Agreement defines "Released Claims" as: [Alll claims, rights, demands, liabilities, losses, obligations, damages, penalties, interests, actions, liens, suits, judgments, indebtedness, costs, fees, expenses, restitution, debts, controversies, causes of action and all other legal responsibilities of any form or nature whatsoever which Plaintiffs and Class Members have or may have arising out of or relating to any allegations made in the Action or any legal theories that could have been raised based on the allegations in the Action during the Class Period.

22 ⁴ The significance of June 30, 2019 is as follows: At the beginning of the Class Period, Defendant represented that Eligible Devices would be eligible for "free lifetime map updates." On June 18, 2018, 23 however, Magellan posted an FAQ to its website which narrowly defined "lifetime map subscription" to mean only three years from the date of manufacture. Magellan's plan was to disseminate this narrower 24 definition for "lifetime map subscriptions" to consumers via updates to its website and marketing materials, and packaging, and to instruct third-party resellers and distributors to similarly update their websites, 25 marketing materials, and packaging to notify consumers of how Magellan had defined, or re-defined, the 26 term "lifetime map subscription." Magellan estimated that the process of completely disseminating this new definition to the public via the above changes and updates would be complete as of June 30, 2019. The 27 Parties accordingly agreed that the revised terms and conditions contained in the FAQ-i.e., limiting free map subscriptions to three years from the date of manufacture—would not apply to RoadMate Navigators 28 with "Free Lifetime Map Updates" purchased before June 30, 2019.

> Page 4 MOTION FOR FINAL APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT

(Settlement Agreement ¶ 19.)

E.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

The Notice and Claims Administration Processes Were Completed Pursuant to the Court's Order

Pursuant to the Court's Order preliminarily approving the Settlement Agreement, the Parties engaged CPT Group, Inc. ("CPT") to provide settlement administration services. (Yang Decl. ¶ 2.) CPT's duties have included, *inter alia*: (1) emailing the Notice of Class Action Settlement ("Notice") to all Class Members for whom Defendant had an email address on record; (2) developing the settlement website and administering the online claims submission portal (*see* https://www.magellanroadmatesettlement.com); (3) publishing a summary of the Notice via the PR Newswire; (4) publishing a summary of the Notice via The Mercury News; (4) publishing an audio version of a short form of the Notice via Pandora.com; (5) processing Claim Forms and Requests for Exclusion; and (6) providing weekly reports to counsel for the Parties. (*Id.* at ¶ 3.)

On April 29, 2020, CPT received the Class Notice prepared jointly by Plaintiffs' Counsel and counsel for Defendant and approved by the Court. The Class Notice summarized the Settlement's principal terms, and advised Class Members about how to submit claims, opt out of the Settlement Class, and object to the Settlement, and the applicable deadlines for each option. (*Id.*) Separately, counsel for Defendant provided CPT with the Class List.

On June 19, 2020, CPT commenced the notice plan as outlined in the Settlement and the Court's Order Granting the Motion for Preliminary Approval of the Class Action Settlement. (*Id.* at \P 18.) CPT disseminated long and short-form versions of the Notice by email and publication notice. Class Members were given 60 days to opt out or object to the Settlement. Plaintiffs are pleased to report that only four Class Members opted out of the Settlement Class, and no Class Members have objected to the Settlement. (*Id.* at \P 27.)

With respect to the claims process, and in addition to their having already received the Courtapproved Class Notice, Defendant also directly emailed all individuals who might be Class Members and
who paid for updates during the Class Period ("Reimbursement Class Members") to advise them that they
may be eligible for reimbursement, and to encourage them to submit a claim form to CPT. For context,
Defendant represented to Plaintiffs that while it can identify all individuals who might be Class Members

who paid for updates during the Class Period (approximately 528), it is not able to determine whether the updates were purchased for Eligible Devices (i.e., although the updates were purchased during the Class
Period, it is possible that the updates were for other devices without the "free lifetime map updates" feature, see footnote 2, *supra*), or whether the devices where purchased within the United States during the Class
Period. The Settlement accordingly required Class Members to verify via the claims process that the update was for an Eligible Device purchased in the United States during the Class Period.

To date, a total of approximately 2% of Reimbursement Class Member have submitted valid claims for reimbursement. (Yang Decl. ¶ 32.) MiTAC is in the processing of disseminating a third targeted email to Reimbursement Class Members to remind them that they can still submit claims for reimbursement.

|| Ш.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

ARGUMENT

A.

Class Certification Requirements Are Met

The Court certified the Class for settlement purposes upon Preliminary Approval, finding that requirements under Rule 23(a) and Rule 23(b)(3) are satisfied. (*See* Dkt. No. 65.) Nothing has changed that would affect the Court's ruling on class certification. *See Chambers v. Whirlpool Corp.*, 214 F. Supp. 3d 877 (C.D. Cal. 2016) (reconfirming the certification set forth in the preliminary approval order "[b]ecause the circumstances have not changed" since that order); *In re Hyundai & Kia Fuel Econ. Litig.*, 926 F.3d 539, 556 (9th Cir. 2019) (en banc) (courts must apply the criteria for class certification "differently in litigation classes and settlement classes"). Therefore, the Court should grant final certification of the settlement class.

B.

The Court Should Grant Final Approval of the Class Settlement

Upon final approval, the Court's duty is to determine whether the proposed Settlement is "fundamentally fair, adequate, and reasonable." *Hanlon v. Chrysler Corp.*, 150 F.3d 1011, 1026 (9th Cir. 1998). In evaluating the Settlement, the Court is guided by several important policies. First, federal courts favor settlements, particularly in class actions, where the costs, delays and risks of continued litigation might otherwise overwhelm any potential benefit the class could hope to obtain. *See Class Plaintiffs v. City of Seattle*, 955 F.2d 1268, 1276 (9th Cir. 1992) (noting the "strong policy that favors settlements, particularly where complex class action litigation is concerned"). Second, for settlements reached through

	Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70 Filed 09/30/20 Page 14 of 22
1	arms'-length negotiations, courts are to give:
2	[P]roper deference to the private consensual decision of the parties[T]he
3	court's intrusion upon what is otherwise a private consensual agreement negotiated between the parties to a lawsuit must be limited to the extent
4	necessary to reach a reasoned judgment that the agreement is not the product of fraud or overreaching by, or collusion between, the negotiating parties, and that the settlement, taken as a whole, is fair, reasonable and adequate to
5	all concerned.
6	Hanlon, 150 F.3d at 1027.
7	Guided by these policies, the district court then may consider some or all of the following factors in
8	evaluating the reasonableness of a settlement: (1) the strength of the plaintiff's case and the risk, expense,
9	complexity, and likely duration of further litigation; (2) the risk of maintaining class action status
10	throughout trial; (3) the amount offered in settlement; (4) the extent of discovery completed and the stage
11	of proceedings; (5) the participation of a governmental participant; (6) the experience and views of counsel;
12	and (7) the reaction of class members. See Hanlon, 150 F.3d at 1026 ("Hanlon factors").
13	The recent amendments to Rule 23 direct the Court to consider a similar list of factors, including
14	whether: (A) the class representatives and class counsel have adequately represented the class; (B) the
15	proposal was negotiated at arm's length; (C) the relief provided for the class is adequate, taking into
16	account: (i) the costs, risks, and delay of trial and appeal; (ii) the effectiveness of any proposed method of
17	distributing relief to the class, including the method of processing class-member claims; (iii) the terms of
18	any proposed award of attorney's fees, including timing of payment; and (iv) any agreement required to be
19	identified under Rule 23(e)(3); and (D) the proposal treats class members equitably relative to each other.
20	FED. R. CIV. P. 23(e)(2). The Advisory Committee's notes clarify that this list of factors does not "displace"
21	the Hanlon factors, "but instead aim to focus the court and attorneys on 'the core concerns of procedure
22	and substance that should guide the decision whether to approve the proposal." In re Extreme Networks,
23	Inc. Sec. Litig., No. 15-04883, 2019 WL 3290770, at *6 (N.D. Cal. July 22, 2019) (quoting FED. R. CIV. P.
24	23(e)(2) advisory committee's note to 2018 amendment).
25	Additionally, for class action settlements prior to contested certification, the Ninth Circuit further
26	requires that the Court scrutinize the settlement even more closely, applying the so-called <i>Bluetooth</i> factors.

Circuit further requires that the Court scrutinize the settlement even more closely, applying the so-called Bluetooth factors. See In re Bluetooth Headset Prods. Liab. Litig., 654 F.3d 935, 938 (9th Cir. 2011); Allen v. Bedolla, 787 F.3d 1218, 1224 (9th Cir. 2015). As set forth below, the Settlement satisfies all of these factors, meriting

final approval.

1.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Class Representatives and Plaintiffs' Counsel Have Adequately Represented the Class and the Settlement Was Negotiated at Arms'-Length

Under Rule 23(e)(2)(A)-(B), the Court considers whether Plaintiffs and Plaintiffs' Counsel adequately represented the class and whether the proposed settlement was negotiated at arm's length. Both factors are amply satisfied. There is no suggestion of a conflict between the Class Representatives and Plaintiffs' Counsel on the one hand, and Class Members on the other. *In re Online DVD-Rental Antitrust Litig.*, 779 F.3d 934, 942 (9th Cir. 2015) (conflict cannot be "speculative" or "trivial" but must go to "the heart of the litigation"). Plaintiffs and Plaintiffs' Counsel have vigorously pursued the claims on behalf of the Class, adducing important facts regarding Defendant's at-issue representations concerning "free lifetime updates," litigating the matter and opposing Defendant's motion to dismiss, and negotiating a valuable Settlement to deliver immediate relief to the Class.

Rule 23(e)(2)(B) is also satisfied, as the Settlement is the product of arm's length negotiations after a mediation before a distinguished mediator and jurist, the Hon. Jay C. Gandhi (Ret.) of JAMS.

15

2. The Settlement Provides Valuable Relief to the Class

Under Rule 23(e)(2)(C), the Court is to examine the relief to the Class in light of the costs, risks, and delay of trial and appeal, the effectiveness of any proposed method of distributing relief to the class, including the method of processing class-member claims, the terms of any proposed award of attorney's fees, including timing of payment; and any agreement required to be identified. This overlaps with first three *Hanlon* factors, the strength of the plaintiff's case balanced against the risk, expense, complexity and likely duration of further litigation, the risk of maintaining class certification through trial, and the amount of settlement. In evaluating these considerations, a court assesses "objectively the strengths and weaknesses inherent in the litigation and the impact of those considerations on the parties' decisions to reach [a settlement]." *Adoma v. Univ. of Phoenix, Inc.*, 913 F. Supp. 2d 964, 975 (E.D. Cal. 2012). However, there is "no single formula" to be applied. *Rodriguez v. West Pub. Corp.*, 463 F.3d 948, 965 (9th Cir. 2009).

In assessing the settlement's value, courts are instructed to take into account that "the very essence
of a settlement is compromise, 'a yielding of absolutes and an abandoning of highest hopes." *Officers for Justice v. Civil Service Comm'n*, 688 F.2d 615, 624 (9th Cir. 1982) (citations omitted). But this Court

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70 Filed 09/30/20 Page 16 of 22

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

27

"put[s] a good deal of stock in the product of an arms-length, non-collusive negotiated resolution, and ha[s] never prescribed a particular formula by which that outcome must be tested." Rodriguez, 563 F.3d at 965 (internal citations omitted; emphasis added). The Court "need not include a specific finding of fact as to the potential recovery for each of the plaintiffs' causes of action." Lane v. Facebook, Inc., 696 F.3d 811, 823 (9th Cir. 2012). Indeed, *Lane* expressly rejected any requirement that district courts calculate the value of the claims-explaining that "not only would such a requirement be onerous, it would often be impossible... [since] the amount of damages of a given plaintiff (or class of plaintiffs) has suffered in a question of fact that must be proved at trial." Id. 5

(a) The Relief Provided for the Class Is Fair, Adequate, and Reasonable Considering the Costs, Risks, and Delay of Trial and Appeal

As discussed above, the Settlement is fair and reasonable in light of the risks of continued litigation and the strengths of Defendant's defenses to the merits of the claims. The Court will recall that Defendant moved to dismiss Plaintiffs' claims (as alleged in the First Amended Complaint) on January 7, 2019, and at the April 24, 2019 case management conference, the Court indicated that it was inclined to dismiss Plaintiffs' federal and state warranty claims with prejudice. Defendant further argued that Plaintiffs' CLRA and UCL claims had to be dismissed because Plaintiffs failed to allege with specificity that it made any fraudulent representation or omission at the time of sale.

The CLRA prohibits "unfair methods of competition and unfair or deceptive acts or practices undertaken by any person in a transaction intended to result or that results in the sale or lease of goods or services to any consumer." Cal. Civ. Code § 1770(a). "[U]nder the CLRA, plaintiffs must sufficiently

⁵ Accordingly, courts, in evaluating automotive defect settlements, do not require the plaintiff to present speculative measures of the maximum value of the action upon a successful trial. See, e.g., Warner v. Toyota Motor Sales U.S.A., No. 15-02171-FMO (C.D. Cal. May 21, 2017), Dkt. No. 140, at *13 24 (granting final approval without a maximum valuation, noting that settlements involve "abandoning of highest hopes"); Corson v. Toyota Motor Sales U.S.A., No. 12-8499-JGB, 2016 WL 1375838, *7 (C.D. 25 Cal. Apr. 4, 2016) (granting final approval, based in part, on "substantial recovery" that class members 26 would receive as a result of the settlement); See also Chambers, 214 F. Supp. 3d at 888-89 (no valuation required to approve consumer class action settlement); Zakskorn v. Am. Honda Motor Co., No. 11-02610-KJM, 2015 WL 3622990, at *8 (E.D. Cal. June 9, 2015) (same); (finding that settlement provides adequate compensation without requiring extensive valuation); Sadowska v. Volkswagen Group of 28 America, No. 11-00665-BRO, 2013 WL 9500948, *4 (C.D. Cal. Sep. 25, 2013) (same).

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70 Filed 09/30/20 Page 17 of 22

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

allege that a defendant was aware of a defect at the time of sale to survive a motion to dismiss." *Wilson v. Hewlett-Packard Co.*, 668 F.3d 1136, 1145 (9th Cir. 2012). The UCL prohibits any "unlawful, unfair or fraudulent business act or practice." Cal. Bus. & Prof. Code § 17200. UCL claims deriving from CLRA violations also depend upon the defendant's knowledge at the time of sale. *Wilson*, 668 F.3d at 1145-46 & n.5.

Defendant claimed that Plaintiffs' allegation that it "knew the Magellan RoadMate FLM navigation devices did not possess the characteristics and benefits as represented and were not of the particular standard, quality or grade as represented" was not sufficiently specific to plead Defendant's knowledge at the time Plaintiffs purchased their RoadMate devices. *See Wilson*, 668 F.3d at 1146-47 (finding that plaintiffs' "generalized assertion" of defendant's knowledge of an alleged defect was "merely conclusory"); *Tomek v. Apple Inc.*, 636 F. App'x 712, 713 (9th Cir. 2016) (finding that plaintiff "has not alleged specific facts that 'allow[] the court to draw the reasonable inference' that Apple knew it was issuing misleading advertisements at the time Tomek purchased his laptop"). Defendant also argued that Plaintiffs' allegations of consumer complaints were not sufficient to show its "awareness of its unlawful conduct." Complaint ¶ 35; *see also In re Nexus 6P Prods. Liab. Litig.*, 293 F. Supp. 3d 888, 909 (N.D. Cal. 2018) ("[A] handful of complaints do not, by themselves, plausibly show that Huawei or Google had knowledge of the defects and concealed the defects from customers.").

Defendant further challenged the sufficiency of Plaintiffs' CLRA letter, as it claimed that Plaintiffs had not provided specific notice that the alleged CLRA violations extended to any other particular RoadMate models. Specifically, Defendant claimed that the CLRA notice identified only one RoadMate 5230-LM product, rather than CLRA Notice makes no reference to the twenty other RoadMate products that Plaintiffs purport to include in their class claims. See Complaint ¶ 1, n.1.

Finally, Defendant argued that under Ninth Circuit law, consumer protection claims must be governed by the law of the jurisdiction in which each purchase occurred. On this basis, Defendant argued that Plaintiffs could not assert California claims on behalf of putative class members who purchased RoadMate devices outside California.

In addition to its defenses to the merits of Plaintiffs' claims, Defendant thus also argued that
Plaintiffs' claims were not appropriate for class certification, particularly under *Mazza v. Am. Honda Motor*

Co., 666 F.3d 581, 590 (9th Cir. 2012).⁶ Specifically, for proposed nationwide litigation classes seeking 1 2 certification under Rule 23(b)(3) and alleging state law violations, the district court must consider whether 3 variations in state law swamp any common issues and defeat predominance, which is fatal to class 4 certification. Mazza considered Honda's challenge to a district court's decision to certify a nationwide class 5 of consumers claiming that Honda had misrepresented material information about Acura RLs. Honda 6 contended that the district court erred in certifying the class under Rule 23(b)(3) because California's 7 consumer protection statutes could not be applied to a nationwide class with members in 44 jurisdictions, 8 and therefore plaintiffs had not demonstrated that the questions of law or fact common to class members 9 predominated over any questions affecting only individual members. The Ninth Circuit agreed, holding 10 that under California's governmental interest test, class members' consumer protection claims had to be 11 governed by the laws of the jurisdictions in which the transactions took place. If the Court had applied Mazza to the facts of this case, Plaintiffs would have encountered considerable difficulty certifying their 12 13 claims under the CLRA and UCL.

In light of the above defenses and risks of continued, Plaintiffs determined that the relief provided by the Settlement is fair, adequate, and reasonable.

16 17

18

19

20

21

22

23

14

15

(b) The Method of Distribution, Attorneys' Fees, and Other Agreements

Under Rule 23(e)(2)(C)(ii)-(iv), the Court is to review the method of distribution, attorneys' fees and the existence of other agreements. Here, the Parties negotiated the requested awards of attorneys' fees, litigation costs, and incentive awards after they negotiated the terms of the class relief and remedies. Pursuant to those discussions, and with the assistance and recommendation of Judge Ghandi, it was agreed that Plaintiffs would seek no more than \$320,000 in attorneys' fees and costs, and no more than \$2,500,

⁶ Mazza involved a litigation class, where the application of the laws of dozens of jurisdictions
 presented significant trial manageability issues, militating against a predominance finding. But under
 longstanding authority, *Amchem Prod., Inc. v. Windsor*, 521 U.S. 591 (1997), settlement classes can be
 certified without regard to manageability problems—none exist because the case has settled. And per the
 Ninth Circuit's decision in *In re Hyundai & Kia Fuel Econ. Litig.*, 926 F.3d 539, 556 (9th Cir. 2019) (en
 banc), the onus is on the "foreign law proponent" to show that California law materially differs from, and
 conflicts with, the foreign law, and that the foreign state's interests would be more impaired than
 California's under the governmental interest test. *Id.* at 561. Here, there is no "foreign law proponent."

each, for Plaintiffs' incentive awards. (Settlement Agreement ¶¶ 30, 31.)

No other agreements have been made in connection with this Settlement under Rule 23(e)(3).

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

3. The Settlement Treats Class Members Equitably

The Rule 23(e)(2) factor turns on whether the proposed settlement "treats class members equitably relative to each other." Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(e)(2)(D). "Matters of concern could include whether the apportionment of relief among class members takes appropriate account of differences among their claims, and whether the scope of the release may affect class members in different ways that bear on the apportionment of relief." Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(e)(2)(D), Advisory Committee's Notes.

Here, the Settlement treats all Class Members equally. All Class Members who register are entitled to free map updates and any Class Members who already paid for updates are eligible to request a refund with interest. No segment of the Class is given preferential treatment. Moreover, as discussed below, the incentive awards sought by Plaintiffs are modest and well within the awards presumed reasonable in this district.

4. The Extent of Discovery Completed Supports Final Approval

Courts may also consider the extent of discovery and the current stage of the litigation to evaluate whether parties have sufficient information to make an informed decision to settle the action. *See Linney v. Cellular Alaska Partnership*, 151 F.3d 1234, 1239 (9th Cir. 1998). A settlement negotiated at an earlier stage in the litigation will not be denied so long as sufficient investigation has been conducted. *Eisen v. Porsche Cars N. Am.*, No. 11-09405-CAS, 2014 WL 439006 (C.D. Cal. Jan. 30, 2014) (finding that counsel had "ample information and opportunity to assess the strengths and weaknesses of their claims" despite "discovery [being] limited because the parties decided to pursue settlement discussions early on.").

As set forth in greater detail above, based on their analysis of documents, class data, and testimony from Defendant's corporate witness, Plaintiffs' Counsel were able to realistically assess the value of the Settlement Class' claims and intelligently engage defense counsel in settlement discussions that culminated in the proposed settlement now before the Court. (Perez Decl.¶¶ 4-6.)

By engaging in a thorough investigation and evaluation of the Settlement Class' claims, Plaintiffs'
Counsel can opine that the Settlement, for the consideration and on the terms set forth in the Settlement
Agreement, is fair, reasonable, and adequate, and is in the best interests of Class Members in light of all

known facts and circumstances, including the risk of significant delay and uncertainty associated with litigation, various defenses asserted by Defendant. (Perez Decl. ¶ 7.)

5. The Views of Experienced Counsel Should Be Accorded Substantial Weight The fact that sophisticated parties with experienced counsel have agreed to settle their dispute

should be given considerable weight by courts, since "parties represented by competent counsel are better positioned than courts to produce a settlement that fairly reflects each party's expected outcome in the litigation." *In re Pac. Enters. Sec. Litig.*, 47 F.3d 373, 378 (9th Cir. 1995). Here, the Parties achieved a settlement after a thorough review of relevant documents and testimony, as well as a rigorous analysis of the Parties' claims and defenses. The expectations of all Parties are embodied by the Settlement, which, as set forth above, is non-collusive, being the product of arms'-length negotiations and finalized with the assistance of an experienced mediator. The Parties were also represented by experienced class action counsel throughout the negotiations resulting in this settlement. Plaintiffs' Counsel employ seasoned class action attorneys who regularly litigate wage and hour claims through certification and on the merits, and have considerable experience settling consumer class actions. (*See* Perez Decl. ¶¶ 10-14, Ex. 1.) Defendant has been, and at the mediation was, represented by Orrick, Herrington & Sutcliffe LLP, an international law firm with a robust class action defense practice.⁷

6. The Reaction of Class Members to the Proposed Settlement⁸

As discussed above, only four individuals opted out of the Settlement Class, and not a single Class Member objected to the Settlement. (Yang Decl. ¶ 27.) This small percentage of exclusions and the complete absence of objection demonstrates that Class Members have reacted favorably to the Settlement, supporting final approval. *See, e.g., Eisen,* 2014 WL 439006, at *5 ("Although 235,152 class notices were sent, 243 class members have asked to be excluded …."); *Milligan v. Toyota Motor Sales, U.S.A.*, No. 09-05418-RS, 2012 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 189782, at *25 (N.D. Cal. Jan. 6, 2012) (finding favorable reaction where 364 individuals opted out [0.06%] following a mailing of 613,960 notices).

The reimbursement claims rate of 2.1% is congruent with claims rates observed in consumer class action settlements approved by federal courts. *See Bayat v. Bank of the W.*, No. C-13-2376-EMC, 2015

- ⁷ See https://www.orrick.com/en/Practices/Class-Action-Defense.
- ⁸ There is no governmental participant in this case, and so this factor is neutral.
 - Page 13

1 WL 1744342, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 15, 2015) (approving settlement with a "claims rate for the monetary 2 relief portion of the settlement of roughly 1.9%"); Spillman v. RPM Pizza, LLC, No. CIV-A-10-349-BAJ, 3 2013 WL 2286076, at *2 (M.D. La. May 23, 2013) (noting that "less than one percent of the total class" 4 filed claims); Perez v. Asurion Corp., 501 F. Supp. 2d 1360, 1377–78 (S.D. Fla. 2007) (noting that about 5 1.1%, i.e. 118,663 of about 10.3 million Class Members, filed claims); Rose v. Bank of Am. Corp., No. 6 5:11-CV-02390-EJD, 2014 WL 4273358, at *10 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 29, 2014) (noting that about 3%, i.e. 7 227,701 of about 7 million Class Members, filed claims); Grannan v. Alliant Law Grp., P.C., No. C10-8 02803 HRL, 2012 WL 216522, at *7 (N.D. Cal. Jan. 24, 2012) (noting that about 1.4%, i.e. 1,986 of about 9 137,891 Class Members, filed claims); In re Linkedin User Privacy Litig., 309 F.R.D. 573, 582 (N.D. Cal. 10 2015) (noting that about 5.9%, i.e. 47,336 of about 800,000 Class Members, filed claims); Moore v. 11 Verizon Commc'ns Inc., No. 09-1823, 2013 WL 4610764, at *8 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 28, 2013) (noting that 12 about 3%, i.e. 250,236 of about 8.1 million Class Members, filed claims); Sullivan v. DB Invs., Inc., 667 13 F.3d 273, 329, fn. 60 (3d Cir. 2011) (claims rates in consumer class settlements "rarely" exceed 7 percent). 14 The response is also in line with other consumer settlements that provided for reimbursement. See 15 Zakskorn v. Am. Honda Motor Co., No. 2:11-CV-02610-KJM, 2015 WL 3622990, at *2 (E.D. Cal. June 9, 16 2015) (providing reimbursement for car parts; 14,095 out of 1,688,899 class members submitted claims for 17 reimbursement); Corson v. Toyota Motor Sales U.S.A., Inc., No. CV 12-8499-JGB (VBKx), 2016 WL 18 1375838, at *2 (C.D. Cal. Apr. 4, 2016) (providing reimbursement for out-of-pocket expenses for re-tuned 19 electronic control units; 1,301 out of 1,257,225 class members submitted claims for reimbursement); 20 Simon v. Toshiba Am., No. C 07-06202 MHP, 2010 WL 1757956, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 30, 2010) 21 (reimbursement for costs to upgrade computers; 538 out of 25,350 class members submitted claims). 22 Additionally, as noted above, as a supplement to the class notice plan approved by the Court, 23 Defendant directly emailed all consumers who might be eligible for reimbursement to encourage them to submit claims. 24 C. 25 The Settlement Satisfies the Bluetooth Factors

Finally, pre-certification settlements require further inquiry for "more subtle signs" of potential
collusion between class counsel and defendant. *In re Bluetooth*, 654 F.3d at 946-47. But in applying "all of
these factors, considerations, 'subtle signs,' and red flags, the underlying question remains this: Is the

settlement fair?" *In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Practices, & Prod. Liab. Litig.*, 895 F.3d 597, 611 (9th Cir. 2018). These factors "in the end are just guideposts." *Id.*

None of the *Bluetooth* factors are present with the Parties' Settlement. The Settlement does not include any clear-sailing provision. Plaintiffs' Counsel do not seek a disproportionate share of fees. There is no "reverter" of unclaimed funds to Defendant as the Settlement does not provide for the establishment of a common fund. Further, the settlement was negotiated at arm's-length before a distinguished mediator and former jurist. And by agreeing to resolve attorneys' fees amicably, Defendant's counsel averted the possibility that Plaintiffs' Counsel might apply for, and receive, a much larger award, and thus avoided a "second major litigation" on attorneys' fees. *See Hensley v. Eckerhart*, 461 U.S. 424, 437 (1983) ("A request for attorney's fees should not result in a second major litigation.")

Quite simply, no badges of collusion exist. The Court, after applying the *Bluetooth* factors, should find that the Settlement is not the product of collusion and is fair, reasonable and adequate, meriting final approval.

|| IV.

V. CONCLUSION

Based on the foregoing, the proposed Settlement is fair, adequate, and reasonable, and satisfies the standard for final approval. Accordingly, Plaintiffs move the Court to enter the Final Order and Judgment granting final approval of the Settlement Agreement and grant such other and additional relief as the Court may deem appropriate.

Dated: September 30, 2020

Respectfully submitted,

By: <u>/s/ Trisha K. Monesi</u> Raul Perez Tarek H. Zohdy Cody R. Padgett Trisha K. Monesi **CAPSTONE LAW APC**

Attorney for Plaintiffs Michael Livingston and Sharon McGill

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-1 F	Filed 09/30/20 Page 1 of 97
 Raul Perez (SBN 174687) Raul.Perez@capstonelawyers.com Tarek H. Zohdy (SBN 247775) Tarek.Zohdy@capstonelawyers.com Cody R. Padgett (SBN 275553) Cody.Padgett@capstonelawyers.com Trisha K. Monesi (SBN 303512) Trisha.Monesi@capstonelawyers.com Capstone Law APC 1875 Century Park East, Suite 1000 Los Angeles, California 90067 Telephone: (310) 556-4811 Facsimile: (310) 943-0396 Attorneys for Plaintiffs Michael Livingston and Sharon McGill 	
0 UNITED STATES DIST	TRICT COURT
1 NORTHERN DISTRICT (OF CALIFORNIA
	se No. 18-cv-05993-JST
5	
	ECLARATION OF MELINDA ANG ON BEHALF OF
7 v. SE	TTLEMENT ADMINISTRATOR
	ITH RESPECT TO DTIFICATION OF CLASS
9 Defendant. AC	CTION LAWSUIT
0	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
DECLARATION OF MELINDA VANCION PEUA	
RESPECT TO NOTIFICATION OF C	
22 33 44 55 66 77 88 99 00 11 22 33 44 55 66 77 88 99 00 11 22 33 44 77	Raul Perez (SBN 174687) Raul.Perez @capstonelawyers.com Tarek H. Zohdy (SBN 247775) Tarek Zohdy @capstonelawyers.com Cody R. Padgett (SBN 275553) Cody.Padgett@capstonelawyers.com Capstone Law APC 1875 Century Park East, Suite 1000 Los Angeles, California 90067 Telephone: (310) 556-4811 Facsimile: (310) 943-0396 Attorneys for Plaintiffs Michael Livingston and Sharon McGill UNITED STATES DIS' NORTHERN DISTRICT (MICHAEL LIVINGSTON, et al., Plaintiffs, V. MITAC DIGITAL CORPORATION, Defendant.

DECLARATION OF MELINDA YANG

I, Melinda Yang, declare as follows:

1

2

3

4

5

6

I am a Case Manager for CPT Group, Inc. ("CPT"), the Settlement
 Administrator jointly agreed upon by the Parties in the above-captioned action. I have
 personal knowledge of the facts set forth in this declaration and, if called upon to
 testify, I could and would testify competently to such facts.

7 2. CPT has extensive experience in providing notice of class actions and
8 administering class action settlements. In the past 31 plus years, we have provided
9 notification and/or settlement administration services in thousands of class action
10 cases.

11	3. For the instant settlement, CPT was charged with:
12	a. Preparing and completing the CAFA Notice;
13	b. Implementing the Notice Plan approved by the Court on April 29,
14	2020, by emailing the Summary Class Notice to potential Class
15	Members;
16	c. Mailing the Summary Class Notice to potential Class Members for
17	whom an email was undeliverable and a valid postal address was
18	available;
19	d. Designing and executing an internet advertisement campaign with a
20	leading digital network (Google Display Network);
21	e. Programing banner advertisement buys via paid search
22	(Google/Bing), social media advertisements (Facebook/LinkedIn),
23	and OLR radio advertisement (Pandora);
24	f. Transmitting a nationwide press release over PR Newswire, and
25	four print publications in The Mercury News Newspaper;
26	g. Establishing the Settlement Website. That website includes case
27	documents; information about the case, Settlement and claims
28	process; and allows online submission of claims. CPT also
	2
	DECLARATION OF MELINDA YANG ON BEHALF OF SETTLEMENT ADMINISTRATOR WITH RESPECT TO NOTIFICATION OF CLASS ACTION LAWSUIT

1	established a toll-free telephone number with recorded information
2	about the case and the Settlement, and a dedicated email address for
3	questions from potential Class Members;
4	h. Reviewing and determining the validity of submitted
5	Reimbursement Forms, and requesting additional information from
6	claimants if warranted;
7	i. Following up with claimants who had deficient Reimbursement
8	Forms;
9	j. Receiving/processing other communications about the Settlement
10	such as questions about the claims process and requests for
11	exclusion;
12	k. Preparing reports and summaries regarding the notice and claims
13	process for the Parties and the Court; and
14	1. Performing such other tasks as set forth in the Settlement
15	Agreement, or as the Parties mutually agree to or that the Court
16	orders.
17	CAFA NOTIFICATION
18	4. On March 18, 2020, CPT mailed all required notices under the Class
19	Action Fairness Act ("CAFA"), a total of 52 CAFA notifications (to the Attorney
20	Generals in all 50 states, the District of Columbia Attorney General, and the U.S.
21	Attorney General.
22	DATA ANALYSIS
23	5. Between May 15, 2020 and May 28, 2020, CPT received data files from
24	Defendant's Counsel containing potential Class Member names, mailing addresses,
25	email addresses, and/or available purchase details. Upon receipt, CPT reviewed the
26	data files and removed duplicates based on name and email address. In addition, CPT
27	ran the email addresses through a validation program in an effort to remove invalid
28	email addresses.

6. After completion of the above-mentioned steps, CPT prepared a master list of the identified potential Class Members. In summary, there were 335,820 potential Class Members, where 315,335 had valid email addresses.

7. Separately, Defendant also identified 544 potential Class Members who may be entitled under the settlement to reimbursement for map update purchases. According to Defendant, these records are overinclusive in that the purchases could have been for non-eligible devices.

IMPLEMENTATION OF NOTICE PLAN

8. As directed by the Court, CPT implemented a robust, multi-faceted program to provide notice to the potential Class Members. The program consisted of two parts: (i) a multi-layered media campaign that combines the use of various digital advertisement platforms, a nationwide press release, print publications in *The Mercury News* newspaper, a dedicated settlement website and a toll-free hotline; and (ii) transmission of e-mail and mailed notices to potential Class Members of the settlement. This comprehensive notice program is consistent with other best practicable court-approved notice programs and meets the required Due Process notice.

TOLL-FREE TELEPHONE LINE

9. CPT established and has maintained a case-specific 24-hour, toll free, IVR telephone support line (1-888-416-0917) that went live on June 5, 2020, to coincide with the live date of the Settlement Website. Through this number, callers were provided the FAQs and answers as well as the case-specific email address in the event they had additional questions. As of the date of this declaration, there have been 49 calls to the case telephone support line.

CASE-SPECIFIC EMAIL ADDRESS

10. CPT established and has maintained a dedicated email address(MagellanRoadMateSettlement@cptgroup.com) which potential Class Members can use to communicate with CPT regarding details of the case.

SETTLEMENT WEBSITE

11. On In furtherance of the Notice Plan, CPT designed the Settlement Website (<u>www.MagellanRoadMateSettlement.com</u>) to be informative, easy-tonavigate, ADA-compliant, and mobile-enabled so potential Class Members could get information about the Settlement efficiently. As of the date of this declaration, there have been a total of 53,307 views of the Settlement Website.

12. The Settlement Website prominently displayed copies of Settlement documents (including the Settlement Agreement, Class Notice, Reimbursement Form, and Exclusion Form) and other documents filed in the case (e.g., Plaintiffs' Motions for Preliminary Approval, Order Granting Preliminary Approval, Settlement Agreement, and Plaintiffs' Motion for Attorneys' Fees, Costs, and Class representative Incentive Award). The Settlement Website also contained, among other things, a Frequently Asked Questions page and a case timeline specifying important dates and deadlines for the Settlement, including the deadlines for potential Class Members to submit claims, file objections, request exclusion, and the date, time and location of the Final Approval Hearing.

13. Visitors to the Settlement Website had the opportunity to submit a claim electronically or download and print a physical Reimbursement Form for filing via US Postal Service.

14. True and correct copies of the Class Notice, Reimbursement Form, and Exclusion Form are attached hereto as **Exhibit A**.

PRESS RELEASE

15. To further supplement reach, on June 8, 2020, CPT disseminated a nationwide press release over PR Newswire to the US1 National Newsline and targeted individual journalists specific to General Food and Nutrition industries. Attached hereto as Exhibit B is a true and correct copy of the press release.

16. As of the date of this declaration, the press release was picked up by 122
relevant media outlets including broadcast media (29.5%), newspapers (29.5%),

1

online news sites and other influencers (23.0%), financial news services (6.6%), news and information services (3.3%), and others (8.2%), across the United States. The press release was picked up by industries relating to media and information (71.3%), financial (17.2%), transportation/Logistics (5.7%), business services (1.6%), multicultural and demographic (1.6%), and other (2.5%) with a total potential audience of 101,928,056 visitors. Attached hereto as **Exhibit C** is a true and correct copy of the Visibility Report issued by PR Newswire detailing the results of the distribution.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

THE MERCURY NEWS NEWSPAPERS PUBLICATION

17. To satisfy CLRA requirements, on the following four consecutive
Sundays: June 14, 2020, June 21, 2020, June 28, 2020, and July 5, 2020, CPT caused
the Summary Class Notice to be published in the *The Mercury News* newspaper.
Attached hereto as **Exhibit D** are the tear sheets from the aforementioned
publications.

DIGITIAL BANNER ADVERTISEMENT & PAID SOCIAL ADVERTISEMENT

18. On June 19, 2020, CPT commenced the Notice Plan's digital marketing advertisement campaign that CPT designed as a multi-channel approach to effectively and efficiently reach the target audience (potential Class Members). Over the course of the ensuing 10-week period (through August 28, 2020), CPT conducted the digital marketing outreach through programmatic displays, which are scaled sources of digital inventory, resulting in a wide breadth of banner ads targeting individual consumers. Platforms being used include Google Display Network and DV360. Additionally, a paid keyword/search campaign on Google and Bing with the placement of over 700 keywords and phrases designed to reach the target audience was implemented. Paid social advertisements were delivered to consumers in-feed and on-platform through the following paid social advertising channels: Facebook Ad

Manager Audiences and LinkedIn. Lastly, audio advertisement production through OLR platform, Pandora.

19. CPT initiated the supplemental digital marketing advertisement campaign described in the Notice Plan and served 9,204,981 impressions on mobile and desktop display. The supplemental notice campaign has thus far spurred 6,187 clicks to view the Settlement website. This rate was consistent with and met the expectations for a Settlement of this kind. Facebook and Google Ad placements were the most effective at producing traffic to the Settlement website. Attached hereto as **Exhibits E and F** are true and correct copies of the banner advertisements and current performance reporting, respectively.

EMAIL & MAIL NOTIFICATION

20. Between June 8, 2020 and June 19, 2020, CPT emailed the Summary Class Notice to the last known email address of each potential Class Member, if the email address was determined to be valid, as mentioned in paragraph 6 above. Attached hereto as **Exhibit G** is a true and correct copy of the Summary Class Notice that was emailed.

21. Per best practice and to improve deliverability, CPT resent the Summary Class Notice to email addresses returned as a soft bounce¹ up to a total of two times.

22. As of the date of this declaration, counts of hard and soft bounces from the 315,335 emails are as follows:

- a) Hard Bounce = 2,766 (0.87%)
- b) Soft Bounce = 41,596 (13.19%)

¹ A **soft bounce** is an email that could not be delivered because of temporary reasons. An inbox may be full or the email file might be too large, among other reasons. Most email providers will continue to try to deliver the email over the period of a few days.

23. Pursuant to paragraph 35 of the Settlement Agreement, for potential Class Members to whom an email is undeliverable and a valid postal address can be determined after a reasonable effort, CPT will mail a Summary Class Notice. As of the date of this declaration, a Summary Class Notice was mailed to 25,335 potential Class Members.

24. Attached hereto as Exhibit H is a true and correct copy of the Summary Notice that was mailed. As of the date of this declaration, 400 Summary Notices have been returned as undeliverable. For these returned Notices, CPT attempted to locate a current mailing address using Accurint, one of the one of the most comprehensive address databases available. It utilizes hundreds of different databases supplied by credit reporting agencies, public records and a variety of other national databases.

25. As of the date of this declaration, all 400 Summary Notices remain undeliverable as no better addresses were provided from the Post Office nor obtained through Skip Trace.

1

2

3

4

5

6

CLASS MEMBER REQUESTS FOR EXCLUSION AND CLAIMS

26. Pursuant to the Court's Order preliminarily approving the Settlement, and as stated on the Settlement Website and in the Class Notice, the deadline for potential Class Members to request exclusion from or file and serve objections to the Settlement was August 18, 2020. The deadline to submit a Reimbursement Form was September 17, 2020.

27. As of the date of this declaration, CPT has received 4 Requests for Exclusion.

28. Upon request, anyone who was unable to complete the Reimbursement Form online, or unable to print and mail a form, was mailed a paper Reimbursement Form.

29. As of the date of this declaration, CPT has received a total 950 Reimbursement Forms. Of these, 928 forms were submitted online through the

Settlement Website and 22 were received by CPT through the dedicated email inbox or received in the mail.

30. Upon receipt of each Reimbursement Form, CPT determined whether it was valid or deficient. A valid Reimbursement Form requires the claimant's name, address, signature, purchase date and amount for at least 1 map update purchase during the relevant time period as well as proof of purchase to support their claim for reimbursement if CPT was unable to match at least 1 data point in the Claimant's form to Defendant's records.

31. If CPT deemed a Reimbursement Form deficient, CPT emailed, or mailed, if an email address was not available, a cure letter with instructions regarding how the deficiency could be cured and the deadline by which a response had to be received. Claimants are provided until the later of (i) the response deadline or (ii) fifteen (15) calendar days from the date of the cure letter, to postmark, fax, email, or otherwise deliver a revised Reimbursement Form or Request for Exclusion.

32. As of the date of this declaration, CPT has received 11 valid claims.

33. As of the date of this declaration, there are 337 deficient Reimbursement Forms, of which 13 were untimely submitted. CPT has sent cure letters to the 337 potential Class Members requesting for additional proof of purchase or any other documentation to support their claim for reimbursement. The latest date for a potential Class Member to cure their deficient claim is October 10, 2020.

34. As of date, there are 602 invalid Reimbursement Forms due to a potential Class Member not curing their claim within the specified cure time frame.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States and the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed on this 30th day of September, 2020 at Irvine, California.

Yang Melinda

EXHIBIT A

Michael Livingston v. MiTAC Digital Corporation, No. 4:18-cv-05993-JST UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT, NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA NOTICE OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT

You are not being sued. This notice affects your rights. Please read it carefully

To: All persons who purchased a Magellan RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map updates in the United States of America on or after September 28, 2014 and before June 30, 2019 ("Class Members").

On April 29, 2020, the Honorable Jon S. Tigar of the United States District Court, Northern District of California granted preliminary approval of this class action settlement and ordered the litigants to notify all Class Members of the settlement. You have received this notice because you may be a Class Member, <u>and, if so, are therefore entitled to the remedies provided by the settlement</u>.

The Final Approval Hearing on the adequacy, reasonableness, and fairness of the Settlement will be held at 2:00 p.m. on November 4, 2020 in Courtroom 6, 2nd Floor of the United States District Court, Northern District of California located at 1301 Clay Street, Oakland, California 94612. You are not required to attend the Hearing.

<u>Note:</u> The date for the Final Approval Hearing may change without further notice to Class Members. Please check www.MagellanRoadMateSettlement.com for updates.

Summary of the Litigation

Plaintiffs Michael Livingston and Sharon McGill, on behalf of themselves and on behalf of all Class Members, allege that Defendant MiTAC Digital Corporation ("Defendant" or "Magellan") misled Class Members to believe that their Magellan RoadMate Navigators would receive free lifetime updates, when in fact Defendant allegedly required Class Members to purchase updates. Defendant denies these allegations, and denies that it has acted improperly or wrongfully in any way. Defendant believes that the lawsuit has no merit.

The Court has not decided who is right.

After the exchange of relevant information and evidence, Plaintiffs and Defendant (together, the "Parties") agreed to enter into settlement negotiations in an attempt to resolve the claims in the case. On May 8, 2019, the Parties participated in a mediation with Hon. Jay C. Gandhi (Ret.), a former federal judge who is an experienced and well-respected class action mediator. With Judge Gandhi's guidance, the Parties negotiated a complete settlement of Plaintiffs' claims.

The proposed Settlement does not mean that any law was broken or that Defendant did anything wrong. Defendant denies all legal claims in this case. Plaintiffs think the proposed Settlement is best for everyone affected.

Summary of The Proposed Settlement Terms

<u>Free Registration for Lifetime Map Subscriptions</u>. If you purchased a Magellan RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map Updates on or after September 28, 2014 and before June 30, 2019, and you would like to receive free map data updates, you must register your lifetime map subscription on or before September 17, 2020. Registration is quick and free. You can either register on Magellan's website at <u>https://www.magellangps.com/support/livingston-registration</u> or, at your request, Magellan will mail a registration form to you. Registering your subscription will ensure that you receive free map data updates made available for your particular Navigator device for the next three years. At the end of this three-year period, you can renew your three-year registration at no charge. You can either renew your registration on Magellan's website at <u>https://www.magellangps.com/support/livingston-registration</u> or, at you can continue to renew your three-year registration at no charge for as long as you use your Navigator

Questions? Contact the Settlement Administrator toll free at 1-888-416-0917

device. To have a registration form or a renewal form mailed to you, please contact Magellan's customer support team at https://service.magellangps.com.

Reimbursement for Map Updates. Magellan will reimburse customers with free lifetime map subscriptions for verified purchases of map updates and for other incurred expenses relating to the lifetime map subscription, plus interest. This offer is available to customers who have purchased a Magellan RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map Updates on or after September 28, 2014 and before June 30, 2019. To submit a claim for reimbursement, complete the Reimbursement Form at www.MagellanRoadMateSettlement.com.

New Terms and Conditions for Lifetime Map Subscriptions. On June 18, 2018, Magellan posted a FAQ on its website describing the terms and conditions of lifetime map subscriptions (the "FAQ"). Magellan has since learned that some of its customers are not sure whether the terms and conditions in this FAQ apply to the Navigator devices that they purchased. Magellan regrets any confusion that this FAQ may have caused to its customers. Magellan will clarify to its customers that the terms and conditions in this FAQ apply only to RoadMate Navigators with Free Lifetime Map Updates purchased on or after June 30, 2019. The terms and conditions in this FAQ do not apply to RoadMate Navigators with Free Lifetime Map Updates purchased before June 30, 2019. Magellan will update its website, marketing, and packaging of RoadMate Navigators with Free Lifetime Map Updates to state clearly the terms and conditions as provided in the FAQ or advise potential purchasers where they can read the terms and conditions. Magellan will also instruct its third-party resellers and distributors to update their websites and any marketing material and packaging in their possession accordingly. Magellan has already begun implementing these changes and expects to complete these changes by June 30, 2020.

<u>Customer Support for Free Map Updates</u>. Magellan is devoted to ensuring that its customers who purchased Navigator devices with free lifetime map subscriptions are able to receive free map data updates. If you are experiencing any difficulties in obtaining a free map update for your RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map Updates, please contact Magellan's customer support team for assistance. Customer support is available through Magellan's website at https://service.magellangps.com.

Your Options Under the Settlement

Do Nothing And Remain a Member of the Class. If you do not exclude yourself from the Class, you will remain a member of the Class, you will be eligible for the benefits provided by the settlement, you will be bound by the settlement, and you will give up the claims that are released by the settlement.

Exclude Yourself From the Class. You may exclude yourself from the Class by completing the Exclusion Form online at www.MagellanRoadMateSettlement.com. All Exclusion Forms must be submitted on or before August 18, 2020.

Object to the Settlement. You can ask the Court to deny approval by filing an objection. You can't ask the Court to order a different settlement; the Court can only approve or reject the settlement. If the Court denies approval, no settlement payments will be sent out and the lawsuit will continue. If that is what you want to happen, you must object.

Any objection to the proposed settlement must be in writing. If you file a timely written objection, you may, but are not required to, appear at the Final Approval Hearing, either in person or through your own attorney. If you appear through your own attorney, you are responsible for hiring and paying that attorney. All written objections and supporting papers must (a) clearly identify the case name and number (*Michael Livingston v. MiTAC Digital Corporation*, Case No. 4:18-cv-05993-JST), (b) be submitted to the Court either by mailing them to the Class Action Clerk, United States District Court for the Northern District of California, 1301 Clay Street, Oakland, CA 94612, or by filing them in person at any location of the United States District Court for the Northern District of California, 1301 Clay Street, Oakland, CA 94612, or by filing them in person at any location of the United States District Court for the Northern District of California, and (c) be filed or postmarked on or before August 18, 2020.

Questions? Contact the Settlement Administrator toll free at 1-888-416-0917

Attorneys' Fees And Costs

The attorneys representing the Class will ask the Court to award attorneys' fees and litigation costs up to \$320,000. This amount is subject to Court approval. All attorneys' fees and costs awarded by the Court will be paid by Defendant and do not come out of the recovery for the Class.

Incentive Awards

Plaintiffs will request the Court to approve incentive awards payable to Plaintiffs in amounts not to exceed \$2,500, each. The incentive awards are in consideration for Plaintiffs' assistance with the prosecution of the Action. All incentive awards awarded by the Court will be paid by Defendant and do not come out of the recovery for the Class.

Additional Information

This notice summarizes the proposed settlement. For the precise terms and conditions of the settlement, please see the settlement agreement available at www.MagellanRoadMateSettlement.com, by contacting Class Counsel at info@MiTacLawsuit.com, by accessing the Court docket in this case, for a fee, through the Court's Public Access to Court Electronic Records (PACER) system at https://ecf.cand.uscourts.gov, or by visiting the office of the Clerk of the Court for the United States District Court for the Northern District of California, 1301 Clay Street, Oakland, CA 94612, between 9:00 a.m. and 4:00 p.m., Monday through Friday, excluding Court holidays.

PLEASE DO NOT TELEPHONE THE COURT OR THE COURT CLERK'S OFFICE TO INQUIRE ABOUT THIS SETTLEMENT OR THE CLAIM PROCESS.
REIMBURSEMENT FORM

COMPLETE THIS FORM ONLY IF YOU PAID OUT-OF-POCKET TO UPDATE YOUR MAGELLAN ROADMATE NAVIGATOR WITH FREE LIFETIME MAP UPDATES

Name	Model of your RoadMate LM Navigator (If unknown, write "I don't know")
Current Street Address	Serial number of your RoadMate LM Navigator (If unknown, write "I don't know")
City, State, Zip Code	Date you purchased your RoadMate LM Navigator (If unknown, write "I don't know")
Telephone Number	Email Address used for RoadMate LM Navigator Registration (If unknown, write "I don't know")
Email Address	

Date of Map Update Purchase	Amount Paid for Map Update Purchase

(Continue on a separate sheet if necessary)

TOTAL AMOUNT OF OUT-OF-POCKET COSTS FOR MAP UPDATE

PURCHASE(S): \$_____

To the extent you have records, please attach or enclose proof of purchase of your RoadMate LM Navigator and Map Updates and any other documentation to support your claim for reimbursement.

I understand that I must provide all of the above information before my claim for reimbursement can be processed.

I certify that the above information is true, that I purchased my Magellan RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map Updates between September 28, 2014, and June 30, 2019, and that I incurred the above out-of-pocket costs to update my Magellan RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map Updates.

Sign your name here

EXCLUSION FORM

COMPLETE THIS FORM <u>ONLY IF</u> YOU WISH TO EXCLUDE YOURSELF FROM THE SETTLEMENT CLASS. IF YOU EXCLUDE YOURSELF FROM THE SETTLEMENT CLASS, YOU <u>WILL NOT BE ENTITLED TO THE BENEFITS</u> <u>PROVIDED BY THE SETTLEMENT</u>.

I ______ request to be excluded from the Settlement in the matter of *Michael Livingston v. MiTAC Digital Corporation*, No. 4:18-cv-05993-JST (United States District Court, Northern District of California). I understand that by submitting this Exclusion Form, I will no longer be eligible for the benefits provided by the settlement.

Sign your name here

Print your full name here

EXHIBIT B

This preview will expire 2020-07-06 15:15:41 ET

Proposed Settlement of Class Action Lawsuit: Livingston v. MiTAC Digital Corporation Announced by CPT Group, Inc.



IRVINE, Calif., June 8, 2020 /PRNewswire/ -- CPT Group, Inc. announced today that the United States District Court for the Northern District of California preliminarily approved a proposed settlement in *Livingston v. MiTAC Digital Corporation*, No. 4:18-cv-05993-JST, a class action alleging that Defendant MiTAC Digital Corporation ("Defendant" or "Magellan") misled Class Members to believe that their Magellan RoadMate Navigators would receive free lifetime updates, when in fact Defendant allegedly required Class Members to purchase updates. Defendant denies these allegations, denies that it has acted improperly or wrongfully in any way, and believes that the lawsuit has no merit. The Court has not decided who is right.

If you purchased a Magellan RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map Updates on or after September 28, 2014 and before June 30, 2019, and you would like to receive free map data updates, you must register your lifetime map subscription by September 17, 2020. You can register and renew on Magellan's website at <u>https://www.magellangps.com/support/livingston-</u> <u>registration</u> or have a registration or a renewal form mailed to you by contacting Magellan's customer support team at https://service.magellangps.com. Magellan will reimburse customers with free filetime map subscriptions for verified purchases of map updates and for other incurred expenses relating to the lifetime map subscription, plus interest. This offer is available to customers who have purchased a Magellan RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map Updates on or after September 28, 2014 and before June 30, 2019. To submit a claim for reimbursement, complete the Reimbursement Form at www.MagellanRoadMateSettlement.com.

Magellan will update its website, marketing, and packaging of RoadMate Navigators with Free Lifetime Map Updates to state clearly the terms and conditions as provided in the FAQ, posted to Magellan's website on June 18, 2018, or advise potential purchasers where they can read the terms and conditions.

If you are experiencing any difficulties in obtaining a free map update for your RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map Updates, please contact Magellan's customer support team at https://service.magellangps.com.

If you do not exclude yourself from the Class, you will remain a member of the Class, you will be eligible for the benefits provided by the settlement, you will be bound by the settlement, and you will give up the claims that are released by the settlement.

You may exclude yourself from the Class by completing the Exclusion Form online at www.MagellanRoadMateSettlement.com on or before August 18, 2020.

You can ask the Court to deny approval by filing an objection by August 18, 2020. If the Court denies approval, no settlement payments will be sent out and the lawsuit will continue.

This is only a summary. For the precise terms and conditions of the settlement, please see the settlement agreement available at www.MagellanRoadMateSettlement.com.

Contact:

CPT Group, Inc. Livingston v. MiTAC Digital Corporation Settlement Administrator 50 Corporate Park 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-1 Filed 09/30/20 Page 20 of 97 Irvine, Calif. 92606 1-888-416-0917

SOURCE CPT Group, Inc.

Related Links

• http://www.cptgroup.com

Close Window

Print

EXHIBIT C

Proposed Settlement of Class Action Lawsuit: Livingston v. MiTAC Digital Corporation Announced by CPT Group, Inc.

PR Newswire ID: 2819834-1 Clear Time Jun 08, 2020 9:08 AM ET

Assets What did I send with my releases?



English

Pickup Where did my release get picked up?

122 101,928,056 total pickup total potential audience

	Т	raffic	
	What traffic did m	ny release generate?)
69	842	1 4 2 1	830

3,669 842 1,421 830 release views release web crawler hits image views image web crawler hits

Audience Who are the audiences viewing my release?

111461711,071media viewsorganization viewstargeted influencersAssociated Press outlets

Engagement How are people engaging with my release?

284

total engagement actions

284 click-throughs

Industry Benchmarks

On a scale of 1 - 100, how this release performed compared to other similar releases.

59

total visibility

59 66 52 pickup traffic audience

> 96 engagement

Pickup



Total Pickup Over Time

Total pickup since your content was distributed





Exact Match Pickup

Exact matches are full text postings of your content which we have found in the online and social media that we monitor. Understand how it is calculated.

Total Exact Matches: **122**

Total Potential Audience: 101,928,056.

Logo	Outlet Name	Location	Source Type	Industry	Potential Audience
YAHOO! Finance	Yahoo! Finance Online 🖵 View Release	Global	Online News Sites & Other Influencers	Media & Information	41,088,892 ^[1] visitors/month
MarketWatch	MarketWatch Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Financial News Service	Financial	33,910,226 ^[1] visitors/month
Seeking Alpha ⁽⁾	Seeking Alpha Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Financial News Service	Financial	7,288,866 ^[1] visitors/month
CISION PR Nemesuire	PR Newswire Online 🖵 View Release	Global	PR Newswire	Media & Information	5,968,835 ^[1] visitors/month

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-1 Filed 09/30/20 Page 26 of 97

BENZINGA	Benzinga Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Online News Sites & Other Influencers	Financial	3,441,304 ^[1] visitors/month
I ANNESTAR	Morningstar Online 🖵 View Release	Global	Financial Data, Research & Analytics	Financial	2,643,852 ^[1] visitors/month
StreetInsider.com Lynne net inside synche ontick	StreetInsider Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Online News Sites & Other Influencers	Financial	787,198 ^[1] visitors/month
	KITV-TV ABC [Honolulu, HI] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Broadcast Media	Media & Information	758,340 ^[1] visitors/month
Kake com	KAKE-TV ABC [Wichita, KS] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Broadcast Media	Media & Information	657,060 ^[1] visitors/month
Contraction of the second seco	WRCB-TV NBC-3 [Chattanooga, TN] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Broadcast Media	Media & Information	621,393 ^[1] visitors/month
wfmj ⁴ /2com	WFMJ-TV NBC-21 [Youngstown, OH] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Broadcast Media	Media & Information	494,054 ^[1] visitors/month
WBOC 16	WBOC-TV CBS-16 [Salisbury, MD] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Broadcast Media	Media & Information	401,946 ^[1] visitors/month
erie News NOW	WICU-TV NBC-12 / WSEE-TV CBS-35 [Erie, PA] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Broadcast Media	Media & Information	339,495 ^[1] visitors/month
2 NEWS	KTVN-TV CBS-2 [Reno, NV] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Broadcast Media	Media & Information	308,738 ^[1] visitors/month
Stockhouse.	StockHouse.com Online 🖵 View Release	Canada	Trade Publications	Financial	281,697 ^[1] visitors/month
WENY News	WENY-TV [Horseheads, NY] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Broadcast Media	Media & Information	172,906 ^[1] visitors/month
<u>RFD</u> TTV	RFD-TV [Nashville, TN] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Broadcast Media	Media & Information	131,759 ^[1] visitors/month
WRAL COM MALENA - DURMAN - AMETTYNILE	WRAL-TV CBS-5 [Raleigh, NC] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Broadcast Media	Media & Information	128,972 ^[1] visitors/month
Townhall Finance	Townhall Finance Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Financial News Service	Media & Information	128,972 ^[1] visitors/month

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-1 Filed 09/30/20 Page 27 of 97

	Case 4.10-CV-05995-551			••••=••••	•
	Tamar Securities Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Online News Sites & Other Influencers	Financial	128,972 ^[1] visitors/month
Financial	FinancialContent - PR Newswire Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Financial News Service	Media & Information	128,972 ^[1] visitors/month
International Business Times	IBTimes Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Newspaper	Media & Information	128,972 ^[1] visitors/month
rstar.com	Rockford Register Star [Rockford, IL] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Newspaper	Media & Information	128,972 ^[1] visitors/month
GREATAMERICAN PAREN HUMON	Great American Financial Resources Online 🖵 View Release	United States	News & Information Service	Financial	128,972 ^[1] visitors/month
FRANKLINCREDIT Nacional Stationer	Franklin Credit Management Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Online News Sites & Other Influencers	Financial	128,972 ^[1] visitors/month
falue Investing News notin prevent dock restrict new	Value Investing News Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Financial News Service	Financial	128,972 ^[1] visitors/month
Dow Theory Letters @DowTheoryLatters	Dow Theory Letters Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Banking & Financial Institutions	Financial	128,972 ^[1] visitors/month
Daily <mark>Penny</mark> Alerts	Daily Penny Alerts Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Online News Sites & Other Influencers	Financial	128,972 ^[1] visitors/month
Participant Education Center	Benefit Plans Administrative Services Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Online News Sites & Other Influencers	Financial	128,972 ^[1] visitors/month
ascensus'	Ascensus Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Online News Sites & Other Influencers	Financial	128,972 ^[1] visitors/month
1st Discount Brokerage	1st Discount Brokerage Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Financial News Service	Financial	128,972 ^[1] visitors/month
)ne News Page 🜖	One News Page Global Edition Online 🖵 View Release	Global	Online News Sites & Other Influencers	Media & Information	109,187 ^[1] visitors/month
ICZ-IVEINGHAMION	WICZ-TV FOX-40 [Binghamton, NY] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Broadcast Media	Media & Information	99,563 ^[1] visitors/month
6 KPVI	KPVI-TV NBC-6 Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Broadcast Media	Media & Information	65,715 ^[1] visitors/month

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-1 Filed 09/30/20 Page 28 of 97

automoblog.net	Automoblog.net Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Online News Sites & Other Influencers	Transportation/Logistics	59,655 ^{[1} visitors/month
:0X/34 .com	KJTV-TV FOX-34 [Lubbock, TX] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Broadcast Media	Media & Information	58,789 ^{[1} visitors/month
NEWS CHANNEL NEBRASKA Katyalast koracija	NCN: Northeast - News Channel Nebraska [Norfolk, NE] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Broadcast Media	Media & Information	54,707 ^{[1} visitors/month
sp⊚ke	Spoke Online 🖵 View Release	United States	News & Information Service	Business Services	49,412 ^{[1} visitors/month
NEWS CHANNEL NEBRASKA	NCN: River Country - NewsChannelNebraska [Nebraska City, NE] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Broadcast Media	Media & Information	47,074 ^{[1} visitors/month
NEWS LICUS MILLION	Suncoast News Network [Sarasota, FL] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Broadcast Media	Media & Information	39,843 ^{[1} visitors/month
WRDE COAST TV	WRDE-TV CBS [Milton, DE] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Broadcast Media	Media & Information	39,213 ^{[1} visitors/month
NEWS CHANNEL NEBRASKA Patri ard 1	NCN: Panhandle - News Channel Nebraska [Grand Island, NE] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Broadcast Media	Media & Information	19,417 ^{[1} visitors/month
Big Picture : Local Focus	Daily Herald [Chicago, IL] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Newspaper	Media & Information	18,199 ^{[1} visitors/month
NEWS CHANNEL NEBRASKA	NCN: Southeast - News Channel Nebraska [Beatrice, NE] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Broadcast Media	Media & Information	18,168 ^{[1} visitors/month
NEWS CHANNEL NEWS CHANNEL TEXTER YALLAS	NCN: Platte Valley - News Channel Nebraska [Columbus, NE] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Broadcast Media	Media & Information	16,801 ^{[1} visitors/month
MARKETPLACE	Marketplace Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Broadcast Media	Media & Information	11,999 ^{[1} visitors/month
NEWSCHANNEL CREASE & LINE OLS	NCN: Metro - News Channel Nebraska [Omaha, NE] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Broadcast Media	Media & Information	11,934 ^{[1} visitors/month
NewsBlaze	NewsBlaze US Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Online News Sites & Other Influencers	Media & Information	8,219 ^{[1} visitors/month

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-1 Filed 09/30/20 Page 29 of 97

	Case 4.10-CV-05995-551	Docume	TIC 70-1 Flied 03/	30/20 Faye 29 01	91
KEWS CHANNEL NEBRASKA CENTRAL	NCN: Central - News Channel Nebraska [Grand Island, NE] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Broadcast Media	Media & Information	5,838 ^[1] visitors/month
One News Page 🚺	One News Page Unites States Edition Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Online News Sites & Other Influencers	Media & Information	4,126 ^[1] visitors/month
Diny RESS.COM	The Daily Press [St. Marys, PA] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Newspaper	Media & Information	4,002 ^[1] visitors/month
W	Ask.com Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Online News Sites & Other Influencers	Media & Information	3,650 ^[1] visitors/month
Dada UK 5 Derste her ihler	KXTQ-FM 106.5 Magic [Lubbock, TX] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Broadcast Media	Media & Information	3,615 ^[1] visitors/month
	KLZK-FM 107.7 YES FM [Lubbock, TX] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Broadcast Media	Media & Information	3,301 ^[1] visitors/month
Astrona la concert	Automotive Service Association Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Industry Association Sites	Transportation/Logistics	3,070 ^[1] visitors/month
TELENINGO	Telemundo Lubbock [Lubbock, TX] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Broadcast Media	Media & Information	2,912 ^[1] visitors/month
PROFIT QUOTES	ProfitQuotes Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Financial News Service	Financial	2,757 ^[1] visitors/month
lickertech.am	Ticker Technologies Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Financial News Service	Financial	2,665 ^[1] visitors/month
THE BUFFALO NEWS	Buffalo News [Buffalo, NY] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Newspaper	Media & Information	2,624 ^[1] visitors/month
FOX 2 Delmarva	WBOC-TV FOX-21 [Salisbury, MD] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Broadcast Media	Media & Information	2,424 ^[1] visitors/month
NEWSOK Received and the second second	Oklahoman [Oklahoma City, OK] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Newspaper	Media & Information	2,343 ^[1] visitors/month
Dittsburgh Post-Gazette post-gazetie com	Pittsburgh Post-Gazette [Pittsburgh, PA] Online ⋤ View Release	United States	Newspaper	Media & Information	2,326 ^[1] visitors/month
MINYANVILLE	Minyanville Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Online News Sites & Other Influencers	Financial	2,161 ^[1] visitors/month

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-1 Filed 09/30/20 Page 30 of 97

	Case 4.18-CV-05993-JS1	Docume		00/20 1 uge 00 01	51
NEWS CHANNEL IN TEALS	NCN: Mid-Plains - News Channel Nebraska [Grand Island, NE] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Broadcast Media	Media & Information	2,040 ^[1] visitors/month
Ehe Chronicle Journal	The Chronicle Journal [Thunder Bay, ON] Online 🖵 View Release	Canada	Newspaper	Media & Information	1,992 ^[1] visitors/month
1007 SCORE	100.7-FM The Score [Lubbock, TX] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Broadcast Media	Media & Information	1,930 ^[1] visitors/month
California Business Journal	Caifornia Business Journal Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Magazine	Media & Information	1,778 ^[1] visitors/month
LATIN BUSINESS TODAY	Latin Business Today Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Online News Sites & Other Influencers	Multicultural & Demographic	1,698 ^{[1} visitors/month
(973)	KTTU-FM 97.3 Double T [Lubbock, TX] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Broadcast Media	Media & Information	1,590 ^{[1} , visitors/month
Norming <mark>News</mark>	The Morning News [Blackfoot, ID] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Newspaper	Media & Information	1,564 ^{[1} visitors/month
NYMOTHERLODE.com	myMotherLode.com [Sonora, CA] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Newspaper	Media & Information	1,556 ^{[1} visitors/month
JOT/UP	Jotup Online 🖵 View Release	Global	Online News Sites & Other Influencers	Business Services	1,450 ^{[1} visitors/month
	Eastern Progress (Eastern Kentucky University) Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Newspaper	Media & Information	1,401 ^{[1} visitors/month
ARLINGTON	ArlingtonWatches Online 🖵 View Release	Global	Online News Sites & Other Influencers	Retail & Consumer	1,384 ^{[1} visitors/month
	KLBB-FM 93.7 The Eagle [Lubbock, TX] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Broadcast Media	Media & Information	1,379 ^[1] visitors/month
BORGER NEWS-HERALD The Ideal Historical Lewis Sci 172	Borger News Herald [Borger, TX] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Newspaper	Media & Information	1,288 ^[1] visitors/month
LUBBOCK	KLCW-TV Lubbock CW [Lubbock, TX] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Broadcast Media	Media & Information	1,234 ^[1] visitors/month
Aammoth Times	Mammoth Times [Mammoth Lakes, CA] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Newspaper	Media & Information	1,113 ^[1] visitors/month

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-1 Filed 09/30/20 Page 31 of 97

	Case 4.10-00-03993-031				• •
MALVERN DAILY RECORD	Malvern Daily Record [Malvern, AR] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Newspaper	Media & Information	1,073 ^{[1} visitors/month
The Saline Courier	The Saline Courier [Benton, AR] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Newspaper	Media & Information	1,073 ^{[1} visitors/month
W	Oldies 97.7 FM [Lubbock, TX] Online 모 View Release	United States	Broadcast Media	Media & Information	1,052 ^{[1} visitors/month
Pully <u>Cines</u> Teuder	Daily Times Leader [West Point, MS] Online View Release	United States	Newspaper	Media & Information	1,045 [[] visitors/montl
FAT PITCH FINANCIALS	Fat Pitch Financials Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Online News Sites & Other Influencers	Financial	1,029 ^{[7} visitors/montl
hepilotnews.com	The Pilot News [Plymouth, IN] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Newspaper	Media & Information	1,010 ^{[7} visitors/montl
ny lubbockty	KMYL-TV MyLubbock-TV [Lubbock, TX] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Broadcast Media	Media & Information	1,003 [[] visitors/montl
NAL TOTAL DESCRIPTION OF A DESCRIPTION O	KJUN-TV / KFOL-TV HTV10 [Houma, LA] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Broadcast Media	Media & Information	982 [visitors/montl
weelwater-Reporter	Sweetwater Reporter [Sweetwater, TX] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Newspaper	Media & Information	936 [visitors/mont
IMER RECORD	Valley City Times-Record [Valley City, ND] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Newspaper	Media & Information] 881 visitors/mont
🛪 Automotive Rhythms	Automotive Rhythms Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Online News Sites & Other Influencers	Transportation/Logistics	877 [[] visitors/montl
NA PARONETA DAILY NEWS	Wapakoneta Daily News [Wapakoneta, OH] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Newspaper	Media & Information	847 [[] visitors/montl
Decatur Daily De nockaty	Decatur Daily Democrat [Decatur, IN] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Newspaper	Media & Information	843 [visitors/montl
(95.9) LUBBOCK'S 905 BUL COUNTRY & MORE	96.9-FM The Bull [Lubbock, TX] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Broadcast Media	Media & Information	820 [visitors/mont
AMERICAN	The Antlers American [Antlers, OK] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Newspaper	Media & Information	806 [[] visitors/mont

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-1 Filed 09/30/20 Page 32 of 97

Window, Isan): Condex Inc.	Winslow, Evans & Crocker Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Online News Sites & Other Influencers	Financial	803 ^[1] visitors/month
Up Aniped Hall Repres	The Newport Daily Express [Newport, VT] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Newspaper	Media & Information	756 ^[1] visitors/month
Starkville Daily News	Starkville Daily News [Starkville, MS] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Newspaper	Media & Information	700 ^[1] visitors/month
THERAND	Big Spring Herald [Big Spring, TX] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Newspaper	Media & Information	695 ^[1] visitors/month
REPUNNSUTAWNBYSPIRIT	The Punxsutawney Spirit [Punxsutawney, PA] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Newspaper	Media & Information	690 ^[1] visitors/month
The Community Post Serving our communities since 1885	Minster Community Post [Minster, OH] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Newspaper	Media & Information	671 ^[1] visitors/month
Kille Republicen	The Kane Republican [Kane, PA] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Newspaper	Media & Information	665 ^[1] visitors/month
Obserner Neus Enterprise www.observernewscnline.com	The Observer News Enterprise [Newton, NC] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Newspaper	Media & Information	656 ^[1] visitors/month
Evening ELEADER Inconsideration	The Evening Leader [St. Marys, OH] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Newspaper	Media & Information	622 ^[1] visitors/month
The Post & Mail	The Post and Mail [Columbia City, IN] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Newspaper	Media & Information	612 ^[1] visitors/month
RUXEWAYRECOLD	Ridgway Record [Ridgway, PA] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Newspaper	Media & Information	584 ^[1] visitors/month
Axcess News	Axcess News Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Online News Sites & Other Influencers	Media & Information	580 ^[1] visitors/month
The Inyo Register	Inyo Register [Bishop, CA] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Newspaper	Media & Information	554 ^[1] visitors/month
Deer Park Tribune 🕱	The Deer Park Tribune [Deer Park, WA] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Newspaper	Media & Information	523 ^[1] visitors/month
onuo un trans	Poteau Daily News [Poteau, OK] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Newspaper	Media & Information	522 ^[1] visitors/month

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-1 Filed 09/30/20 Page 33 of 97

	Case 4.10-07-05995-351				
Reporter & News	DatelineCarolina Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Online News Sites & Other Influencers	Media & Information	506 ^[1] visitors/month
ling during (Lang1234.com Online 🖵 View Release	Global	Online News Sites & Other Influencers	Media & Information	402 ^[1] visitors/month
SOGOTRADE	SOGOTRADE Online 🖵 View Release	United States	News & Information Service	Financial	394 ^[1] visitors/month
MY STLLY LITTLE CANC Dr. Bren Theor Cosange of ver	My Silly Little Gang Online ⋤ View Release	United States	Blog-Parental Influencers	Retail & Consumer	394 ^[1] visitors/month
AutoInformed	AutoInformed Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Blog	Transportation/Logistics	304 [1] visitors/month
CALIFORNIA LATINO 7600	California Latino News Online 🖵 View Release	United States	News & Information Service	Multicultural & Demographic	282 [1] visitors/month
Greater Cleveland Associations for another	Greater Cleveland Automobile Dealers' Association [GCADA] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Industry Association Sites	Transportation/Logistics	275 [1] visitors/month
U	Invertir USA Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Online News Sites & Other Influencers	Media & Information	115 ^[1] visitors/month
nanhattanweek.com	Manhattanweek Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Online News Sites & Other Influencers	Media & Information	64 ^[1] visitors/month
Folsom Local News	Folsom Local News [Folsom, CA] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Online News Sites & Other Influencers	Media & Information	55 ^[1] visitors/month
Weekend Drive.	The Weekend Drive Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Trade Publications	Transportation/Logistics	52 ^[1] visitors/month
milpitasinfo.com	Milpitas Info [Milpitas, CA] Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Newspaper	Media & Information	28 ^[1] visitors/month
1stCounsel	1stCounsel Online ⋤ View Release	United States	Online News Sites & Other Influencers	Policy & Public Interest	Not Available
AutoNews-Wire.com	AutoNews-Wire.com Online 🖵 View Release	United States	Online News Sites & Other Influencers	Transportation/Logistics	Not Available

*Data sources: [1] SimilarWeb [2] Alexa, [3] siteworthtraffic.com [4] Cision Digital Reach

*The data cited here by SimilarWeb represents site traffic data of worldwide unique visitors on desktop and mobile devices. Data is updated monthly.

MULTIMEDIA

Traffic

Overview

RELEASE VIEWS & HITS	4.5K
Release Views	3.7K
Media Views	111
Public Views	3.6K
Partner Sites	158
PR Newswire Channels	3.4K
Release Web Crawler Hits	842

Image Views	1.4K
Image Web Crawlers	830

2.3K

Release Views Release Views Over Time

10000

2 058





Media Views on PR Newswire for Journalists



Top 10 Outlets

Views on Partner Sites

2

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-1 Filed 09/30/20 Page 37 of 97

Top 10 Sites



Traffic to PR Newswire Properties



Vi	ews
----	-----

Туре	Views
Desktop Views	3,122
Mobile/Tablet Views	278
Total Views on PR Newswire Properties	3,400

External Traffic Sources

Understand how viewers found your release.

Source Type	Source	Instances
Direct		3,072
Direct	Direct	3,072
~ Search Engine (4)		228
Total		3,400

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-1 Filed 09/30/20 Page 38 of 97

Source Type	Source	Instances
Search Engine	Google	213
Search Engine	Bing	10
Search Engine	DuckDuckGo	4
Search Engine	Yahoo!	1
 Social Media (1) 		4
Social Media	Twitter	4
✓ PR Newswire Properties (1)		94
PR Newswire Properties	prnewswire.com	94
∽ Other Sites (1)		2
Other Sites	mma.prnewswire.com	2
Total		3,400



Multimedia Views

Image Views & Hits

Image	Image Archive	Views	Web Crawler Hits	Total
Class Action Administrators	View Image	1,421	830	2,251
	Total	1,421	830	2,251

* Image views are the total number of human views of the image as it appeared on this release. Web Crawler Hits are the number of spider and bot hits to the image and are cumulative from the original date of distribution.

Audience

Overview			
VIEWS FROM IDENTIFIED	AUDIENCES 157	AP & INFLUENCER LIST RECIP	PIENTS 1.2K
Media Views	111	Wire Distribution / AP Outlets	1.1K
Organization Views	46	Targeted Influencers	171

Audience Summary

Media Demographics

A break down of the industries covered, the media types and the locations of the journalists & bloggers accessing your release on PR Newswire for Journalists.



Geo-segmentation

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-1 Filed 09/30/20 Page 40 of 97

See where views of your release originated. Hover over map to see totals by location.

Select a region:

World View





-

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-1 Filed 09/30/20 Page 41 of 97



>0 1 - 10 1 0 - 300 300 - 1 000 > 1 000



Audience Details

Media Views

See the details of each media outlet from PR Newswire for Journalists that viewed your release.

Outlet	Industry	Source Type	Location	Views 🗸
BBG	Auto	Wire Service	United States UNITED STATES	1
Total				111

My Adventure Bucket	Travel	Blogger, Freelance/Writer	United States UNITED STATES	1
Delion	Environment, Financial Services, General Business, Other, Technology	Blogger, Newspaper	Canada CANADA	1
Owlmedia	Environment, Healthcare, Heavy Industry, Technology	Freelance/Writer, Trade Periodicals	United Kingdom UNITED KINGDOM	1
TWK trucking with kingfish	Public Issues, Transportation, Travel	Other	United States UNITED STATES	1
N/A	Auto, Broadcast, Consumer Products, Energy, Entertainment, Environment, Features, Financial Services, General Business, Healthcare, Heavy Industry, Media, Other, Public Issues, Sports, Technology, Transportation, Travel	Newspaper, Web/On-Line Service	Israel ISRAEL	1
Cision (PR Newswire)	Auto, Broadcast, Consumer Products, Energy, Entertainment, Environment, Features, Financial Services, General Business, Healthcare, Heavy Industry, Media, Other, Public Issues, Sports, Technology, Transportation, Travel	Blogger, Consumer Periodicals, Freelance/Writer, Newspaper, Other, Radio, Television, Trade Periodicals, Web/On-Line Service, Wire Service	United States UNITED STATES	1
Sipa USA	Auto, Broadcast, Consumer Products, Energy, Entertainment, Environment, Features, Financial Services, General Business, Healthcare, Heavy Industry, Media, Other, Public Issues, Sports, Technology, Transportation, Travel	Wire Service	United States UNITED STATES	1
Law360 (Portfolio Media)	Energy	Web/On-Line Service	United States UNITED STATES	1
the geospatial	Media, Other, Technology	Web/On-Line Service	India INDIA	1
Mole News	Entertainment, Financial Services, General Business, Heavy Industry, Media, Technology	Freelance/Writer	United States UNITED STATES	1
Piper Group	Auto	Blogger	United States UNITED STATES	1
Observer	Financial Services, General Business	Freelance/Writer, Newspaper, Other	United States UNITED STATES	1
FreightWaves	Auto, Broadcast, Consumer Products, Energy, Entertainment, Environment, Features, Financial Services, General Business, Healthcare, Heavy Industry, Media, Other, Public Issues, Sports, Technology, Transportation, Travel	Trade Periodicals	United States UNITED STATES	1
Total				111

She Prevailed Media	Auto, Broadcast, Consumer Products, Energy, Entertainment, Environment, Features, Financial Services, General Business, Healthcare, Heavy Industry, Media, Other, Public Issues, Sports, Technology, Transportation, Travel	Blogger	United States UNITED STATES	
D Magazine Partners	General Business	Consumer Periodicals	United States UNITED STATES	
TrueCar	Auto	Web/On-Line Service	United States UNITED STATES	
Argus Media Group	Auto, Broadcast, Consumer Products, Energy, Entertainment, Environment, Features, Financial Services, General Business, Healthcare, Heavy Industry, Media, Other, Public Issues, Sports, Technology, Transportation, Travel	Web/On-Line Service	United States UNITED STATES	
Word Geek Media	Auto, Broadcast, Consumer Products, Energy, Entertainment, Environment, Features, Financial Services, General Business, Healthcare, Heavy Industry, Media, Other, Public Issues, Sports, Technology, Transportation, Travel	Freelance/Writer	United States UNITED STATES	
Golden West Radio - Saskatchewan	Media	Radio	Canada CANADA	
Wines & Travel	Transportation, Travel	Trade Periodicals	United States UNITED STATES	
Endeavor Business Media	Auto, Energy, Heavy Industry, Transportation	Blogger, Freelance/Writer, Trade Periodicals, Web/On- Line Service	United States UNITED STATES	
SpeedShooters	Auto, Sports, Transportation	Blogger, Freelance/Writer, Other	United States UNITED STATES	
PR Newswire	Sports	Web/On-Line Service, Wire Service	United States UNITED STATES	
Wright Media Corp.	Transportation	Web/On-Line Service	United States UNITED STATES	
Community News Publishing	Auto, Transportation	Freelance/Writer, Newspaper, Web/On-Line Service	United States UNITED STATES	
The Hip Hop Geek	Entertainment, Media, Travel	Blogger	United States UNITED STATES	
Fortunly	Financial Services, General Business, Technology	Web/On-Line Service	Serbia SERBIA	
			1	

Blogger, Freelance/Writer, Newspaper, Web/On-Line ServiceTelevisionTelevision, Web/On-Line ServiceNewspaperNewspaperFreelance/Writer	Sierra Leone SIERRA LEONE United States UNITED STATES United States UNITED STATES United States UNITED STATES	1
Television, Web/On-Line Service Newspaper	UNITED STATES United States UNITED STATES United States UNITED	
Service Newspaper	UNITED STATES United States UNITED	
	UNITED	1
Freelance/Writer	1	
	United States UNITED STATES	-
Blogger, Freelance/Writer, Web/On-Line Service	United States UNITED STATES	
Freelance/Writer	India INDIA	
Newspaper	United States UNITED STATES	1
Blogger	India INDIA	-
Blogger	United Kingdom UNITED KINGDOM	1
Blogger, Consumer Periodicals, Freelance/Writer, Newspaper, Radio, Television, Trade Periodicals, Web/On-Line Service, Wire Service	United States UNITED STATES	-
Web/On-Line Service	India INDIA	1
Web/On-Line Service, Wire Service	United Kingdom UNITED KINGDOM	-
Blogger	Turkey TURKEY	
	Web/On-Line Service	STATESBlogger, Freelance/Writer, Web/On-Line ServiceUnited States UNITED STATESFreelance/WriterIndia INDIANewspaperUnited States UNITED STATESBloggerIndia INDIABlogger, Consumer Periodicals, Freelance/Writer, Newspaper, Radio, Television, Trade Periodicals, Web/On-Line Service, Wire ServiceUnited States UNITED STATESBlogger, Consumer Periodicals, Freelance/Writer, Newspaper, Radio, Television, Trade Periodicals, Web/On-Line Service, Wire ServiceUnited States UNITED STATESWeb/On-Line Service, Wire ServiceIndia INDIAWeb/On-Line Service, Wire ServiceUnited Kingdom UNITED STATES

National News Syndicate	Technology	Freelance/Writer, Trade Periodicals	United States UNITED STATES	1
Institut Européen de journalisme	Entertainment, Environment, Other, Public Issues	Freelance/Writer, Newspaper France FRANCE		1
Freelance: FE News, The Orchard at Tesco	Auto, Broadcast, Consumer Products, Energy, Entertainment, Environment, Features, Financial Services, General Business, Healthcare, Heavy Industry, Media, Public Issues, Sports, Technology, Transportation, Travel	Consumer Periodicals, Freelance/Writer, Newspaper, Radio, Television, Trade Periodicals, Web/On-Line Service, Wire Service	United Kingdom UNITED KINGDOM	1
NBC News	Auto, Consumer Products, Financial Services, General Business, Media, Other, Public Issues, Technology	Television, Web/On-Line Service	United States UNITED STATES	1
Grupo Reforma	Auto	Newspaper	Mexico MEXICO	1
KrazzyMag	Auto, Entertainment, Environment, Financial Services, General Business, Healthcare, Media, Public Issues, Sports, Technology, Travel	Blogger, Other, Web/On-Line Service	India INDIA	1
BlissFireMedia	Consumer Products, Entertainment, Environment, Features, Healthcare, Media, Other, Public Issues, Technology	Blogger, Consumer Periodicals, Freelance/Writer, Other, Web/On-Line Service	United States UNITED STATES	1
The Epoch Times	Auto, Broadcast, Consumer Products, Energy, Entertainment, Environment, Features, Financial Services, General Business, Healthcare, Heavy Industry, Media, Other, Public Issues, Sports, Technology, Transportation, Travel	Newspaper	United States UNITED STATES	1
Auto Report	Auto	Freelance/Writer	South Africa SOUTH AFRICA	1
Auburn Wire	Sports	Freelance/Writer, Web/On- Line Service	United States UNITED STATES	-
KHON2	Auto, Broadcast, Consumer Products, Energy, Entertainment, Environment, Features, Financial Services, General Business, Healthcare, Heavy Industry, Media, Other, Public Issues, Technology, Transportation, Travel	Television, Web/On-Line Service	United States UNITED STATES	1
Content Canada	Other	Freelance/Writer	Canada CANADA	1
Hawthorne News	Auto, Consumer Products, Energy, Environment, Financial Services, General Business, Healthcare, Heavy Industry, Other	Freelance/Writer	United States UNITED STATES	1
BNP Media	Auto, Energy, Environment, Technology, Transportation	Trade Periodicals, Web/On- Line Service UNITED STATES		
SNL Energy	Energy	Trade Periodicals United States UNITED STATES		
Total				11

Economic Review	Auto, Energy, Features, Financial Services, Media, Public Issues, Sports	Freelance/Writer, Newspaper, Trade Periodicals	Pakistan PAKISTAN	
heart & soul	Entertainment, Healthcare, Travel	Consumer Periodicals, Radio, Web/On-Line Service	United States UNITED STATES	
PR	Technology	Other	Malaysia MALAYSIA	
Freelancer	Other	Trade Periodicals	United States UNITED STATES	
KLMPerformance.com	Auto	Web/On-Line Service	United States UNITED STATES	
LotPro.com	Auto	Blogger	United States UNITED STATES	
Freelancer	Entertainment, Features, Healthcare	Freelance/Writer, Newspaper	United States UNITED STATES	
Houston Chronicle	Features	Newspaper	United States UNITED STATES	
Record Gazette	Entertainment, General Business, Media, Public Issues	Newspaper	United States UNITED STATES	
Randall-Reilly Publishing Co.	Transportation	Trade Periodicals	United States UNITED STATES	
Kingsport Times-New	Other	Newspaper	United States UNITED STATES	
nttp://gay_blog.blogspot.com/	Other, Travel	Web/On-Line Service	United States UNITED STATES	
Dow Jones Newswires	Auto	Wire Service	United States UNITED STATES	
AUTOLEHT	Auto	Newspaper	Estonia ESTONIA	
NSAZ	Financial Services	Television	United States UNITED STATES	
The Washington Bureau	Other	Other United States UNITED STATES		
Popular Science	Other	Consumer Periodicals, Trade United States Periodicals UNITED STATES		
Total				11

Wheels Magazine	Other	Other	Canada CANADA	1
InvestmentWires	Financial Services	Consumer Periodicals	United States UNITED STATES	1
IN*TEAM Redaktionsbuero	Auto, Technology	Freelance/Writer	Germany GERMANY	1
Feather River Bulletin	Other	Newspaper	United States UNITED STATES	1
World of Wheels	Auto	Freelance/Writer	Canada CANADA	1
Walla Walla Union Bulletin	Features, Healthcare, Technology	Newspaper	United States UNITED STATES	1
New York 1 News	Other	Television	United States UNITED STATES	1
Woman's Day	Features, Healthcare, Other	Consumer Periodicals, Freelance/Writer, Newspaper, Trade Periodicals, Web/On- Line Service	United States UNITED STATES	1
News Aktuell	Other	Wire Service	Switzerland SWITZERLAND	-
Coelum	Other	Consumer Periodicals, Web/On-Line Service	Italy ITALY	
Repairer Driven News	Auto, Other, Public Issues, Technology, Transportation	Trade Periodicals, Web/On- Line Service	United States UNITED STATES	1
Lesnumeriques.com	Auto, Technology	Consumer Periodicals, Web/On-Line Service	France FRANCE	
ISoVegas	Auto, Broadcast, Consumer Products, Energy, Entertainment, Environment, Features, Financial Services, General Business, Healthcare, Heavy Industry, Media, Other, Public Issues, Sports, Technology, Transportation, Travel	Blogger United Sta UNITED STATES		1
Fleet world	Transportation	Trade Periodicals	United Kingdom UNITED KINGDOM	1
Recombu	Auto, Broadcast, Consumer Products, Entertainment, Features, Media, Technology, Transportation	Freelance/Writer, Radio, Television, Web/On-Line Service		1
Daily News	Other	Other	South Africa SOUTH AFRICA	1
Total				111

Automotive India News	Auto, Environment, Features, Financial Services, General Business, Healthcare, Heavy Industry, Media, Other, Public Issues, Sports, Technology, Transportation, Travel	Newspaper	India INDIA	
NewsRx	Auto, Broadcast, Consumer Products, Energy, Entertainment, Environment, Features, Financial Services, General Business, Healthcare, Heavy Industry, Media, Other, Public Issues, Sports, Technology, Transportation, Travel	Web/On-Line Service	United States UNITED STATES	-
Cognizant	Auto, General Business	Blogger, Freelance/Writer	India INDIA	
Handy Shipping Guide	Auto, Heavy Industry, Other, Transportation	Web/On-Line Service	United Kingdom UNITED KINGDOM	
Linkator Ltd	Auto, Broadcast, Consumer Products, Energy, Entertainment, Environment, Features, Financial Services, General Business, Healthcare, Heavy Industry, Media, Other, Public Issues, Sports, Technology, Transportation, Travel	Web/On-Line Service	United Kingdom UNITED KINGDOM	-
luxuryvolt	Auto	Blogger	India INDIA	
Basex, Accura Media Group, Frequent Business Traveler	Auto, Technology, Travel	Trade Periodicals	United States UNITED STATES	-
Tekniikan Maailma	Auto, Consumer Products, Energy, Technology, Transportation	Consumer Periodicals, Web/On-Line Service	Finland FINLAND	
Fitness And The Foodie	Consumer Products, Entertainment, Other, Travel	Blogger	United States UNITED STATES	
Gaceta UNAM	Environment, Features, Healthcare, Media, Public Issues, Sports, Travel	Newspaper, Web/On-Line Service	Mexico MEXICO	-
Motoring & Beyond	Auto, Transportation	Blogger, Freelance/Writer, Web/On-Line Service	India INDIA	
Aftersales Magazine	Auto	Trade Periodicals	Netherlands NETHERLANDS	
Okinawa Marine	Broadcast, Environment, Features, Financial Services, Media, Public Issues, Technology, Transportation, Travel	Freelance/Writer, Newspaper, Web/On-Line Service, Wire Service	Japan JAPAN	
The Kyle & Jackie O Show	Broadcast, Consumer Products, Entertainment, Features, Media, Other, Public Issues, Technology	Radio	Australia AUSTRALIA	
Summit Media	Environment, General Business, Healthcare, Technology	Trade Periodicals	United States UNITED STATES	
VC-List	Auto, Broadcast, Consumer Products, Energy, Entertainment, Environment, Features, Financial Services, General Business, Healthcare, Heavy Industry, Media, Other, Public Issues, Sports, Technology, Transportation, Travel	Blogger, Consumer Periodicals, Freelance/Writer, Newspaper, Other, Trade Periodicals, Web/On-Line Service	United States UNITED STATES	
Total				11

www.motouutiset.fi	Auto, Other, Technology	Web/On-Line Service	Finland FINLAND	1
Sing Tao Daily Toronto Edition	Other	Newspaper	Canada CANADA	1
Scoop to Go	Auto	Web/On-Line Service	United States UNITED STATES	1
http://venicedispatch.info	Auto, Broadcast, Consumer Products, Energy, Entertainment, Environment, Features, Financial Services, General Business, Healthcare, Heavy Industry, Media, Other, Public Issues, Sports, Technology, Transportation, Travel	Web/On-Line Service	United States UNITED STATES	1
just-auto.com	Auto, Transportation	Other	United Kingdom UNITED KINGDOM	1
Total				111

Organization Views

See which organizations have viewed your release

Organization	Headquarters	Visitor Location	Parent Organization	Industry	Views
IVYTech Community College of Indiana	9301 East 59th Street , United States	UNITED STATES	Ivy Tech Community College	Education	3
RightClick	1221 E. Dyer Road, Suite 225 , United States	UNITED STATES	Right Click Inc	Business Services	2
Financial Recovery Technologies LLC	1 Summer St , United States	UNITED STATES	Financial Recovery Technologies LLC	Financial Services	2
Blazing SEO, LLC	1316 N St Suite 100 , United States	UNITED STATES			2
Quad/Graphics Inc.	N61 W23044 Harry's Way , United States	UNITED STATES	Quad/Graphics Inc.	Business Services	2
UAB	23 Al Azbakeyah , Egypt	UNITED STATES			1
Opoint AS	Akersgata 28 A Sentrum , Norway	SWEDEN	Opoint AS	Software & Internet	1
Korbank S. A.	Nabycinska 19 53-677 , Polish	POLAND			1
Vilite Multimedia Private Limited	India	INDIA			1
VOLOCOM SRL	Via Luigi Rizzo, 8/1 , Italy	ITALY			1
OU - ISS Inc.	655 Research Parkway , United States	UNITED STATES			1
Total				46	
Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-1 Filed 09/30/20 Page 51 of 97

			-		
Robbins Geller Rudman & Dowd LLP	655 West Broadway ,	UNITED STATES			1
TransCanada Pipelines Limited	700 Louisiana Street , United States	CANADA			1
Scancom Limited	Scancom Ltd. Plot OER 6 , Ghana	GHANA			1
Information Handling Services	15 Inverness Way East. , United States	UNITED STATES	IHS Inc	Software & Internet	1
ACT Hyderabad	India	INDIA			1
STATE OF DELAWARE	Department of Technology and Information , United States	UNITED STATES	DNREC	Government	1
BRAD HENDRICKS LAW FIRM	500 PLEASANT VALLEY DR , United States	UNITED STATES	The Brad Hendricks Law Firm	Law Firms & Legal Services	1
ADT LLC	1501 Yamato Road , United States	UNITED STATES	ADT	Business Services	1
WHITE & CASE PTE LTD	Singapore	SINGAPORE			1
ChicagoVPS	Suite 302, 325 Delaware Ave , United States	UNITED STATES	ChicagoVPS	Software & Internet	1
Computer Data Products	80 Richmond St. , Canada	CANADA	Computer Data Products	Retail	1
Gardner-Webb University	110 South Main Street , United States	UNITED STATES	Gardner-Webb University	Education	1
Gateway Motors (Edmonton) Ltd	3777 Kingsway , Canada	CANADA			1
MERIT MILE	131 NE 1ST AVE , United States	UNITED STATES	Merit Mile LLC	Business Services	1
Chubb & Son	I/T Governance , United States	UNITED STATES	chubb Itd	Insurance	1
FRIEND TIRE COMPANY	3535 W DIRECTORS ROW , United States	UNITED STATES	Friend Tire Company	Transportation & Storage	1
Department of Customer Service	attn: Colin Leslie Service Management Office , Australia	AUSTRALIA			1
Cancon Logistics Inc.	6071 Burnside Court Unit # 2 , Canada	CANADA	Cancon Logistics Inc.	Transportation & Storage	1
Pickering College-TOROONNL	16945 Bayview Ave , Canada	CANADA	Pickering College	Education	1
Emeigh Investments LLC	440 N 8th St Suite 110, United States	UNITED STATES			1
Stetson University	Campus Box 8347 , United States	UNITED STATES	Stetson University	Education	1
Halliburton Company	3000 N Sam Houston Pkwy E , United States	UNITED STATES	Halliburton Company	Energy & Utilities	1
Huron County Board of Education	Huron County Board of Education 103 Albert Street , Canada	CANADA			1
Government of Newfoundland and Labrador, Office of the Chief Information Officer	40 Higgins Line PO Box 8700 , Canada	CANADA	Information		1
Cooke AQUACULTURE INC CHAMCOOK	1 FUNDY BAY , Canada	CANADA			1
Symantec Corporation	350 Ellis Street , United States	UNITED STATES	Symantec Corporation	Software & Internet	1
Southern Company Services, Inc.	64 Perimeter Center East , United States	UNITED STATES	Southern Company	Energy & Utilities	1
Total			1	1	

Black Creek TV	PO Box 215 , Canada	CANADA			1
Federal Express Corp.	Federal Express Corp. Integrated Network Planning and Engineering P.O. Box 727, United States	UNITED STATES	FedEx Corporation	Transportation & Storage	1
Total			^		46

Targeted Audience

The lists below represent categories of targeted audiences you selected for your release.

Cision Influencer Lists

Car & Motorcycle Accessories (139 organizations, 171 recipients)

Organization	Number of recipients
Hemmings Classic Car Magazine	5
American Car Collector Magazine	4
cars.com Internet Magazine - Online Only	3
Digital Trends Espa�ol Internet Magazine - Online Only	3
IHS Automotive Consulting Industry Research Firm	3
Mopar Connection Internet Magazine - Online Only	3
MotorWeek - Maryland Public Television Regional Television Network Show	3
Strategy Analytics Industry Research Firm	3
Automotive Engineering Magazine	2
Automotive News Magazine	2

Associated Press Outlets

Every PR Newswire U.S. wire newsline includes targeted distribution to the Associated Press, an essential global news network that delivers content to an extensive set of media platforms and formats. The list below represents the outlets you reach via this partnership.

Outlet Name	City	State	Newsline	Туре	Audience
C-SPAN	Washington	DC	US1	Television	86,200,000 Subscribers
Scribd, Inc.	San Francisco	CA	US1	Aggregator	43,531,670 Visitors per Month
FoxNews.com	New York	NY	US1	Online	32,516,438 Visitors per Month
CBS News Radio	New York	NY	US1	Radio	30,000,000 Broadcast Audience
New York Times Digital	New York	NY	US1	Newspaper	29,886,442 Visitors per Month
Apple Inc.	Cupertino	CA	US1	Organization/Company	29,709,459 Visitors per month
CNBC.com	Englewood Cliffs	NJ	US1	Online	26,089,260 Visitors per Month
CBSnews.com	New York	NY	US1	Online	26,080,671 Visitors per Month

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-1 Filed 09/30/20 Page 53 of 97

Outlet Name	City	State	Newsline	Туре	Audience
abcnews.com	New York	NY	US1	Online	24,167,779 Visitors per Month
U.S. News & World Report	Washington	DC	US1	Magazine	23,945,529 Visitors per Month

Engagement

Overview

Click-throughs

284

Engagement Timeline

See when your audience engaged with your release.



Engagement Details

A break down of click-throughs, shares and other engagement actions.

Click-throughs

The number of times your release sent visitors to the pages you linked to

URL	Click-throughs
https://www.magellangps.com/support/livingston-registration	129
http://www.magellanroadmatesettlement.com/	96
Total	284

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-1 Filed 09/30/20 Page 55 of 97

URL	Click-throughs
https://service.magellangps.com/	56
http://www.cptgroup.com	2
https://www.cision.com/careers/	1
Total	284

About Cision PR Newswire Contact Terms of Use Privacy Blog

Copyright © 2020 Cision US Inc., 130 E Randolph St., 7th Floor, Chicago, IL 60601. View our Privacy Policy.

EXHIBIT D

AT HOME Couple finds joy in their tiny 'skoolie' home on the road

Shortly after Hannah and Ian Hernandez began dating five years ago, they took their



Together, they drove from Florida to California and back. "Mv friends said, 'Two weeks

relationship

on the road.

Jameson At home

Marni

in a car with a girl? Good luck with that,'" Ian recalled. "If that doesn't kill the relationship, nothing

will," Hannah added. The couple, now married with a 20-monthold daughter and a baby boy due in two weeks, not only passed the road test, they doubled down on their love of travel by buying a school bus and converting it into a tiny house. Creating what is known as a "skoolie," the Hernandezes have joined a growing trend of bus converters, who can take their homes on the road.

But the desire to travel wasn't their only motivator.

"We wanted to own something," said Hannah, a professional seamstress. "We were both working so hard to pay rent for a place that wasn't ours."

As the lease on their townhouse was ending in 2016, Hannah, 25, and Ian, 27, looked for options. They attended a few tiny house shows, where they discovered skoolies.

They found a 1990 school bus on Craigslist with 250,000 miles on it and bought it for \$2,000.

"Then we looked at each other and said, 'I guess we'll do this thing," Hannah said.

They moved in with Hannah's parents so they could put the money they'd been spending on rent into their skoolie.

"We didn't want to go into debt doing this,"



This school bus-turned-tiny house has all the comforts of home in 187 square feet.

Hannah said. "The whole point was to own something debt free."

To make the bus a home, they gutted the inside, removing all the seats and flooring. They insulated the walls with spray foam, paneled the ceiling with white wainscot, installed two sinks, a shower, a composting toilet, a stove and a refrigerator. They tiled the bathroom and built cabinets. They ran electrical wiring and added solar panels, so they can be off the grid when they travel. They also invested in a few items most homes don't need — like new tires.

Two years later, they moved into their trickedout bus home, which is 35 feet long and 8 feet

wide, with 6-foot-2-inch ceilings and a whopping 187 square feet of living space.

And it's as cute as a ladybug, thanks to Hannah's knack for decorating and Ian's knack for building.

Just behind the driver's seat is a kitchen with a stove, sink and cabinets, and a dining area across the aisle. The adjacent sitting area has a sofa that pulls out into a bed. Farther down the center aisle are a crib area for 20-month-old Nora, a hanging bassinet for the baby on the way, a bathroom with shower, and the main sleeping area.

All in, they spent \$14,000, including the cost of the bus.

ready grateful to own a home free and clear, when the coronavirus hit they felt doubly blessed. Ian. who had been working for a company that installed solar panels, got laid off.

"We didn't have to stress about a rent payment," Hannah said. "It's very liberating to know everything is paid for, and nobody can take it from us."

They also are free to move about the country. In the past 18 months, they have logged 10,000 miles on the skoolie, traveling all over the East Coast. They tow their car along, so they have another set of wheels.

Next they plan to save up to buy some land and COURTESY OF HANNAH HERNANDEZ

build a house out of shipping containers, Hannah said. "We're a little different. We like a project."

As for their bus, "we'll hang onto it," Ian said. "It will always be nice to be able to hit the road."

Meanwhile, for those interested in seriously downsizing, the Hernandezes shared these tips for tiny living:

THE DIY FACTOR » "The hardest part of the process was figuring out how to do everything ourselves," Ian said. "Because we had a big learning curve, what should have taken a year, took twice that."

DOUBLE-DUTY EVERYTHING » "Anything that goes in

has to have more than one purpose," Ian said.

"For instance, we have an Instant Pot because it does a lot, but no toaster, which does one thing. We can toast bread in the oven."

SMALL OVER LARGE » The couple let go of their bulky Vitamix and use a Baby Bullet blender instead, which takes up less space.

BUILT-IN STORAGE » "More storage means less clutter," Hannah said. "When you don't have a lot of space, it's easy to look cluttered." Their skoolie has drawers under beds, for example, and under the kitchen table.

MINIMALISM » "Don't hold on to things you haven't touched in 10 years. Make sure every item you have adds value to your life now," she said.

That said, Hannah still likes to change up her home's décor and brakes for thrift stores. But if she brings something home, something has to go. 'That's the rule.'

PEANUT GALLERY » "Skoolie life isn't for everyone," Hannah said. "Some people look at us like we've lost our minds. They say they could never live in a space that small. Others associate our way of life with homelessness or hippie-ish living. We've heard it all. We're used to filtering out the comments. We just think about how much we've traveled, and how much we've saved."

Syndicated columnist Marni Jameson is the author of three home and lifestyle books, including "Downsizing the Family Home What to Save, What to Let Go" (Sterling Publishing). You may reach her at marnijameson.com.

Michael Livingston v. MiTAC Digital Corporation, No. 4:18-cv-05993-JST UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT, NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

All persons who purchased a Magellan RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map updates in the United States of America on or after September 28, 2014 and before June 30, 2019 ("Class Members")

On April 29, 2020, the Honorable Jon S. Tigar of the United States District Court, Northern District of California granted preliminary approval of this class action settlement and ordered the litigants to notify all Class Members of the settlement.

Plaintiffs Michael Livingston and Sharon McGill, on behalf of themselves and on behalf

Though they were al-

of all Class Members, allege that Defendant MiTAC Digital Corporation ("Defendant" or "Magellan") misled Class Members to believe that their Magellan RoadMate Navigators would receive free lifetime updates, when in fact Defendant allegedly required Class Members to purchase updates. Defendant denies these allegations, and denies that it has acted improperly or wrongfully in any way. Defendant believes that the lawsuit has no merit. The Court has not decided who is right.

The Final Approval Hearing on the adequacy, reasonableness, and fairness of the Settlement will be held at 2:00 p.m. on November 4, 2020 in Courtroom 6, 2nd Floor of the United States District Court, Northern District of California located at 1301 Clay Street, Oakland, California 94612. You are not required to attend the Hearing. Note: The date for the Final Approval Hearing may change without further notice to Class Members.

Summary of The Proposed Settlement Terms

Free Registration for Lifetime Map Subscriptions. If you purchased a Magellan RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map Updates on or after September 28, 2014 and before June 30, 2019, and you would like to receive free map data updates, you must register your lifetime map subscription on or before September 17, 2020. Registration is quick and free. You can either register on Magellan's website at https://www.magellangps.com/ support/livingston-registration or, have a registration form or a renewal form mailed to you by contacting Magellan's customer support team at https://service.magellangps.com.

Reimbursement for Map Updates. Magellan will reimburse customers with free lifetime map subscriptions for verified purchases of map updates and for other incurred expenses relating to the lifetime map subscription, plus interest. This offer is available to customers who have purchased a Magellan RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map Updates on or after September 28, 2014 and before June 30, 2019. To submit a claim for reimbursement, complete the Reimbursement Form at www.MagellanRoadMateSettlement.com.

New Terms and Conditions for Lifetime Map Subscriptions. On June 18, 2018, Magellan posted a FAQ on its website describing the terms and conditions of lifetime map subscriptions. Magellan regrets any confusion that this FAQ may have caused to its customers and will clarify to its customers that the terms and conditions in this FAQ apply only to RoadMate Navigators with Free Lifetime Map Updates purchased on or after June 30, 2019.

Customer Support for Free Map Updates. Magellan is devoted to ensuring that its customers who purchased Navigator devices with free lifetime map subscriptions are able to receive free map data updates. If you are experiencing any difficulties in obtaining a free map update for your RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map Updates, please contact Magellan's customer support team for assistance at https://service.magellangps.com.

Your Options Under the Settlement

Do Nothing And Remain a Member of the Class. If you do not exclude yourself from the Class, you will remain a member of the Class, you will be eligible for the benefits provided by the settlement, you will be bound by the settlement, and you will give up the claims that are released by the settlement.

Exclude Yourself From the Class. You may exclude yourself from the Class by completing the Exclusion Form online at www.MagellanRoadMateSettlement.com. All Exclusion Forms must be submitted on or before August 18, 2020.

Object to the Settlement. You can ask the Court to deny approval by filing an objection on or before August 18, 2020. You can't ask the Court to order a different settlement; the Court can only approve or reject the settlement. If the Court denies approval, no settlement payments will be sent out and the lawsuit will continue.

This is only a summary. For the precise terms and conditions of the settlement, please see the settlement agreement available at www.MagellanRoadMateSettlement.com.



Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-1 Filed 09/30/20 Page 58 of 97

Around the remote

Harry Connick Jr. hosts United We Sing'

Also, a new 'Perry Mason' is on the case, and 'Yellowstone' returns

DON'T MISS » "United We Sing: A Grammy Salute to the Unsung Heroes" -Harry Connick Jr. hosts and performs in this two-

hour special

dedicated to America's es-

sential work-

ers. Connick

and his film-

maker daugh-

ter Georgia

board an RV

to thank and



Chuck Barney Around the remote

celebrate everyday heroes who risk their lives to keep others safe. Joining the celebration are some of his celebrity pals, including Sandra Bullock, Drew Brees, Queen Latifah, Brad Pitt, Oprah Winfrey and Renée Zellweger. Also featured: Performances by Jon Batiste, Andra Day, John Fogerty, Jamie Foxx, Herbie Hancock, Cyndi Lauper, Little Big Town, Branford Marsalis, Wynton Marsalis, Dave Matthews, Tim Mc-Graw and more. (8 tonight, CBS)

Other bets

TONIGHT » The new drama series "Perry Mason" might not be what you expect. It's a prequel set in Depressionera Los Angeles, where the title character (Matthew Rhys) has yet to become a courtroom titan. Tatiana Maslany and John Lithgow also star. (9 p.m., HBO)

TONIGHT » Anticipate more drama, and maybe more bloodshed, as the popular Kevin Costner drama "Yellowstone" returns for Season 3. Joining the series is Josh Holloway ("Lost"), who plays Roarke Morris, a hedge fund manager with



Harry Connick Jr. and his filmmaker daughter Georgia host the CBS special "United We Sing: A Grammy Salute to the Unsung Heroes.'

ambitious plans in Montana that concern the Dutfor a road trip ton family. (9 p.m., Paramount Network)

> **MONDAY** » A new season of "Diesel Brothers" promises more mega builds, epic stunts and wild pranks than ever. In the opener, Todd LeDuc challenges the guys to a desert race, forcing Heavy D and Diesel Dave to work in overdrive to get their unfinished F100 in race-ready condition. (10 p.m., Discovery)

TUESDAY » "American Masters – Toni Morrison: The Pieces I Am" is a new documentary about the legendary author who spent much of her life chronicling the African American experience. Included: reflections from Morrison herself and new interviews with Hilton Als, Angela Davis, Fran Lebowitz, Walter Mosley, Sonia Sanchez and Oprah Winfrey. (8 p.m., PBS)

wednesday » On the new unscripted series "Hot Mess House," organization expert and coach Cassandra Aarssen comes to the rescue of families that are lost in a sea of overwhelming chaos and clutter – and have no idea how to fix it. The show debuts with

back-to-back episodes. (8 p.m., HGTV)

THURSDAY » The comedy thriller "Search Party," which began life on TBS, launches its third season on a new platform. The story now finds the gang swept up in the trial of the century after Dory (Alia Shawkat) and Drew (John Reynolds) are charged for the semi-accidental murder of a private eye. (HBO Max)

FRIDAY » The "47th Annual Daytime Emmy Awards" will have a different feel this year. For the first time since 2011, the trophy fest is airing on a broadcast network. And because of the COVID-19 pandemic, the ceremony will be a virtual one with recipients appearing from home. (8 p.m., CBS)

SATURDAY » Renée Zellweger won an Oscar for her stirring lead performance in 2019's "Judy." The film follows actress and singer Judy Garland during what will be the last year of her life, as she attempts a late-1960s comeback via a series of sold-out shows in London. (8 p.m., Epix)

Contact Chuck Barney at cbarney@ bayareanewsgroup.com. Michael Livingston v. MiTAC Digital Corporation, No. 4:18-cv-05993-JST UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT, NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

All persons who purchased a Magellan RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map updates in the United States of America on or after September 28, 2014 and before June 30, 2019 ("Class Members")

On April 29, 2020, the Honorable Jon S. Tigar of the United States District Court, Northern District of California granted preliminary approval of this class action settlement and ordered the litigants to notify all Class Members of the settlement.

Plaintiffs Michael Livingston and Sharon McGill, on behalf of themselves and on behalf of all Class Members, allege that Defendant MiTAC Digital Corporation ("Defendant" or "Magellan") misled Class Members to believe that their Magellan RoadMate Navigators would receive free lifetime updates, when in fact Defendant allegedly required Class Members to purchase updates. Defendant denies these allegations, and denies that it has acted improperly or wrongfully in any way. Defendant believes that the lawsuit has no merit. The Court has not decided who is right.

The Final Approval Hearing on the adequacy, reasonableness, and fairness of the Settlement will be held at 2:00 p.m. on November 4, 2020 in Courtroom 6, 2nd Floor of the United States District Court, Northern District of California located at 1301 Clay Street, Oakland, California 94612. You are not required to attend the Hearing. Note: The date for the Final Approval Hearing may change without further notice to Class Members.

Summary of The Proposed Settlement Terms

Free Registration for Lifetime Map Subscriptions. If you purchased a Magellan RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map Updates on or after September 28, 2014 and before June 30, 2019, and you would like to receive free map data updates, you must register your lifetime map subscription on or before September 17, 2020. Registration is quick and free. You can either register on Magellan's website at https://www.magellangps.com/ support/livingston-registration or, have a registration form or a renewal form mailed to you by contacting Magellan's customer support team at https://service.magellangps.com.

Reimbursement for Map Updates. Magellan will reimburse customers with free lifetime map subscriptions for verified purchases of map updates and for other incurred expenses relating to the lifetime map subscription, plus interest. This offer is available to customers who have purchased a Magellan RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map Updates on or after September 28, 2014 and before June 30, 2019. To submit a claim for reimbursement, complete the Reimbursement Form at www.MagellanRoadMateSettlement.com.

New Terms and Conditions for Lifetime Map Subscriptions. On June 18, 2018, Magellan posted a FAQ on its website describing the terms and conditions of lifetime map subscriptions. Magellan regrets any confusion that this FAQ may have caused to its customers and will clarify to its customers that the terms and conditions in this FAQ apply only to RoadMate Navigators with Free Lifetime Map Updates purchased on or after June 30, 2019.

Customer Support for Free Map Updates. Magellan is devoted to ensuring that its customers who purchased Navigator devices with free lifetime map subscriptions are able to receive free map data updates. If you are experiencing any difficulties in obtaining a free map update for your RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map Updates, please contact Magellan's customer support team for assistance at https://service.magellangps.com.

Your Options Under the Settlement

Do Nothing And Remain a Member of the Class. If you do not exclude yourself from the Class, you will remain a member of the Class, you will be eligible for the benefits provided by the settlement, you will be bound by the settlement, and you will give up the claims that are released by the settlement.

Exclude Yourself From the Class. You may exclude yourself from the Class by completing the Exclusion Form online at www.MagellanRoadMateSettlement.com. All Exclusion Forms must be submitted on or before August 18, 2020.

Object to the Settlement. You can ask the Court to deny approval by filing an objection on or before August 18, 2020. You can't ask the Court to order a different settlement; the Court can only approve or reject the settlement. If the Court denies approval, no settlement payments will be sent out and the lawsuit will continue.

This is only a summary. For the precise terms and conditions of the settlement, please see the settlement agreement available at www.MagellanRoadMateSettlement.com.



MISS MANNERS On kids correcting adults

DEAR MISS MANNERS » I was having a disagreement with a friend about her 9-year-old daughter.

rotated from west to east, but I must have heard wrong. I will have to check

-

heard that the Earth mation, I have chosen not to send presents. Am I incorrect? GENTLE READER » You cannot send presents to peo-

We are here when you need us. Quiet, serene location.

She thinks it's OK for her child to cor-Miss rect adults as long as Manners she's right. I feel it's Judith totally disrespect-Martin ful to correct vour elders. Especially at 9 years old! What is proper? GENTLE READER » By that logic, you had better make sure that you are the elder in this relationship – since Miss Manners notices that you are freely correcting your friend's parenting.

But yes, as a general rule, it is unseemly for children to go around reprimanding adults, no matter that they are often undoubtedly right. But neither is it proper for anyone to issue citations without using tact, and that rule has been roundly violated here

However, to the larger question: How to properly guide children to correct misinformation without creating offense - a skill that will help them later in life, especially in their early careers.

It must be done with humility. As in, "Oh! I always

my sources" - thus helpfully prompting them to check theirs.

DEAR MISS MAN-

NERS » I am not a member of any social media, which seem to be the rage these days. My husband's younger relatives are now starting to have children and announce the births there, instead of sending out the birth announcements that I have always depended on for vital information such as the name of the child and the date of birth.

My husband does communicate through social media with these relatives, but has never felt it necessary to convey this information to me. When asked, he is vague about the details, since he does not feel it necessary to give presents for any reason, birthdays and Christmas included.

Since I have always handled the giving of such presents and am in ignorance of the relevant inforple whose events you are not aware of, or whose names you do not know. Miss Manners feels certain that once these young relatives are tipped off to this idea they will recommence sending announcements through the proper channels.

DEAR MISS MANNERS »

What can I say to parents who comment on a child's size? My child was asked, "How old are you, 7?" "Five," he answered, to which she responded, "Oh! You're really big for a 5-year-old."

We would never dream of telling someone "Gosh, you're really short for only being 47," or "Golly, you're very fat for being 28," so I don't know why it seems OK to speak this way to and about children. **GENTLE READER** » "Thanks so much for noticing. We're hoping that by the time he turns 8, he'll be big enough to drive.'

Please send your questions to missmanners.com.

Answer

EXCEED

KITTEN

The boy and his dad both enjoyed bright, clear days. It was

> LIKE FATHER, LIKE "SUN"

USEFUL

HAZARD



WE REMAIN OPEN and **READY TO SERVE YOU**

SERVING the COMMUNITY since 1889

FUNERAL SERVICES through **Darling Fischer Funeral Homes**

Ask about our Mausoleum Extension Come & learn the advantages of Pre Planning



LOS GATOS MEMORIAL PARK 2255 Los Gatos-Almaden Road, San Jose, CA 95124 408.356.4151

www.losgatosmemorialpark.com



Puzzle answers

BUCKLE

STITCH

MORRIS Damaged tomatoes, stunted irises? Gardener tells why

My tomatoes are starting to ripen, but and getting soggy. Is there some insect or disease that is causing this? What can I do about it? -R.G., CastroValley

Morris No insects or Columnist diseases. It's called blossom-end rot, and although it can be common in tomatoes, it also happens in peppers, squashes, cucumbers and melons.

It's caused by a lack of calcium, but that doesn't mean that your soil is lacking in calcium. It probably isn't. It's usually more of an irrigation problem. The water is what carries the calcium up into the plant, but if the watering has been inconsistent, the end of the tomato can rot.

For example, if you started your garden by

giving seedlings lots of water, then forgot to water the ends are turning black as often as you should, end rot can occur.

You don't want to eat the nasty looking part of the tomato, but you can cut off the bad part and eat the rest. To prevent the condition with future tomatoes, make sure you have a consistent watering

schedule.

Joan

I am hoping you can help me identify what is wrong with one of my irises. The flowers are stunted and do not look like they are supposed to. Any ideas? Insects or a virus? I have asked around and no one seems to know. - Larry Switzer, Bay Area

The root of your prob-A lem is, most likely, in the iris bulb. If the bulb was mushy or rotten, or small or undersized, it can

produce stunted blooms, and in some cases, no blooms at all.

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-1 Filed 09/30/20 Page 59 of 97

When you plant bulbs, they can look normal but then rot in the soil if it's too wet. Sometimes older bulbs get accidentally mixed in with new ones that you purchase. Or if you dug up your irises, divided and replanted them, you might have planted a bulb that was just spent. It happens.

As you have other irises that bloomed normally, it doesn't seem that you have a soil issue or an insect one. Mark the plant, and the next time you divide your bulbs, toss that one out.

Do you have a gardening question about outdoor plants or house plants? Send your questions to Joan Morris at jmorris@bayareanewsgroup.com.

Contact Joan Morris at 925-977-8479.

nity programs.

FROM PAGE 3

and the one that plotted violence against King had until last week worked as a part-time officer in the Tracy Police Department.

In a statement Thursday, Tracy police said that the officer is "no longer conducting work" for the department and that he "was immediately relieved of duty pending an investigation." Tracy police did not name the officer, but he has been identified as retired San Jose police Sgt. Billy Dishman.

Raj Jayadev of Silicon Valley De-Bug said the 10-70DSJ group exposed the need for a deeper set of reforms, including the diversion of funds from the Po- dium article, meanwhile, lice Department to commu- was not satisfied by the re- Salonga at 408-920-5002.

"Off the top, every case these officers have been involved in must be reopened and reinvestigated. Second, active officers need to be immediately removed," Jayadev said.

hate-filled racism is just what happened to be found in that Facebook group," he continued. "The city can't solve this by creating a new office to study the racism, or removing the 'bad apples.' Through this post, we now have confirmation that the SJPD has been a haven for current and former racists – generational institutional racism. This is why the community has called for defunding the Staff writer Nico Savidge police.'

The author of the Me-

bukes and calls for firings. The department needs to do more to address "systemic racism" within its ranks, the author said, citing as one example the lawsuit Officer Nabil Haidar filed in 2018. Haidar, "And the reality is, this a Lebanese-American, alleged he was subjected to Islamophobic harassment, discrimination and retaliation because of his race, national origin and religion.

The author said the department also needs to promote more officers of color.

'Them taking action is not the end of the process," the author said. "It's only the beginning."

contributed to this report. Contact Jason Green at 408-920-5006 and Robert



& TRASH REMOVA *COVID19 CERTIFIED!* [669] 3 24hrNoJob2Small@gmail.com

GLEAN UP, MOUING,

7.55 []?!!

"No matter the time you got a problem, we got an answer" 🕖

Hauling • Trash Removal 24 Hour Moving Services

> Restoration of Water Damaged Piping/Plumbing Services

Demo House Restoration 30% Senior Discount 20% Economic Discount

CALL NOW! 669-377-3222

Michael Livingston v. MiTAC Digital Corporation, No. 4:18-cv-05993-JST UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT, NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

All persons who purchased a Magellan RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map updates in the United States of America on or after September 28, 2014 and before June 30, 2019 ("Class Members").

On April 29, 2020, the Honorable Jon S. Tigar of the United States District Court, Northern District of California granted preliminary approval of this class action settlement and ordered the litigants to notify all Class Members of the settlement.

Plaintiffs Michael Livingston and Sharon McGill, on behalf of themselves and on behalf

BELMONT VILLAGE SALUTES AMERICAN HEROES

Every Independence Day, we honor our resident veterans. As we navigate this pandemic together, your courage, sacrifice and resilience are an inspiration to us all. Our commitment to the health and happiness of all of our residents is as strong as ever. As our community, our city and our country move forward, we are mindful of the trust you place in us to provide the highest standards in senior living for Bay Area seniors and families.

Schedule a virtual tour today at **BELMONTVILLAGE.COM/ALBANY**



SENIOR LIVING ALBANY

July 4, 2020

Photography by Thomas Sanders

占 🏩 ©2020 Belmont Village, L.P. | RCFE 019200721 🛛 🗗 💟 🕨 in 🞯

of all Class Members, allege that Defendant MiTAC Digital Corporation ("Defendant" or "Magellan") misled Class Members to believe that their Magellan RoadMate Navigators would receive free lifetime updates, when in fact Defendant allegedly required Class Members to purchase updates. Defendant denies these allegations, and denies that it has acted improperly or wrongfully in any way. Defendant believes that the lawsuit has no merit. The Court has not decided who is right.

The Final Approval Hearing on the adequacy, reasonableness, and fairness of the Settlement will be held at 2:00 p.m. on November 4, 2020 in Courtroom 6, 2nd Floor of the United States District Court, Northern District of California located at 1301 Clay Street, Oakland, California 94612. You are not required to attend the Hearing. Note: The date for the Final Approval Hearing may change without further notice to Class Members.

Summary of The Proposed Settlement Terms

Free Registration for Lifetime Map Subscriptions. If you purchased a Magellan RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map Updates on or after September 28, 2014 and before June 30, 2019, and you would like to receive free map data updates, you must register your lifetime map subscription on or before September 17, 2020. Registration is quick and free. You can either register on Magellan's website at https://www.magellangps.com/ support/livingston-registration or, have a registration form or a renewal form mailed to you by contacting Magellan's customer support team at https://service.magellangps.com.

Reimbursement for Map Updates. Magellan will reimburse customers with free lifetime map subscriptions for verified purchases of map updates and for other incurred expenses relating to the lifetime map subscription, plus interest. This offer is available to customers who have purchased a Magellan RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map Updates on or after September 28, 2014 and before June 30, 2019. To submit a claim for reimbursement, complete the Reimbursement Form at www.MagellanRoadMateSettlement.com.

New Terms and Conditions for Lifetime Map Subscriptions. On June 18, 2018, Magellan posted a FAQ on its website describing the terms and conditions of lifetime map subscriptions. Magellan regrets any confusion that this FAQ may have caused to its customers and will clarify to its customers that the terms and conditions in this FAQ apply only to RoadMate Navigators with Free Lifetime Map Updates purchased on or after June 30, 2019.

Customer Support for Free Map Updates. Magellan is devoted to ensuring that its customers who purchased Navigator devices with free lifetime map subscriptions are able to receive free map data updates. If you are experiencing any difficulties in obtaining a free map update for your RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map Updates, please contact Magellan's customer support team for assistance at https://service.magellangps.com.

Your Options Under the Settlement

Do Nothing And Remain a Member of the Class. If you do not exclude yourself from the Class, you will remain a member of the Class, you will be eligible for the benefits provided by the settlement, you will be bound by the settlement, and you will give up the claims that are released by the settlement.

Exclude Yourself From the Class. You may exclude yourself from the Class by completing the Exclusion Form online at www.MagellanRoadMateSettlement.com. All Exclusion Forms must be submitted on or before August 18, 2020.

Object to the Settlement. You can ask the Court to deny approval by filing an objection on or before August 18, 2020. You can't ask the Court to order a different settlement; the Court can only approve or reject the settlement. If the Court denies approval, no settlement payments will be sent out and the lawsuit will continue.

This is only a summary. For the precise terms and conditions of the settlement, please see the settlement agreement available at www.MagellanRoadMateSettlement.com.

FORTUNE

AGING SERVICES

OBITUARY Marc Fumaroli, defender of French culture, is dead at 88

By Théophile Larcher The New York Times

Marc Fumaroli, a leading French historian, public intellectual and defender of the French language and culture against American influence and what he called "globish English," died June 24 in Paris. He was 88.

His death was announced by the Académie Française, the official council of guardians of the French language, and the Académie des Inscriptions et Belles-Lettres, a learned society devoted to the humanities. Fumaroli was a member of both.

As a historian, Fumaroli specialized in 17th-century France during the reigns of Louis XIII and Louis XIV, with an emphasis on rhetoric and literature from that the emphasis on rhetoric as period. He was the author of about 30 books.

"He was one of our greatwell as a fervent apostle of tion of rhetoric in modern our cultural heritage," the culture," said Antoine Com-Élysée Palace said in state- pagnon, a French literature ment after his death.

He was promoted to commander of the French Legion versity, adding that Fumaof Honor, the third of five degrees of distinction, in 2008 after being named chevalier lan Bloom. in 1993 and officer in 2002.

In his writings, in conferences and in his teaching – he held posts at prestigious ology, mercantilism, mass French universities like the Collège de France - Fuma- ism from within and threatroli shed light on the evolution of rhetoric, literature and the French language. tural influences that include His breakthrough, "The a globalized form of English. Age of Eloquence" (1980), He plunged vigorously is regarded as a fundamental work on the history of French literature, putting progression.

professor at the Collège de France and Columbia Uniroli took inspiration from American philosopher Al-

Fumaroli often warned that French culture was being impoverished by ideconsumption and capitalening tides of "American soft power" from without, cul-

into cultural debates, especially with the publication in 1991 of his book "The Cul-

tween culture and mass entertainment.

Cultural Policy Debates: A Reader" (2002), edited by Jeremy Ahearne, pondered why the French Ministry of Culture, despite boasting of "making masterpieces available to the great majority of he became enamored of litpeople," was not making erature in his family's liuse of that most populist of mediums, television, which was then in 94% of French homes. And, Fumaroli contended, the ministry was also more interested in promoting cultural treasures as tourism than it was in teaching people about those treasures in any kind of depth.

"It sprinkles its pubtural State: Essay on a Mod- lic with information, ata key to understanding its ern Religion," which exam- tractions, cultural variety tained his doctor of arts deined how successive govern- shows," he wrote; "it does not gree at the Sorbonne in 1976.

"This book placed him at ments since the 1930s had educate it, for its practices of est narrators of the past, as the forefront of the tradi- handled the distinction be- animation, like those of leisure clubs, are too ephemeral and superficial to stand An excerpt from that in the place of that long and book reproduced in "French patient work of method and love constituted by true education."

Fumaroli was born in Marseille on June 10, 1932, and spent most of his childhood in Fez, Morocco, where brary. His father worked for the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, and his mother was a teacher.

Returning to France, he obtained an agrégation, or teaching diploma, at the Sorbonne in 1958 before serving in the French Army during Algeria's war for independence from 1958 to 1961. After years of teaching, he ob-

Within the academic world, Fumaroli gained notoriety at a time when socalled French theory, a movement of contemporary philosophers with which Fumaroli was never associated, was getting attention in American universities, said Michel Zink, perpetual secretary of the Académie des Inscriptions et Belles-Lettres.

He had been a visiting professor at All Souls College, Oxford, since 1983 and a visiting fellow at Princeton University since 1984. He led conferences at American universities including Harvard, Johns Hopkins and Columbia and was honored with membership in the American Philosophical Society of Philadelphia and the British Academy.

Fumaroli leaves no immediate survivors.

Michael Livingston v. MiTAC Digital Corporation, No. 4:18-cv-05993-JST UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT, NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

All persons who purchased a Magellan RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map updates in the United States of America on or after September 28, 2014 and before June 30, 2019 ("Class Members").

On April 29, 2020, the Honorable Jon S. Tigar of the United States District Court, Northern District of California granted preliminary approval of this class action settlement and ordered the litigants to notify all Class Members of the settlement.

Plaintiffs Michael Livingston and Sharon McGill, on behalf of themselves and on behalf of all Class Members, allege that Defendant MiTAC Digital Corporation ("Defendant" or "Magellan") misled Class Members to believe that their Magellan RoadMate Navigators would receive free lifetime updates, when in fact Defendant allegedly required Class Members to purchase updates. Defendant denies these allegations, and denies that it has acted improperly or wrongfully in any way. Defendant believes that the lawsuit has no merit. The Court has not decided who is right.

The Final Approval Hearing on the adequacy, reasonableness, and fairness of the Settlement will be held at 2:00 p.m. on November 4, 2020 in Courtroom 6, 2nd Floor of the United States District Court, Northern District of California located at 1301 Clay Street, Oakland, California 94612. You are not required to attend the Hearing. Note: The date for the Final Approval Hearing may change without further notice to Class Members.

Summary of The Proposed Settlement Terms

Free Registration for Lifetime Map Subscriptions. If you purchased a Magellan RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map Updates on or after September 28, 2014 and before June 30, 2019, and you would like to receive free map data updates, you must register your lifetime map subscription on or before September 17, 2020. Registration is quick and free. You can either register on Magellan's website at https://www.magellangps.com/ support/livingston-registration or, have a registration form or a renewal form mailed to you by contacting Magellan's customer support team at https://service.magellangps.com.

Reimbursement for Map Updates. Magellan will reimburse customers with free lifetime map subscriptions for verified purchases of map updates and for other incurred expenses relating to the lifetime map subscription, plus interest. This offer is available to customers who have purchased a Magellan RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map Updates on or after September 28, 2014 and before June 30, 2019. To submit a claim for reimbursement, complete the Reimbursement Form at www.MagellanRoadMateSettlement.com.

New Terms and Conditions for Lifetime Map Subscriptions. On June 18, 2018, Magellan posted a FAQ on its website describing the terms and conditions of lifetime map subscriptions. Magellan regrets any confusion that this FAQ may have caused to its customers and will clarify to its customers that the terms and conditions in this FAQ apply only to RoadMate Navigators with Free Lifetime Map Updates purchased on or after June 30, 2019.

Customer Support for Free Map Updates. Magellan is devoted to ensuring that its



customers who purchased Navigator devices with free lifetime map subscriptions are able to receive free map data updates. If you are experiencing any difficulties in obtaining a free map update for your RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map Updates, please contact Magellan's customer support team for assistance at https://service.magellangps.com.

Your Options Under the Settlement

Do Nothing And Remain a Member of the Class. If you do not exclude yourself from the Class, you will remain a member of the Class, you will be eligible for the benefits provided by the settlement, you will be bound by the settlement, and you will give up the claims that are released by the settlement.

Exclude Yourself From the Class. You may exclude yourself from the Class by completing the Exclusion Form online at www.MagellanRoadMateSettlement.com. All Exclusion Forms must be submitted on or before August 18, 2020.

Object to the Settlement. You can ask the Court to deny approval by filing an objection on or before August 18, 2020. You can't ask the Court to order a different settlement; the Court can only approve or reject the settlement. If the Court denies approval, no settlement payments will be sent out and the lawsuit will continue.

This is only a summary. For the precise terms and conditions of the settlement, please see the settlement agreement available at www.MagellanRoadMateSettlement.com.

Branch Manager/Loan Officer | NMLS ID#250347

Contact Justin today for great service and low rates on your next purchase or refinance home loan.



www.JustinBerteaux.com



Get our FREE guide: 6 PROVEN WAYS TO MOTIVATE STUDENTS

Learning by Experimenting

Children have a natural curiosity. Our talented teachers have a passion for unlocking young minds through hands-on lessons in science, technology, engineering and math (STEM).

BEST

CHRISTIAN SCH

For over 45 years, Milpitas Christian School has trained thousands of students to become creative problem-solvers. Our families know that their children will need the intellectual, physical, spiritual, social and emotional skills to meet the challenges

www.MilpitasBest.com



"I love how this school is so united and loving. We are all a family. There is no bullying, excluding, or hating. We are all friends. You can be comfortable with being yourself and you can be comfortable talking about God." Helen (MCS Alumni)

MCS accepts students of all races and nationalities and does not discriminate in any of its programs based on gender,

EXHIBIT E

MAGELLAN

You may be entitled to remedies provided by a Settlement if you purchased

Magellan RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map Updates

in the United States of America at any time on or after September 28, 2014 and before June 30, 2019.





You may be entitled to remedies provided by a Settlement if you purchased

Magellan RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map Updates

in the United States of America at any time on or after September 28, 2014 and before June 30, 2019.

Learn More

Exhibit E to Declaration of Melinda Yang





ed 09/30/20 Page

You may be entitled to remedies provided by a Settlement if you purchased

Magellan RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map Updates

in the United States of America at any time on or after September 28, 2014 and before June 30, 2019.

MAGELLAN®

You may be entitled to remedies provided by a Settlement if you purchased

Magellan RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map Updates

in the United States of America at any time on or after September 28, 2014 and before June 30, 2019.

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-1 Filed 09/30/20 Page 66 of 97



You may be entitled to remedies provided by a Settlement if you purchased

Magellan RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map Updates

in the United States of America at any time on or after September 28, 2014 and before June 30, 2019.

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-1 Filed 09/30/20 Page 67 of 97



You may be entitled to remedies provided by a Settlement if you purchased

Magellan RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map Updates

in the United States of America at any time on or after September 28, 2014 and before June 30, 2019.

Tap Now





You may be entitled to remedies provided by a Settlement if you purchased

Magellan RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map Updates

in the United States of America at any time on or after September 28, 2014 and before June 30, 2019.



Exhibit E to Declaration of Melinda Yage 68

8-cv-05993-JST Document Ton1 Filed 09/30/20 Page

You may be entitled to remedies provided by a Settlement if you purchased

Magellan RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map Updates

in the United States of America at any time on or after September 28, 2014 and before June 30, 2019.

Tap Now

Exhibit E to Declaration of Melinda YPage 69

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-1 Filed 09/30/20 Page 70 of 97







Magellan RoadMate Navigator

Class Action Settlement

You May Be Entitled to Remedies Provided by a Class Action Settlement.

LEARN MORE

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-1 Filed 09/30/20 Page 71 of 97





Magellan RoadMate Navigator

You May Be Entitled to Remedies Provided by a Class Action Settlement



Class Action Settlement





Magellan RoadMate Navigator You May Be Entitled to Remedies Provided by a Class Action Settlement

Class Action Settlement

Learn More >



Magellan RoadMate Navigator

Class Action Settlement

You May Be Entitled to Remedies Provided by a Class Action Settlement

LEARN MORE

EXHIBIT F

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-1 Filed 09/30/20 Page 73 of 97

SETTLEMENT ADMINISTRATION LEGAL NOTICING CAMPAIGN FINAL REPORT

Dates Reported: 06/19/2020 – 08/28/2020

Reported On: 09/08/2020

LIVINGSTON v MITAC DIGITAL CORPORATION (MAGELLAN ROADMATE NAVIGATOR)

Exhibit F to Declaration of Melinda Yang



Campaign Overview

MiTAC Digital Corporation (Magellan Roadmate Navigator)

Campaign Dates: 6/19/2020-8/28/2020

Audience Summary

DV360 - Audience 1: Magellan consumers, GPS consumers, Consumer electronics and accessories, people who have visited related sites to Magellan, highly likely to own a GPS device, Audience 2: News/Weather, finance, home and garden, cooking, retargeting, and other related interest targeting US Territories (corresponding legal age still 18+) GDN: Magellan consumers, GPS consumers, Consumer electronics and accessories, people who have visited related sites to Magellan, highly likely to own a GPS device, Audience 2: News/Weather, finance, home and garden, cooking, retargeting, and other related interest targeting Facebook: Audience Interest Targeting: Magellan Navigation, General GPS devices, Waze, Global Positioning System or Google Maps, News/Weather, finance, home and garden, cooking, retargeting, and other related interest targeting US Territories (corresponding legal age still 18+) LinkedIn:

Pandora: 35-65+, Road trip Enthusiasts, Pandora - Display and Audio

Google/Bing: National Keyword Targeting and search topics and terms including: MiTAC settlement, Magellan Class Action, Magellan Brand terms, etc.

Estimated Class Size **788,042**

Estimated Reach 551,629

Campaign Parameters

Placements:

Banner Advertisement (Google Display Network & General Programmatic)

Paid Search (Google/Bing)

Social Media (Facebook)

Social Media (LinkedIn)

OLR (Pandora)

Total Forecasted Impressions: 9,062,343

Campaign Duration: 10-Weeks



Campaign Performance

Overview

MiTAC Class Action Settlement

Campaign Dates: 6/19/2020-8/28/2020





Display Overview

DV360





Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-1 Filed 09/30/20 Page 77 of 97

Google Display Network

Total Impressi 888,71		CTR .12%
	AUD: GPS Consumers	
Impression 888,7* DV360 Audio	1,063	CTR .12%
AUD: GPS Consumers Must Match:	AUD: Consumer Electronics Must Match: Eyeota: Intent > Shopping > Consumer Electronics / Tech > Navigation / GPS	AUD: General Audience Bluekai > Branded Data > Webbula >
Bluekai > Branded Data > Scanbuy > Technology & Computing > GPS	Amber: Interest > Communication > GPS & Navigation Valassis Digital > Purchase Intent > Computers & Electronics > Consumer Electronics > GPS & Navigation	Passionate About > Home & Garden > Gardening
Bluekai > Branded Data > Clickagy > In-Market > Electronics > GPS Devices	eXelate TW Interest - Technology & Electronics - GPS and Navigation And Must Also Match: eXelate - Audiences by Skimlinks - Wants to Buy - Brands - Technology - TomTom	Newspapers and News Services AlikeAudience: Australia > Stay at/work
And Also Match: Acxiom US Technology > Consumer Electronics & Accessories > Likely GPS Brand > Magellan	eXelate - Audiences by Skimlinks - Affinity - Brands - Technology - TomTom Acxiom US Technology > Consumer Electronics & Accessories > Likely GPS Brand > TomTom Acxiom US Technology > Consumer Electronics & Accessories > Likely GPS Brand > Magellan Bluekai > Branded Data > Dataline > Modeled Buyers > Garmin Brand	from home (COVID-19) > Home Decoration & Houseware & Cooking Utilities Weather

GDN Audience

AUD: GPS Consumers

Audience Interests Must Match: gps tomtom, gps navigation and tracking systems, gps navigation updates, magellan gps software



Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-1 Filed 09/30/20 Page 78 of 97

Display Audience Demographics

Demographics Targeted



Age: 18-65+





Parental Status: All



Household Income: Lower 50% - Top 10%



Targeted Devices: Mobile, Tablets, and Desktops

Highest Performing Demographics



California Texas Florida New York Illinois

35-65+

Male and Unknown



Not a Parent and Unknown



Lower 50% and Unknown



Mobile

Display Audience Psychographics





Display Ad Preview







Exhibit Fito Deelaragon of Metinda Yang



LinkedIn



Facebook Audiences

Facebook AUD: GPS Target Demo (US)

Location - Living In: United States Age: 45 - 65+ People Who Match: Interests: Gardening, Finance, Sports, Weather or Cooking And Must Also Match: Interests: Map, GPS devices, Vehicle tracking system, GPS tracking unit, Driving, GPS navigation software, Navigation, Global Positioning System or Automotive navigation system And Must Also Match: Interests: Apple Watch, Bing Maps, Garmin, Magellan Navigation, Waze, TomTom or Google Maps

(US) Facebook AUD: GPS Consumer

(Territories) Location - Living In: American Samoa, Guam, Northern Mariana Islands, Puerto Rico, US Virgin Islands

Age: 18 - 65+ People Who Match: Interests: Magellan Navigation, GPS devices, TomTom, GPS navigation software, Navigation, Global Positioning System or Automotive navigation system

Facebook AUD: GPS Consumer (US)

Location - Living In: United States Age: 18 - 65+ People Who Match: Interests: Garmin, Magellan Navigation, Waze, GPS devices, TomTom, GPS navigation, Google Maps, Global Positioning System or Automotive navigation system

Facebook AUD: ReTargeting

Location - Living In: United States Age: 18 - 65+ Include People who visited specific web pages Pixel: CPT Group's Pixel Parameter: URL contains https://magellanroadmate.cptcmsubmissions.com/ClaimForm, https://www.magellanroadmatesettlement.com/ https://www.magellanroadmatesettlement.com/important-dates, https://www.magellanroadmatesettlement.com/court-documents, https://www.magellanroadmatesettlement.com/faqs or https://www.magellanroadmatesettlement.com/contact-us Exclude people who meet any of the following criteria: People who visited specific web pages Pixel: CPT Group's Pixel Parameter: URL contains https://assets.websitefiles.com/5ed667e4b8b1d99dc1b53de3/5edad152800a230fa6681b80_Reimbursement%20Fo rm.pdf, https://magellanroadmate.cptcmsubmissions.com/Thanks, https://magellanroadmate.cptcmsubmissions.com/confirmation https://magellanroadmate.cptcmsubmissions.com/ThanksOptOut or

https://magellanroadmate.cptcmsubmissions.com/ThanksOptout of https://magellanroadmate.cptcmsubmissions.com/Thanks/FileUploadStatus

LinkedIn Audience

LinkedIn AUD: GPS Target Audience

Locations (Permanent) US Virgin Islands, American Samoa, United States, Northern Mariana Islands, Puerto Rico, Guam AND who meet ANY of the following criteria: Member Traita Domestic Frequent Travelers Job Titles (Current) Traveler, Truck Driver, Driving Instructor, Driver, Delivery Driver, School Bus Driver Member Interests Electronics Member Skills Travel Technology, GPS Navigation, Magellan, A-GPS, Garmin, GPS Units, Experienced Traveler, GPS Devices, Global Positioning System (GPS), Commercial Driving, Business Travel, Budget Travel, GPS Applications, Independent Travel, Travel, Leisure Travel AND who meet ANY of the following criteria: Member Age 18 to 24, 25 to 34, 35 to 54, 55+



Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-1 Filed 09/30/20 Page 82 of 97

Social Audience Demographics



Exhibit Fito Declaration of Melinda Yang

Social Ad Preview



You may be entitled to remedies provided by a Settlement if you purchased Magellan RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map updates in thesee more





Paid Search Overview

Google



Top 15 Keywords

Keyword	Match Type	Impressions	Clicks	CTR
GPS	Broad match	5,999	63	1.05%
GPS Device	Broad match	2,899	40	1.38%
+GPS	Broad match	2,758	34	1.23%
"GPS"	Phrase match	1,456	29	1.99%
Magellan	Broad match	362	9	2.49%
[GPS]	Exact match	325	14	4.31%
+Magellan	Broad match	299	11	3.68%
"Magellan"	Phrase match	210	6	2.86%
Magellan GPS	Broad match	191	10	5.24%
[Magellan]	Exact match	185	2	1.08%
[Magellan GPS]	Exact match	151	16	10.60%
Magellan Navigator	Broad match	126	8	6.35%
Magellan Road Mate	Broad match	117	6	5.13%
Magellan Updates	Broad match	100	7	7.00%
+Magellan +GPS	Broad match	93	6	6.45%



Bing

Total Impressions	Total Clicks	CTR
39,657	562	1.42%

Top 15 Keywords

Keyword	Match Type	Impressions	Clicks	CTR
GPS	Phrase	13,007	57	0.44%
Magellan	Phrase	6,077	97	1.60%
Magellan	Exact	4,347	57	1.31%
GPS Device	Phrase	2,424	14	0.58%
Magellan GPS	Exact	2,160	74	3.43%
Magellan	Broad	1,955	3	0.15%
Magellan GPS	Phrase	1,833	63	3.44%
Magellan Updates	Broad	1,293	17	1.31%
Magellan Road Mate	Phrase	792	24	3.03%
GPS	Broad	738	1	0.14%
Magellan Navigator	Phrase	712	25	3.51%
Magellan GPS	Broad	636	10	1.57%
Magellan RoadMate	Phrase	591	20	3.38%
Magellan RoadMate	Exact	387	19	4.91%
Magellan Updates	Exact	357	15	4.20%



Paid Search Ad Preview






Pandora Overview



35-65+, Roadtrip Enthusiasts, Pandora - Audio → Roadtrip Enthusiasts - Display Added Value

Audience Demographics





Female

Age: 55-64

Audience Psychographics



Road Trip Enthusiasts

Ad Preview







Website Overview (Home Page)







Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-1 Filed 09/30/20 Page 89 of 97

Website Overview (Submit Claim Page)



Total Page Views 362,764

Top Pages

/thanks.aspx /ClaimForm /thanks /confirmation.aspx /claimformunknown





Likes, Shares, and Hidden Comments

AUGUST 26	Shares					
KenKen Kloulubak Ezguerra and Atdao Salas reacted to your link.		t All Clear Selec	ation			Mark All on Dond
AUGUST 24 Donnald Schankin likes your link.	Selec	Clear Select				Mark All as Read
🙆 🙆 Aug 24	JULY 7					
AUGUST 18 Edwin Correa and Alan Montalvo like your link. Aug 18		Randhir M N	aik shared Magell	an RoadMate Navigator S	Settlement's post. 🕇	Ð
AUGUST 17 Spencer Kg, Carol Ruane and David Nash like your link. AUGUST 17 AUG 17			LLANROADMATESE		Le	earn More
AUGUST 14 Peter Luzano, Zaylia Velez and 2 other people reacted to your link. O Aug 18		Mage	llan RoadMate Na	avigator		
AUGUST 8 Yamil Cintron likes your link.		00	14		3 Comment	s 2 Shares
Nelson González, Axiel Omar Cardona Arce and 2 other people like Aug 9	your link.		🖒 Like	💭 Comment	🖒 Share	
AUGUST 5 David Grigsby and Dale Boser like your link.		Most	Relevant -			
AUGUST 4				agellan RoadMate Navigat	tor Settl 😳 🙆	GF 😡
Opeta Tovale likes your link.		3	Press Enter to post. David Grigsby I before 2015.	'll have to find the Receipt	t, I think we bought (ours
JULY 27 Andy Ruisinger likes your link. O Jul 27		6	Ban David Grigsb	y - Unhide - Massage - 4w	have and some distance of	
ULV 24 Opeta Tovale and Gaby Ortiz like your link. O Jul 24		No.	into a gaint BRIC there products a			
JULY 20		-	Ban Bill Downing.	Unhide Message 8w		
Steve Potts, Daniel Horrocks and 5 other people reacted to your link.		0	lucky to end up		e the plaintiffs will b	e
ULY 19 KenKen Kloulubak Ezguerra likes your link. O Jul 19			Ban Billy Ricks - l	Jnhide - Message - 7w		
ULY 18 Miguelito Guelo Cordero and Juan Rios like your link. O Jul 16		м	AGELLANROADMATES	SETTI EMENT.COM		Close
JULY 13 Michael Bickham likes your link.		С	lass Action Settl agellan RoadMate I	ement	Learn	More
JULY 12				angulor.		
Michael Bickham likes your link. O Jul 12					1 Cc	omment
Arreis Ziledana likes your link.			🖒 Like	□ Comment	Share	۲
JULY 10		М	ost Relevant 🝷			
Nelson David Ortega and Maribel Morales like your link.			Press Enter to post.	Magellan RoadMate Navigato	r Settl 🕞 🔘 🕼	
JULY 6 Keydee Marie Gonzalez Diaz reacted to your link.			Carrie Steven Ban Carrie Stev	s Amen rens Unhide - Message - 9w		
JUNE 28 Welly Quiñonez and Gudelia Marrero like your link. O Jun 28						Close
JUKE 23 David Oraham likes your link.						



Final Wrap Summary

The MiTAC supplemental notice campaign spurred **6,187 clicks** over the duration of the campaign which resulted in **222,975 sessions** on the settlement home page and/or submit claim page. CPT successfully reached the total number of impressions as stated in the proposal. During the duration of the campaign, Facebook, DV360, and Google Display performed well across the highly targeted audiences. Additionally, paid search, across Bing and Google, maintained a quality CTR (click-through rate) throughout the entire campaign. CPT closely monitored and optimized the media budget daily across tactics and audience segments, in order to ensure highest quality viewable impressions. Overall, the MiTAC media plan met the media consumption profile of our audience across digital tactics on both desktop and mobile web properties and effectively reached the class.





EXHIBIT G

To: <<<Class Member Email Address>> From: MagellanRoadMateSettlement@cptgroup.com Subject: Notice of Class Action Settlement - Livingston v. MiTAC Digital Corporation Body of Email:

Michael Livingston v. MiTAC Digital Corporation, No. 4:18-cv-05993-JST UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT, NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA NOTICE OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT You are not being sued. This notice affects your rights. Please read it carefully

To: All persons who purchased a Magellan RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map updates in the United States of America on or after September 28, 2014 and before June 30, 2019 ("Class Members").

On April 29, 2020, the Honorable Jon S. Tigar of the United States District Court, Northern District of California granted preliminary approval of this class action settlement and ordered the litigants to notify all Class Members of the settlement. You have received this notice because you may be a Class Member, and, if so, are therefore entitled to the remedies provided by the settlement.

The Final Approval Hearing on the adequacy, reasonableness, and fairness of the Settlement will be held at 2:00 p.m. on November 4, 2020 in Courtroom 6, 2nd Floor of the United States District Court, Northern District of California located at 1301 Clay Street, Oakland, California 94612. You are not required to attend the Hearing. Note: The date for the Final Approval Hearing may change without further notice to Class Members. Please check <u>www.MagellanRoadMateSettlement.com</u> for updates.

Plaintiffs Michael Livingston and Sharon McGill, on behalf of themselves and on behalf of all Class Members, allege that Defendant MiTAC Digital Corporation ("Defendant" or "Magellan") misled Class Members to believe that their Magellan RoadMate Navigators would receive free lifetime updates, when in fact Defendant allegedly required Class Members to purchase updates. Defendant denies these allegations and denies that it has acted improperly or wrongfully in any way. Defendant believes that the lawsuit has no merit.

The Court has not decided who is right. The proposed Settlement does not mean that any law was broken or that Defendant did anything wrong. Defendant denies all legal claims in this case. Plaintiffs think the proposed Settlement is best for everyone affected.

Summary of The Proposed Settlement Terms

Free Registration for Lifetime Map Subscriptions. If you purchased a Magellan RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map Updates on or after September 28, 2014 and before June 30, 2019, and you would like to receive free map data updates, you must register your lifetime map subscription on or before September 17, 2020. Registration is quick and free. You can either register on Magellan's website at https://www.magellangps.com/support/livingston-registration or, at your request, Magellan will mail a registration form to you. Registering your subscription will ensure that you receive free map data updates made available for your particular Navigator device for the next three years. At the end of this three-year period, you can renew your three-year registration at no charge. You can either renew your registration on Magellan's website at https://www.magellangps.com/support/livingston-registration or, at your can continue to renew your three-year registration or, at your request, Magellan will mail a renewal form to you. You can continue to renew your three-year registration at no charge for as long as you use your Navigator device. To have a registration form or a renewal form mailed to you, please contact Magellan's customer support team at https://service.magellangps.com.

<u>Reimbursement for Map Updates</u>. Magellan will reimburse customers with free lifetime map subscriptions for verified purchases of map updates and for other incurred expenses relating to the lifetime map subscription, plus interest. This offer is available to customers who have purchased a Magellan RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map Updates on or after September 28, 2014 and before June 30, 2019. To submit a claim for reimbursement, complete the Reimbursement Form at www.MagellanRoadMateSettlement.com.

<u>New Terms and Conditions for Lifetime Map Subscriptions</u>. Magellan will update its website, marketing, and packaging of RoadMate Navigators with Free Lifetime Map Updates to state clearly the terms and conditions as provided in the FAQ, posted to Magellan's website on June 18, 2018, or advise potential purchasers where they can read the terms and conditions. Magellan will also instruct its third-party resellers and distributors to update their websites and any marketing material and packaging in their possession accordingly. Magellan has already begun implementing these changes and expects to complete these changes by June 30, 2020.

<u>Customer Support for Free Map Updates</u>. If you are experiencing any difficulties in obtaining a free map update for your RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map Updates, please contact Magellan's customer support team for assistance. Customer support is available through Magellan's website at https://service.magellangps.com.

Your Options Under the Settlement

Do Nothing And Remain a Member of the Class. If you do not exclude yourself from the Class, you will remain a member of the Class, you will be eligible for the benefits provided by the settlement, you will be bound by the settlement, and you will give up the claims that are released by the settlement.

Exclude Yourself From the Class. You may exclude yourself from the Class by completing the Exclusion Form online at <u>www.MagellanRoadMateSettlement.com</u> on or before August 18, 2020.

Object to the Settlement. You can ask the Court to deny approval by filing an objection by August 18, 2020. You can't ask the Court to order a different settlement; the Court can only approve or reject the settlement. If the Court denies approval, no settlement payments will be sent out and the lawsuit will continue. The detailed notice available at www.MagellanRoadMateSettlement.com explains how to request exclusion or object

Additional Information

This notice summarizes the proposed settlement. For the precise terms and conditions of the settlement, please see the settlement agreement available at <u>www.MagellanRoadMateSettlement.com</u>, by contacting Class Counsel at <u>info@MiTacLawsuit.com</u>, by accessing the Court docket in this case, for a fee, through the Court's Public Access to Court Electronic Records (PACER) system at https://ecf.cand.uscourts.gov, or by visiting the office of the Clerk of the Court for the United States District Court for the Northern District of California, 1301 Clay Street, Oakland, CA 94612, between 9:00 a.m. and 4:00 p.m., Monday through Friday, excluding Court holidays.

EXHIBIT H

Case 4:18-cv-05993-1St Document 70-1 Filed 09/30/20

No. 4:18-cv-05993-JST UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT, NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

All persons who purchased a Magellan RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map updates in the United States of America on or after September 28, 2014 and before June 30, 2019 ("Class Members")

You are not being sued. This notice affects your rights. Please read it carefully

On April 29, 2020, the Honorable Jon S. Tigar of the United States District Court, Northern District of California granted preliminary approval of this class action settlement and ordered the litigants to notify all Class Members of the settlement. You have received this notice because you may be a Class Member, and, if so, are therefore entitled to the remedies provided by the settlement.

The Final Approval Hearing on the adequacy, reasonableness, and fairness of the Settlement will be held at 2:00 p.m. on November 4, 2020 in Courtroom 6, 2nd Floor of the United States District Court, Northern District of California located at 1301 Clay Street, Oakland, California 94612. You are not required to attend the Hearing. **Note:** The date for the Final Approval Hearing may change without further notice to Class Members. Please check www.MagellanRoadMateSettlement.com for updates.

Plaintiffs Michael Livingston and Sharon McGill, on behalf of themselves and on behalf of all Class Members, allege that Defendant MiTAC Digital Corporation ("Defendant" or "Magellan") misled Class Members to believe that their Magellan RoadMate Navigators would receive free lifetime updates, when in fact Defendant allegedly required Class Members to purchase updates. Defendant denies these allegations and denies that it has acted improperly or wrongfully in any way. Defendant believes that the lawsuit has no merit. Page 96 of 9 First Class US Postage PAID PBPS

Livingston v. MiTAC Digital Corporation c/o CPT Group, Inc. 50 Corporate Park Irvine, CA 92606

RETURN SERVICE REQUESTED

CPT ID: <mark><<ID>></mark> <<FullName>> <<Address1>> <<Address2>> <<City>>, <<State>> <<Zip>>

The Court has not decided who is right. The proposed Settlement does not mean that any law was broken or that Defendant did anything urang. Defendant demission provided the settlement does not mean that any law was broken or the Defendant did anything

Summary of The Proposed Settlement Terms

Free Registration for Lifetime Map Subscriptions. If you purchased a Magellan RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map Updates on or after September 28, 2014 and before June 30, 2019, and you would like to receive free map data updates, you must register your lifetime map subscription on or before September 17, 2020. Registration is quick and free. You can either register on Magellan's website at https://www.magellangps.com/support/livingston-registration or, at your request, Magellan will mail a registration form to you. Registering your subscription will ensure that you receive free map data updates made available for your particular Navigator device for the next three years. At the end of this three-year period, you can renew your three-year registration at no charge. You can either renew your registration on Magellan's website at https://www.magellangps.com/support/livingston-registration or, at your request, Magellan 's website at https://www.magellangps.com/support/livingston-registration or, at your request, Magellan will mail a renewal form to you. You can continue to renew your three-year registration at no charge for as long as you use your Navigator device. To have a registration form or a renewal form mailed to you, please contact Magellan's customer support team at https://www.magellangps.com.

Reimbursement for Map Updates. Magellan will reimburse customers with free lifetime map subscriptions for verified purchases of map updates and for other incurred expenses relating to the lifetime map subscription, plus interest. This offer is available to customers who have purchased a Magellan RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map Updates on or after September 28, 2014 and before June 30, 2019. To submit a claim for reimbursement, complete the Reimbursement Form at www.MagellanRoadMateSettlement.com.

<u>New Terms and Conditions for Lifetime Map Subscriptions</u>. Magellan will update its website, marketing, and packaging of RoadMate Navigators with Free Lifetime Map Updates to state clearly the terms and conditions as provided in the FAQ, posted to Magellan's website on June 18, 2018, or advise potential purchasers where they can read the terms and conditions. Magellan will also instruct its third-party resellers and distributors to update their websites and any marketing material and packaging in their possession accordingly. Magellan has already begun implementing these changes and expects to complete these changes by June 30, 2020.

Customer Support for Free Map Updates. If you are experiencing any difficulties in obtaining a free map update for your RoadMate Navigator with Free Lifetime Map Updates, please contact Magellan's customer support team for assistance. Customer support is available through Magellan's website at https://service.magellangps.com.

Your Options Under the Settlement

Do Nothing And Remain a Member of the Class. If you do not exclude yourself from the Class, you will remain a member of the Class, you will be eligible for the benefits provided by the settlement, you will be bound by the settlement, and you will give up the claims that are released by the settlement.

Exclude Yourself From the Class. You may exclude yourself from the Class by completing the Exclusion Form online at www.MagellanRoadMateSettlement.com on or before August 18, 2020.

Object to the Settlement. You can ask the Court to deny approval by filing an objection by August 18, 2020. You can't ask the Court to order a different settlement; the Court can only approve or reject the settlement. If the Court denies approval, no settlement payments will be sent out and the lawsuit will continue. The detailed notice available at www.MagellanRoadMateSettlement.com explains how to request exclusion or object

Additional Information

This notice summarizes the proposed settlement. For the precise terms and conditions of the settlement, please see the settlement agreement available at www.MagellanRoadMateSettlement.com, by contacting Class Counsel at info@MTacLawsvati.com, by accessing the Court docket in this case, for a fee, through the Court's Public Access to Court Electronic Records (PACER) system at https://ecf.canduscourts.gov, or by visiting the office of the Clerk of the Court for the United States District Court for the Northern District of California, 1301 Clay Street, Oakland, CA 94612, between 9:00 a.m. and 4:00 p.m., Monday through Friday, excluding Court holidays.

Exhibit H to Declaration of Melinda Yang

Page 97

	Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-2	2 Filed 09/30/20 Page 1 of 17			
1	Raul Perez (SBN 174687) Raul.Perez@capstonelawyers.com				
2	Tarek H. Zohdy (SBN 247775) Tarek.Zohdy@capstonelawyers.com				
3	Cody R. Padgett (SBN 275553) Cody.Padgett@capstonelawyers.com				
4	Trisha K. Monesi (SBN 303512) Trisha.Monesi@capstonelawyers.com				
5	Capstone Law APC 1875 Century Park East, Suite 1000				
6	Los Angeles, California 90067 Telephone: (310) 556-4811				
7	Facsimile: (310) 943-0396				
8	Attorneys for Plaintiffs Michael Livingston and Sharon McGill				
9					
10	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT				
11	NORTHERN DISTRIC				
12	MICHAEL LIVINGSTON and SHARON MCGILL, individually, and on behalf of a class of	Case No.: 4:18-cv-05993-JST			
13	similarly situated individuals,	Hon. Jon S. Tigar			
14	Plaintiffs,	DECLARATION OF RAUL PEREZ IN SUPPORT OF MOTION FOR FINAL			
15		APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT			
16	MITAC DIGITAL CORPORATION, a California corporation,	Date: November 4, 2020			
17	Defendant.	Time:2:00 p.m.Place:Courtroom 6			
18 19					
20					
20					
21					
22					
24					
25					
26					
27					
28					
	DECLARATION OF RAUL PEREZ IN SUPPORT OF MOTION	N FOR FINAL APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT			

DECLARATION OF RAUL PEREZ

I, Raul Perez, hereby declare as follows:

 I am an attorney licensed to practice before all courts of the State of California. I am a Partner at Capstone Law APC ("Capstone" or "Plaintiffs' Counsel"), counsel for Plaintiffs Michael Livingston and Sharon McGill (collectively, "Plaintiffs") in the above-captioned action. Unless indicated otherwise, I have personal knowledge of the following facts and if called as a witness, I could and would testify competently to them. I make this declaration in support of the Motion for Final Approval of Class Action Settlement.

BRIEF OVERVIEW OF THE LITIGATION

Plaintiffs filed this class action in the United States District Court for the Northern District of California on September 28, 2018. (Dkt. 1.) The operative FAC asserts claims for: (1) violations of California's Consumers Legal Remedies Act ("CLRA"); (2) violations of Unfair Competition Law, California Business & Professions Code sections 17200, *et seq*. ("UCL"); (3) breach of express warranty pursuant to California Commercial Code section 2313; (4) breach of written warranty pursuant to the Magnuson-Moss Warranty Act; (5) trespass to chattels; and (6) unjust enrichment.

3. Although the operative FAC alleges six causes of action, they are all predicated on the allegation that Defendant marketed and sold the devices with "free lifetime map updates," but stopped providing free lifetime map updates after only three years, when it began to charge for updates instead.

THE PARTIES CONDUCTED A THOROUGH INVESTIGATION OF THE FACTUAL AND LEGAL ISSUES

4. The Settlement is the product of informed negotiations following extensive investigation by Plaintiffs' Counsel. Before and after filing the Complaint, Plaintiffs' Counsel investigated and researched the claims of Plaintiffs and Class Members relating to the "free lifetime map updates" offered in connection with Defendant's devices.

5. After filing the complaint, Plaintiffs' investigation entailed an exchange of information pursuant to formal and informal discovery methods, including document requests and the deposition of Defendant's corporate representative pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 30(b)(6). Plaintiffs' discovery and investigation focused on identifying the universe of models of the Magellan RoadMate FLM devices and determining which of those devices were, and are still able, to download and use new map updates.

Page 1

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-2 Filed 09/30/20 Page 3 of 17

6. Plaintiffs also requested and received evidence concerning the: (1) number of devices sold by Defendant in the United States during the Class Period; (2) the number of devices shipped to third-party distributors during the Class Period; (3) the number of Eligible Devices that were registered to Defendant, and Defendant's ability to identify Class Members through those registration records; and (4) all details and communications to Class Members regarding Defendant's June 2018 FAQ (the "FAQ"), which purported to limit the "useful lifetime" of the devices purchased by lifetime subscribers to 3 years.

7. The extensive document and information exchanges have allowed Plaintiffs' Counsel to appreciate the strengths and weaknesses of the claims alleged against Defendant and the benefits of the proposed settlement.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

THE PARTIES SETTLED AT A MEDIATION BEFORE A RETIRED JUDGE

8. Prior to their mediation, the Parties engaged in several months of preliminary settlement negotiations, during which they discussed the tentative terms and the structure of proposed class action settlement. Then, on May 8, 2019, the Parties attended a day-long mediation before the Honorable Jay C. Gandhi (Ret.) at JAMS. With Judge Gandhi's assistance, the Parties were able to negotiate a complete settlement of all claims at issue.

9. Plaintiffs filed a motion for preliminary approval of the settlement on July 12, 2019. (Dkt.
45.) The Court found the matter suitable for disposition without oral argument. (Dkt. 51.) The Court then issued an Order on December 4, 2019, outlining a number of deficiencies in the settlement and the motion for preliminary approval. (Dkt. 55.) In response to the Order, the Parties amended the settlement to address the Court's concerns. The Court preliminarily approved the amended settlement on April 29, 2020.

212223

QUALIFICATIONS AND EXPERIENCE

10. Capstone Law APC is one of California's largest plaintiff-only labor and consumer law firms.

11. Capstone has made important contributions to consumer protection law. In *McGill v. Citibank N.A.*, 2 Cal. 5th 945 (2017), Capstone represented plaintiffs in a major decision holding that the
right to seek public injunctive relief under the state's consumer protection laws cannot be waived and that
consumers need not satisfy class certification requirements to enjoin unfair business practices on behalf of
the public. In *Nguyen v. Nissan N.A.*, 726 F.3d 811 (9th Cir. 2019), Capstone attorneys reversed a denial of

DECLARATION OF RAUL PEREZ IN SUPPORT OF MOTION FOR FINAL APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-2 Filed 09/30/20 Page 4 of 17

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

class certification, making law that clarified the use of the "benefit of the bargain" damages models in consumer class actions. Both decisions were awarded a "Top Appellate Reversal" in California by *Daily Journal* for their respective years.

12. In February 2015, Ryan H. Wu and I were honored with the *California Lawyer* Attorney of the Year (CLAY) award in labor and employment for their work in the landmark case *Iskanian v. CLS Transportation Los Angeles*, 59 Cal.4th 348 (2014), which preserved the right of California workers to bring representative actions under the Labor Code Private Attorneys General Act ("PAGA") notwithstanding a representative action waiver in an arbitration agreement.

9 13. Capstone has an established practice in automotive defect class actions and is currently 10 appointed sole class counsel, following contested class certification, in Victorino v. FCA US, LLC, No. 16-11 1617-GPC, 2019 WL 5268670 (S.D. Cal. Oct. 17, 2019) and Salas v. Toyota Motor Sales, U.S.A., Inc., No. 12 15-8629-FMO, 2019 WL 1940619 (C.D. Cal. Mar. 27, 2019). Capstone has negotiated numerous class 13 action settlements providing relief to owners/lessees the last five years. See Granillo v. FCA US LLC, No. 14 16-00153-FLW (D. N.J. Feb. 12, 2019); Morishige v. Mazda Motor of Am., Inc., No. BC595280 (Los 15 Angeles Sup. Ct. Aug. 20, 2019); Falco v. Nissan N. Am. Inc., No. 13-00686-DDP (C.D. Cal. July 16, 16 2018), Dkt. No. 341 (finally approving settlement after certifying class alleging timing chain defect on 17 contested motion); Vargas v. Ford Motor Co., No. CV12-08388 AB (FFMX), 2017 WL 4766677 (C.D. 18 Cal. Oct. 18, 2017) (class action settlement involving transmission defects for 1.8 million class vehicles); Batista v. Nissan N. Am., Inc., No. 14-24728-RNS (S.D. Fla. June 29, 2017), Dkt. 191 (finally approving 19 20 class action settlement alleging CVT defect); Chan v. Porsche Cars N.A., Inc., No. No. 15-02106-CCC (D. 21 N.J. Oct. 6, 2017), Dkt. 65 (finally approving class action settlement involving alleged windshield glare 22 defect); Klee v. Nissan N. Am., Inc., No. 12-08238-AWT, 2015 WL 4538426, at *1 (C.D. Cal. July 7, 23 2015) (settlement involving allegations that Nissan Leaf's driving range, based on the battery capacity, was 24 lower than was represented by Nissan); Asghari v. Volkswagen Group of America, Inc., Case No. 13-cv-25 02529-MMM-VBK, 2015 WL 12732462 (C.D. Cal. May 29, 2015) (class action settlement providing 26 repairs and reimbursement for oil consumption problem in certain Audi vehicles); Aarons v. BMW of N. 27 Am., LLC, No. CV 11-7667 PSG, 2014 WL 4090564 (C.D. Cal. Apr. 29, 2014), objections overruled, No. 28 CV 11-7667 PSG CWX, 2014 WL 4090512 (C.D. Cal. June 20, 2014) (C.D. Cal.) (class action settlement

DECLARATION OF RAUL PEREZ IN SUPPORT OF MOTION FOR FINAL APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-2 Filed 09/30/20 Page 5 of 17

providing up to \$4,100 for repairs and reimbursement of transmission defect in certain BMW vehicles).

14. Attached as Exhibit 1 is a true and correct copy of Capstone's firm resume.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed this 30th day of September, 2020, at Los Angeles, California.

- Diz

Raul Perez

 Page 4

 DECLARATION OF RAUL PEREZ IN SUPPORT OF MOTION FOR FINAL APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT

Exhibit 1

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Cocument 70-2 Filed 09/30/20 Page 7 of 17

FIRM PROFILE

Capstone Law APC is one of California's largest plaintiff-only labor and consumer law firms. With over twenty-five seasoned attorneys, many formerly with prominent class action or defense firms, Capstone has the experience, resources, and expertise to successfully prosecute complex employment and consumer actions. Since its founding in 2012, Capstone has emerged as a major force in aggregate litigation, making law on cutting-edge issues and obtaining hundreds of millions for employees and consumers:

- Capstone has made important contributions to consumer protection law. In McGill v. Citibank N.A., 2 Cal. 5th 945 (2017), Capstone represented plaintiffs in a major decision holding that the right to seek public injunctive relief under the state's consumer protection laws cannot be waived. In Nguyen v. Nissan N.A., 726 F.3d 811 (9th Cir. 2019), Capstone attorneys reversed a denial of class certification, making law that clarified the use of "benefit of the bargain" damages models in consumer class actions. Both decisions were awarded a "Top Appellate Reversal" in California by Daily Journal for their respective years.
- In February 2015, Capstone attorneys Raul Perez and Ryan H. Wu were honored with the *California Lawyer* Attorney of the Year (CLAY) award in labor and employment for their work in the landmark case *Iskanian v. CLS Transportation Los Angeles*, 59 Cal.4th 348 (2014), which preserved the right of California workers to bring representative actions under the Labor Code Private Attorneys General Act ("PAGA") notwithstanding a representative action waiver in an arbitration agreement.
- Recognized as a leading firm in the prosecution of PAGA enforcement actions, Capstone is
 responsible for some of the most important decisions in this area. In *Williams v. Superior Court (Marshalls of Calif.)*, 3 Cal.5th 531 (2017), Capstone attorneys achieved a watershed decision before the
 California Supreme Court as to the broad scope of discovery in PAGA actions. In *Baumann v. Chase Inv. Servs. Corp*, 747 F.3d 1117 (9th Cir. 2014), a case of first impression, Capstone successfully argued
 that PAGA actions are state enforcement actions not covered by the Class Action Fairness Act.
- Capstone has an established practice in automotive defect class actions, recently securing over \$100 million in direct monetary relief to class members in the highly publicized Vargas v. Ford Motor Co., No. CV12-08388-AB (C.D. Cal. Mar. 6, 2020). Capstone has also negotiated numerous class action settlements providing valuable relief to owners/lessees the last five years. See Weckworth v. Nissan N.A., No. 3:18-cv-00588 (M.D. Tenn. Mar. 10, 2020); Wylie v. Hyundai Motors America, 8:16-cv-02102-DOC (C.D. Cal. Mar. 2, 2020); Granillo v. FCA US LLC, No. 16-00153-FLW (D. N.J. Feb. 12, 2019); Morishige v. Mazda Motor of Am., Inc., No. BC595280 (Los Angeles Sup. Ct. Aug. 20, 2019); Falco v. Nissan N. Am. Inc., No. 13-00686-DDP (C.D. Cal. July 16, 2018), Dkt. No. 341 (finally approving settlement after certifying class alleging timing chain defect on contested motion); Batista v. Nissan N. Am., Inc., No. 14-24728-RNS (S.D. Fla. June 29, 2017), Dkt. 191 (finally approving class action settlement alleging CVT defect); Chan v. Porsche Cars N.A., Inc., No. No. 15-02106-CCC (D. N.J. Oct. 6, 2017), Dkt. 65 (finally approving class action settlement involving alleged windshield glare defect); Klee v. Nissan N. Am., Inc., No. 12-08238-AWT, 2015 WL 4538426, at *1 (C.D. Cal. July 7, 2015) (settlement involving allegations that Nissan Leaf's driving range, based on the battery capacity, was lower than was represented by Nissan); Asghari v. Volkswagen Group of America, Inc., Case No. 13-cv-02529-MMM-VBK, 2015 WL 12732462 (C.D. Cal. May 29, 2015) (class action settlement providing

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Cocument 70-2 Filed 09/30/20 Page 8 of 17

repairs and reimbursement for oil consumption problem in certain Audi vehicles); *Aarons v. BMW of* N. *Am.*, LLC, No. CV 11-7667 PSG, 2014 WL 4090564 (C.D. Cal. Apr. 29, 2014), objections overruled, No. CV 11-7667 PSG CWX, 2014 WL 4090512 (C.D. Cal. June 20, 2014) (C.D. Cal.) (class action settlement providing up to \$4,100 for repairs and reimbursement of transmission defect in certain BMW vehicles). Capstone is currently appointed sole class counsel, following contested class certification, in *Victorino v. FCA US, LLC*, 2019 WL 5268670 (S.D. Cal. Oct. 17, 2019) and *Salas v. Toyota Motor Sales, U.S.A., Inc.*, 2019 WL 1940619 (C.D. Cal. Mar. 27, 2019).

• Capstone has served as class counsel in a number of significant consumer class actions, providing relief and protection to consumers from deceptive and unlawful business practices, data breaches, and deceptive and false advertising by large corporations and manufacturers. These cases include *Aceves v. AutoZone, Inc.*, No. 14-2032 (C.D. Cal.); *Fernandez v. Home Depot U.S.A.*, No. 13-648 (C.D. Cal.); *Livingston v. MiTAC*, No. 18-05993 (N.D. Cal.).

SUMMARY OF SIGNIFICANT SETTLEMENTS

Since its founding, Capstone has settled over 100 high-stakes class and representative actions totaling well over \$200 million dollars. Capstone's settlements have directly compensated hundreds of thousands of California workers and consumers. Capstone's actions have also forced employers to modify their policies for the benefit of employees, including changing the compensation structure for commissioned employees and changing practices to ensure that workers will be able to take timely rest and meal breaks. A leader in prosecuting PAGA enforcement actions, Capstone has secured millions of dollars in civil penalties for the State of California.

The following is a representative sample of Capstone's settlements:

- *Vargas v. Ford Motor Co.*, No. 12-08388-AB (C.D. Cal.): direct monetary benefits of over \$100 million to class members in highly-publicized class action involving alleged transmission problem.
- *Hightower et al v. Washington Mutual Bank*, No. 2:11-cv-01802-PSG-PLA (N.D. Cal.): gross settlement of \$12 million on behalf of approximately 150,000 personal bankers, tellers, sales associates, and assistant branch manager trainees for wage and hour violations;
- *Moore v. Petsmart, Inc.*, No. 5:12-cv-03577-EJD (N.D. Cal.): gross settlement of \$10 million on behalf of over 19,000 non-exempt PetSmart employees for wage and hour violations;
- *Dittmar v. Costco Wholesale Corp.*, No. 14-1156 (S.D. Cal.): gross settlement of \$9 million on behalf of approximately 1,200 pharmacists for wage and hour violations;
- *Perrin v. Nabors Well Services Co.*, No. 56-2007-00288718 (Ventura Super. Ct.): gross settlement of over \$6.5 million on behalf of oil rig workers for sleep time and other wage violations;
- *Cook v. United Insurance Co.*, No. C 10-00425 (Contra Costa Super. Ct.): gross settlement of \$5.7 million on behalf of approximately 650 sales representatives;
- *Alvarez v. MAC Cosmetics, Inc.*, No. CIVDS1513177 (San Bernardino Super. Ct.): gross settlement of \$5.5 million for approximately 5,500 non-exempt employees.
- Aceves v. AutoZone, Inc., No. 14-2032 (C.D. Cal.): gross settlement of \$5.4 million in a case alleging FCRA violations;

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Cocument 70-2 Filed 09/30/20 Page 9 of 17

- Berry v. Urban Outfitters Wholesale, Inc., No. 13-02628 (N.D. Cal.): gross settlement of \$5 million on behalf of over 12,000 nonexempt employees;
- The Children's Place Retail Stores Wage & Hour Cases, No. JCCP 4790: gross settlement of \$5 million on behalf of 15,000 nonexempt employees;
- *York v. Starbucks Corp.*, Case No. 08-07919 (C.D. Cal.): gross settlement of nearly \$5 million on behalf of over 100,000 non-exempt workers for meal break and wage statement claims;
- Rodriguez v. Swissport USA, No. BC 441173 (Los Angeles Super. Ct.): gross settlement of nearly \$5 million on behalf of 2,700 non-exempt employees following contested certification;
- Asghari v. Volkswagen Group of North America, Case No. 13-02529 (C.D. Cal.): Settlement providing complementary repairs of oil consumption defect, reimbursement for repairs, and extended warranty coverage of certain Audi vehicles valued at over \$20 million;
- *Klee v. Nissan of North America*, Case No. 12-08238 (C.D. Cal.): Settlement providing complimentary electric vehicle charging cards and extending warranty coverage for the electric battery on the Nissan Leaf valued at over \$10 million.

PROFESSIONAL BIOGRAPHIES

Partners

<u>Rebecca Labat</u>. Rebecca Labat is co-managing partner of Capstone Law APC, supervising the litigation for all of the firm's cases. She also manages the firm's co-counsel relationships and assists the firm's other partners and senior counsel with case management and litigation strategy. Under Ms. Labat's leadership, Capstone has successfully settled over 100 cases, delivering hundreds millions of dollars to California employees and consumers while earning statewide recognition for its cutting-edge work in developing new law.

Ms. Labat's career accomplishments representing consumers and employees in class actions include the certification of a class of approximately 3,200 current and former automobile technicians and shop employees for the miscalculation of the regular rate for purposes of paying premiums for missed meal and rest breaks.

Before her work representing plaintiffs in class and representative actions, Ms. Labat was an attorney with Wilson Elser and represented life, health, and disability insurers in litigation throughout California in both state and federal courts. She graduated from the University of California, Hastings College of the Law in 2002, where she was a member of the Hastings Civil Justice Clinic, served as a mediator in Small Claims Court for the City and County of San Francisco, and received the CALI Award for Excellence in Alternative Dispute Resolution. She received her undergraduate degree from the University of California, Los Angeles. Ms. Labat is a member of the National Employment Lawyers Association (NELA), the Consumer Attorneys Association of Los Angeles (CAALA), and the Beverly Hills Bar Association.

<u>Raul Perez</u>. Raul Perez is co-managing partner at Capstone, and has focused exclusively on wage and hour and consumer class litigation since 2011. Mr. Perez is the lead negotiator on numerous large settlements that have resulted in hundreds of millions to low-wage workers across California, including many of the most valuable settlements reached by Capstone.

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Cocument 70-2 Filed 09/30/20 Page 10 of 17

During his career, Mr. Perez has successfully certified by way of contested motion and/or been appointed Lead Counsel or Interim Lead Counsel in several cases, including: *Lopes v. Kohl's Department Stores, Inc.*, Case No. RG08380189 (Alameda Super. Ct.); *Hightower v. JPMorgan Chase Bank*, Case No. 11-01802 (C.D. Cal.); *Tameifuna v. Sunrise Senior Living Managements, Inc.*, Case No. 13-02171 (C.D. Cal.) (certified class of over 10,000 hourly-paid employees); and *Berry v. Urban Outfitters Wholesale, Inc.*, Case No. 13-02628 (N.D. Cal.) (appointed lead counsel in a class action involving over 10,000 non-exempt employees). As the lead trial attorney in *Iskanian v. CLS Transportation Los Angeles*, 59 Cal. 4th 348 (2014), Mr. Perez, along with Mr. Wu, received the 2015 CLAY Award in labor and employment.

Mr. Perez received both his undergraduate degree and his law degree from Harvard University and was admitted to the California Bar in December 1994. Earlier in his career, Mr. Perez handled a variety of complex litigation matters, including wrongful termination and other employment related actions, for corporate clients while employed by some of the more established law firms in the State of California, including Morgan, Lewis & Bockius; Manatt Phelps & Phillips; and Akin Gump Strauss Hauer & Feld. Before Capstone, Mr. Perez was a partner at another large plaintiff's firm, helping to deliver millions of dollars in relief to California workers.

<u>Melissa Grant</u>. Melissa Grant is a partner at Capstone. Ms. Grant is responsible for litigating many of the firm's most contentious and high-stakes class actions. The author of numerous successful motions for class certification, Ms. Grant is the lead or co-lead attorney on multiplied certified class actions currently on track for trial, representing over 140,000 California employees in pursuing their wage and hour claims. She is also at the forefront in developing the law on PAGA, including administrative exhaustion, standing, the nature of PAGA violations, the scope of discovery, and trials.

Prior to joining Capstone, Ms. Grant worked at the Securities and Exchange Commission as a staff attorney in the Enforcement Division, investigating ongoing violations of federal securities regulations and statutes and for Quinn Emanuel Urquhart & Sullivan, LLP, where she was an associate on the trial team that prosecuted the *Mattel v. Bratz* case. Ms. Grant began her legal career as a law clerk to the Honorable Harry Pregerson, Justice of the Ninth Circuit Court of Appeals before joining Sidley & Austin as an associate. She graduated from Southwestern Law School in 1999, where she served as editor-in-chief of the Law Review, and graduated *summa cum laude* and first in her class. Ms. Grant earned her undergraduate degree from Cornell University, where she received the JFK Public Service Award and the Outstanding Senior Award. Her published articles include: *Battling for ERISA Benefits in the Ninth Circuit: Overcoming Abuse of Discretion Review*, 28 Sw. U. L. Rev. 93 (1998), and CLE Class Actions Conference (SF) CAFA: *Early Decisions on Commencement and Removal of Actions* (2006).

Ryan H. Wu. Ryan H. Wu is a partner at Capstone and is primarily responsible for complex motion work and supervising court approval of class action settlements. Mr. Wu handles many of the most challenging legal issues facing Capstone's clients, including the scope and operation of PAGA, contested attorneys' fees motions, responding to objectors, and high-impact appeals. Mr. Wu is responsible for the merits briefing in *McGill v. Citibank, N.A.*, 2 Cal. 5th 945 (2017), where the California Supreme Court unanimously held that consumers' right to pursue public injunctive relief cannot be impeded by a contractual waiver or class certification requirements. He briefed the closely-watched *Williams v. Superior Court (Marshalls of CA LLC)*, 3 Cal.5th 531(2017), an important pro-employee ruling that broadened the scope of discovery in PAGA actions and resolved a longstanding conflict regarding third-party constitutional privacy rights. He also authored the briefs in *Baumann v. Chase Inv. Servs. Corp*, 747 F.3d 1117 (9th Cir. 2014), where, on an issue of first

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Pocument 70-2 Filed 09/30/20 Page 11 of 17

impression, the Ninth Circuit sided with Plaintiffs in holding that PAGA actions are state enforcement actions not covered by the CAFA. In February 2015, Mr. Wu, along with Mr. Perez, received the prestigious CLAY award for his successful appellate work, including briefing to the California Supreme Court, in *Iskanian*. Mr. Wu recently achieved an important consumer victory in *Nguyen v. Nissan N.A.*, 932 F.3d 811 (9th Cir. 2019), which clarified the use of "benefit of the bargain" damages models in consumer class actions.

Mr. Wu graduated from the University of Michigan Law School in 2001, where he was an associate editor of the *Michigan Journal of Law Reform* and contributor to the law school newspaper. He received his undergraduate degree in political science with honors from the University of California, Berkeley. He began his career litigating international commercial disputes and commercial actions governed by the Uniform Commercial Code. Mr. Wu is co-author of "*Williams v. Superior Court: Employees' Perspective*" and "*Iskanian v. CLS Transportation*: Employees' Perspective," both published in the *California Labor & Employment Law Review*.

Robert Drexler. Robert Drexler is a partner with Capstone Law where he leads one of the firm's litigation teams prosecuting wage-and-hour class actions. He has more than 25 years of experience representing clients in wage-and-hour and consumer rights class actions and other complex litigation in state and federal courts. Over the course of his career, Mr. Drexler has successfully certified dozens of employee classes for claims such as misclassification, meal and rest breaks, and off-the-clock work, ultimately resulting in multi-million dollar settlements. He has also arbitrated and tried wage-and-hour and complex insurance cases. Mr. Drexler has been selected as one of Southern California's "Super Lawyers" every year from 2009 through 2020.

Before joining Capstone, Mr. Drexler was head of the Class Action Work Group at Khorrami Boucher, LLP and led the class action team at The Quisenberry Law Firm. Mr. Drexler graduated from Case Western Reserve University School of Law, where he served as Managing Editor of the Case Western Reserve Law Review and authored Defective Prosthetic Devices: Strict Tort Liability for the Hospital? 32 CASE W. RES. L. REV. 929 (1982). He received his undergraduate degree in Finance at Ohio State University where he graduated *cum laude*. Mr. Drexler is a member of Consumer Attorneys of California (CAOC) and Consumer Attorneys of Los Angeles (CAALA). He has been a featured speaker at class action and employment litigation seminars, and has published articles in CAOC's Forum Magazine and The Daily Journal.

Jamie Greene. Jamie Greene is a partner at Capstone where she evaluates potential new cases, develops new claims, and manages client relations. Well-versed in wage and hour law and federal and state consumer protection statutes, Ms. Greene supervises the pre-litigation phase for all cases, including investigation, analysis, and client consultation. Ms. Greene began her legal career at Makarem & Associates representing clients in a wide array of cases ranging from wrongful death, insurance bad faith, employment, personal injury, construction defect, consumer protection, and privacy law. She is a graduate of the University of Southern California Gould School of Law and earned her bachelor's degree from Scripps College in Claremont, California. She is an active member of the Consumer Attorneys Association of Los Angeles (CAALA), and the Beverly Hills, Los Angeles County, and Santa Monica Bar Associations.

Senior Counsel

Theresa Carroll. Theresa Carroll is a senior counsel at Capstone Law. Her practice is devoted to the Appeals & Complex Motions team, working on various settlement and approval projects.

Prior to joining Capstone, Ms. Carroll was an associate with Parker Stanbury, LLP, advising small business owners on various employment matters and worked as an associate attorney for O'Donnell & Mandell

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Pocument 70-2 Filed 09/30/20 Page 12 of 17

litigating employment discrimination and sexual harassment cases. In 1995, she graduated from Southwestern University School of Law where she was on the trial advocacy team and was awarded the prestigious Trial Advocate of the Year award sponsored by the American Board of Trial Advocates (ABOTA) for Southwestern University School of Law. Ms. Carroll received her Bachelor of Science degree in speech with an emphasis in theatre from Iowa State University.

Liana Carter. Liana Carter is senior counsel with Capstone Law APC, specializing in complex motions, writs, and appeals. Her work on recent appeals has included reversing a denial of class certification decision in *Brown v. Cinemark USA, Inc.*, No. 16-15377, 2017 WL 6047613 (9th Cir. Dec. 7, 2017), affirming a denial of a motion to compel arbitration in *Jacoby v. Islands Rests., L.P.*, 2014 Cal. App. Unpub. LEXIS 4366 (2014) and reversal of a dismissal of class claims in *Rivers v. Cedars-Sinai Med. Care Found.*, 2015 Cal. App. Unpub. LEXIS 287 (Jan. 13, 2015). Ms. Carter was responsible for drafting the successful petition for review in *McGill v. Citibank N.A.*, as well as the petition for review and briefing on the merits in *Williams v. Superior Court*, 2017 WL 2980258. Ms. Carter also has extensive prior experience in overseeing settlement negotiations and obtaining court approval of class action settlements.

Ms. Carter was admitted to the California bar in 1999 after graduating from the University of Southern California Gould School of Law, where she was an Articles Editor on the board of the *Southern California Law Review.* She received her undergraduate degree with honors from the University of California, Irvine.

Molly DeSario. Molly DeSario is a senior counsel with Capstone Law, specializing in employment class action litigation. Ms. DeSerio's practice focuses primarily on wage-and-hour class action and Private Attorneys General Act litigation on behalf of employees for failure to pay overtime and minimum wages, provide meal and rest breaks, and provide compensation for off-the-clock work. She has experience briefing and arguing a multitude of dispositive motions in state and federal court and has successfully certified and settled numerous classes for claims such as exempt misclassifications, unpaid wages, missed meal and rest breaks, and unreimbursed business expenses.

Ms. DeSario began her career as a general practice litigation associate with Sandler & Mercer in Rockville, Maryland, handling a wide range of civil and criminal matters. Since 2005, she has primarily litigated class action cases and, for the last seven years, has focused on representing employees and consumers in class and collective actions across California and the nation, helping them recover millions of dollars in unpaid wages, restitution, and penalties. Molly graduated from Northeastern University School of Law in 2002. During law school, she interned for the U.S Attorney's Office in Boston, Massachusetts, and the Honorable Paul L. Friedman at the U.S. District Court for the District of Columbia. She received her undergraduate degree in Marketing and International Business from the University of Cincinnati, where she graduated summa cum laude.

Robert Friedl. Robert Friedl is senior counsel at Capstone, where he devotes most of his time to the briefing and litigation strategy of consumer protection cases. Mr. Friedl has over 20 years of experience representing plaintiffs and defendants in consumer class actions, insurance coverage and defense, employment law, and personal injury. His lengthy service as an appellate attorney has yielded several published cases, including successful outcomes in *Goldstein v. Ralphs*, 122 Cal. App. 4th 229 (2004), *Morgan v. AT&T*, 177 Cal. App. 4th 1235 (2009), and *Hecimovich v. Encinal School Parent Teacher Organization*, 203 Cal. App. 4th 450 (2012). At Capstone, Mr. Friedl was responsible for the appellate win in *Grant v. Unifund CCR*, *LLC*, 577 Fed. Appx. 693 (9th Cir. 2014).

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Pocument 70-2 Filed 09/30/20 Page 13 of 17

Prior to joining Capstone, Mr. Friedl was a partner at civil litigation boutique, where he handled the firm's most complex briefing. He is a graduate of the University of Connecticut, and received his law degree from Southwestern School of Law, where he earned an American Jurisprudence Book Award.

<u>Mark A. Ozzello</u>. Mark A. Ozzello is a senior counsel with Capstone Law, where he leads the firm's consumer team. He is a nationally recognized and respected consumer and employment attorney who has litigated those issues throughout the country. He has always been at the forefront of consumer rights, sitting on the Board of Governors for the Consumer Attorneys of California and regularly appearing as a featured speaker on consumer rights issues nationwide.

Mr. Ozzello is a former partner of Arias Ozzello & Gignac and, most recently, was Of Counsel to Markun Zusman Freniere & Compton, LLP. In his capacity as a litigator, he has obtained results for his clients in excess of \$200 million dollars. Mark has also achieved consistent success in the California Courts of Appeal, and several judicial opinions regularly cite to his matters as authority for class certification issues. He has also argued appellate issues in several Circuit Courts of Appeals with great success. Mr. Ozzello attended Pepperdine University School of Law where he was an Editor to the Law Review, publishing several articles during his tenure in that capacity. He received his undergraduate degree from Georgetown University.

Mr. Ozzello has always strived to be an integral part of local communities. He has established educational scholarship programs at several charitable organizations, including El Centro De Amistad in Los Angeles and St. Bonaventure Indian Mission and School in Thoreau, New Mexico, and presides over a legal clinic in Los Angeles which provides pro bono legal assistance to non-English speaking individuals.

Bevin Allen Pike. Bevin Allen Pike is a senior counsel with Capstone Law where she focuses primarily on wage-and-hour class actions. Ms. Pike has spent her entire legal career representing employees and consumers in wage-and-hour and consumer rights class actions. Over the course of her career, Ms. Pike has successfully certified dozens of employee and consumer classes for claims such as meal and rest breaks, unpaid overtime, off-the-clock work, and false advertising.

Before joining Capstone, Ms. Pike's experience included class and representative action work on behalf of employees and consumers at some of the leading plaintiffs' firms in California. Ms. Pike graduated from Loyola Law School, Los Angeles, where she was an Editor for the International and Comparative Law Review. She received her undergraduate degree from the University of Southern California. Ms. Pike has been selected as one of Southern California's "Super Lawyers – Rising Stars" every year from 2012 through 2015.

Eduardo Santos. Eduardo Santos is a senior counsel at Capstone Law, concentrating his practice on managing and obtaining court approval of many of Capstone's wage-and-hour, consumer, and PAGA settlements, from the initial contract drafting phase to motion practice, including contested motion practice on attorneys' fees. Over the course of his career, Mr. Santos has helped to secure court approval of over one hundred high-stakes class and representative action settlements totaling over \$100 million.

Before joining Capstone, Mr. Santos began his career at a prominent plaintiff's firm in Los Angeles specializing in mass torts litigation, with a focus on complex pharmaceutical cases. Most notably, he was involved in the national Vioxx settlement, which secured a total of \$4.85 billion for thousands of individuals with claims of injuries caused by taking Vioxx. Mr. Santos graduated from Loyola Law School, Los Angeles, where he was a recipient of a full-tuition scholarship awarded in recognition of academic excellence. While in

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-2 Filed 09/30/20 Page 14 of 17

law school, Mr. Santos served as an extern for the Honorable Thomas L. Willhite, Jr. of the California Court of Appeal. He graduated magna cum laude from UCLA and was a recipient of the Ralph J. Bunche Scholarship for academic achievement.

John Stobart. John Stobart is a senior counsel with Capstone Law. He focuses on appellate issues in state and federal courts and contributes to the firm's amicus curiae efforts to protect and expand the legal rights of California employees and consumers. Mr. Stobart has significant appellate experience having drafted over two dozen writs, appeals and petitions, and having argued before the Second, Fourth, and Fifth Districts of the California Court of Appeal.

Prior to joining Capstone, Mr. Stobart was a law and motion attorney who defended against civil liability in catastrophic injury and wrongful death cases brought against his clients, which included the railroad, public schools, small businesses, and commercial and residential landowners. He has drafted and argued scores of dispositive motions at the trial court level and had success in upholding judgments and verdicts on appeal. He graduated cum laude from Thomas Jefferson School of Law where he was on the mock trial competition team and earned his undergraduate degree from the Ohio State University.

<u>Orlando Villalba.</u> Orlando Villalba is a senior counsel at Capstone Law. His practice primarily involves wage-and-hour class actions and PAGA litigation on behalf of employees for the failure to pay overtime and minimum wages, failure to provide meal and rest breaks, claims under the Fair Labor Standards Act, and other California Labor Code violations.

Mr. Villalba began his career at Kirkland & Ellis where he handled a wide range of business litigation matters, including transnational contract disputes, insurance-related tort claims, developer litigation, and civil rights actions. He also has extensive plaintiff-side experience representing government agencies and note-holders in the pursuit of mortgage and other fraud losses. Mr. Villalba graduated from Stanford Law School, where he served as an articles editor on the Stanford Journal of Law, Business & Finance. After law school, he clerked for the Honorable Warren Matthews of the Alaska Supreme Court. Orlando received his bachelor's degree in International Business from the University of Southern California.

<u>Steven Weinmann.</u> Steven Weinmann is a senior counsel with Capstone Law and leads the consumer rights team. His practice encompasses complex and class action litigation, including consumer product and services cases under California's Unfair Competition Law (UCL), data privacy breach cases, and a special emphasis on vehicle defect litigation. He has a background in securities litigation, antitrust, environmental law, and consumer class action cases.

Prior to joining Capstone, Steven's experience included litigating class actions on behalf of employees and consumers, in addition to representing individuals and small and large companies in various types of litigation, from business disputes to personal injury, financial fraud, construction defects, and products liability. Steven has been instrumental in achieving favorable results for numerous certified classes, including cases against Home Depot USA (for wage and hour and UCL claims); LegalZoom.com, Inc. (claims involving illegal practice of law); Wells Fargo Bank, N.A. (UCL, CLRA, federal Truth in Lending Act [TILA] claims). Steven briefed and help bring about numerous reported decisions including *Fraley v. Facebook*, 830 F.Supp.2d 785 (N.D. Cal. 2011) (defeating a motion to dismiss on claims involving the right to publicity); *Ceja v. Rudolph & Sletten*, 194 Cal.App.4th 584 (Sixth Appellate Div. 2011), affirmed, California Supreme Court, 56 Cal. 4th 1113 (2013) (confirming the test for determining putative spouse status is a subjective one). He also helped brief and obtained a decision favorable to plaintiffs in a seminal case under California's UCL,

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-2 Filed 09/30/20 Page 15 of 17

McAdams v. Monier, Inc., 182 Cal.App.4th 174 (2010) (deciding only the named class representative needed to satisfy Proposition 64 standing requirements). He received his J.D. with distinction from the Hofstra University School of Law, where he was an associate editor on the Hofstra Law Review, and earned his undergraduate degree in English Literature and Political Science from Rutgers University.

Tarek Zohdy. A senior counsel with Capstone, Tarek Zohdy develops, investigates and litigates automotive defect class actions, along with other consumer class actions for breach of warranty and consumer fraud. At Capstone, he has worked on several large-scale automotive class actions from investigation through settlements that have provided significant relief to millions of defrauded car owners. Before joining Capstone, Mr. Zohdy spent several years representing individual consumers in their actions against automobile manufacturers and dealerships for breaches of express and implied warranties pursuant to the Song-Beverly Consumer Warranty Act and the Magnuson-Moss Warranty Act, commonly referred to together as "Lemon Law." He also handled fraudulent misrepresentation and omission cases pursuant to the Consumers Legal Remedies Act. Mr. Zohdy graduated from Louisiana State University *magna cum laude* in 2003, and Boston University School of Law in 2006, where he was a member of the criminal clinic representing underprivileged criminal defendants.

Associates

Brandon Brouillette. Brandon Brouillette is an associate with Capstone Law, where his practice focuses on representing employees and consumers in complex litigation, primarily wage-and-hour class actions and PAGA representative actions. Mr. Brouillette's entire legal career has been devoted to representing individual and class representative plaintiffs against large corporate entities. Prior to joining Capstone, he served as an associate at Boucher LLP where he managed the firm's wage-and-hour class actions. He earned his Juris Doctor from Loyola Law School, Los Angeles, where he spent a summer interning for the legal clearance and corporate legal departments at Warner Bros. He received his undergraduate degree from the University of Southern California, where he majored in Business Administration and spent a semester abroad in Budapest, Hungary. In 2016, Brandon was selected as one of Super Lawyers' "Rising Stars" in Southern California.

<u>Anthony Castillo</u>. Anthony Castillo is an associate with Capstone Law. His practice focuses on analyzing pre-litigation wage-and-hour and consumer claims, including claims for overtime wages, meal and rest periods, and off-the-clock work violations. Prior to joining Capstone, he was an associate at a California bankruptcy practice, where he represented individual and business debtors in liquidations and reorganizations as well as various debt and foreclosure defense-related issues. Mr. Castillo graduated from Loyola Law School, Los Angeles in 2009, where he volunteered with the Disability Rights Legal Center. He attended Stanford University for his undergraduate degree, majoring in Political Science and minoring in History. Anthony is admitted to practice law in California and Washington and before the United States District Court for the Central and Southern Districts of California.

Joseph Hakakian. Joseph Hakakian is an associate with Capstone Law. His practice focuses on prosecuting wage-and-hour class and representative actions in state and federal court. Prior to joining Capstone Law, Mr. Hakakian served as a summer clerk for Mark Ozzello at Markun Zusman Freniere & Compton, LLP, working on various actions including wage-and-hour claims, unpaid overtime, false advertising, and unfair competition. He graduated from UCLA School of Law, with a business law specialization, where he served as a staff editor for the Journal of Environmental Law and Policy and worked as a law clerk with the Consumer Protection Division of the Los Angeles District Attorney's Office. Prior to attending law school, Mr. Hakakian received his undergraduate degree from University of California, Los Angeles, in 2013, where he

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Pocument 70-2 Filed 09/30/20 Page 16 of 17

graduated summa cum laude, Dean's Honor List, and College Honors, and received scholastic achievement awards from Golden Key Honor Society and Phi Alpha Theta Honor Society. Joseph is an active member of the Consumer Attorneys Association of Los Angeles (CAALA), Consumer Attorneys of California (CAOC), and Beverly Hills, Los Angeles County, and Santa Monica Bar Associations.

Michelle Kennedy. Michelle Kennedy is an associate with Capstone Law. Her practice focuses on analyzing pre-litigation wage-and-hour and consumer claims, including claims for overtime wages, meal and rest periods, and off-the-clock work violations. She began her career as a contract attorney in the Utah Attorney General's Civil Litigation Division handling torts, civil rights, and employment law matters. She later founded her own firm handling business and intellectual property matters, where she settled a copyright infringement suit. Prior to moving to Southern California, Ms. Kennedy was recognized by Super Lawyers as a Mountain States Rising Star in 2017 and 2018. She also served as President of the Utah Minority Bar Association and as an Ex-Officio Member of the Utah State Bar Commission. Michelle graduated from the University of Utah S.J. Quinney College of Law in 2013, where she served as President of the Art Law Alliance and Vice President of the Minority Law Caucus. She earned her undergraduate degree from Brigham Young University in 2010, where she majored in Philosophy. Ms. Kennedy is an active member of the Consumer Attorneys Association of Los Angeles (CAALA) and the Los Angeles County Bar Association. Michelle is admitted to practice law in Utah and California.

Jonathan Lee. An associate with Capstone, Jonathan Lee primarily litigates employment class actions. At Capstone, Mr. Lee has worked on several major successful class certification motions, and his work has contributed to multi-million dollar class settlements against various employers, including restaurant chains, retail stores, airport staffing companies, and hospitals. Prior to joining Capstone, Mr. Lee defended employers and insurance companies in workers' compensation actions throughout California. Mr. Lee graduated in 2009 from Pepperdine University School of Law, where he served as an editor for the Journal of Business, Entrepreneurship and the Law; he received his undergraduate degree from UCLA.

Trisha Monesi. Trisha Monesi is an associate with Capstone. Her practice focuses on prosecuting consumer class actions in state and federal court. Ms. Monesi graduated from Loyola Law School, Los Angeles in 2014, where she served as an editor of the Loyola of Los Angeles Entertainment Law Review and was a certified law clerk at the Center for Juvenile Law and Policy. She earned her undergraduate degree from Boston University in 2011, where she majored in Political Science and International Relations. She is an active member of the Women Lawyers Association of Los Angeles, and the Los Angeles County and Beverly Hills Bar Associations.

Cody Padgett. An associate with Capstone, Cody Padgett's practice focuses on prosecuting automotive defect and other consumer class action cases in state and federal court. He handles consumer cases at all stages of litigation, and has contributed to major settlements of automobile defect actions valued in the tens of millions. Prior to joining Capstone Law, Mr. Padgett was a certified legal intern with the San Diego County Public Defender's Office. During law school, Mr. Padgett served as a judicial extern to the Honorable C. Leroy Hansen, United States District Court for the District of New Mexico. He graduated from California Western School of Law in the top 10% of his class and received his undergraduate degree from the University of Southern California, where he graduated *cum laude*.

Mao Shiokura. Mao Shiokura is an associate with Capstone. Her practice focuses on identifying, analyzing, and developing new wage-and-hour and consumer claims, including violations of the Fair Credit Reporting Act, Consumers Legal Remedies Act, False Advertising Law, and Unfair Competition Law. Prior to joining

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-2 Filed 09/30/20 Page 17 of 17

Capstone, Ms. Shiokura was an associate at a California lemon law firm, where she represented consumers in Song-Beverly, Magnuson-Moss, and fraud actions against automobile manufacturers and dealerships. Ms. Shiokura graduated from Loyola Law School, Los Angeles in 2009, where she served as a staff member of Loyola of Los Angeles Law Review. She earned her undergraduate degree from the University of Southern California, where she was a Presidential Scholar and majored in Business Administration, with an emphasis in Cinema-Television and Finance.

Brooke Waldrop. Brooke Waldrop is an associate with Capstone Law. Her practice focuses on the prelitigation analysis of wage-and-hour and consumer claims, including claims for overtime wages, meal and rest periods, and off-the-clock work. Ms. Waldrop graduated from University of Utah S.J. Quinney College of Law in 2008, where she was a member of Extra Muros, an international law journal and think tank. During law school, she volunteered and clerked for the Disability Law Center, International Rights Advocates in Washington, D.C., the Utah Crime Victims Legal Center, and the Utah Council for Victims of Crime. After law school, Brooke obtained an MFA at USC's School of Cinematic Arts Writing for Screen and Television program where she was also awarded the prestigious Annenberg Fellowship. Before joining Capstone as an associate, she worked at Capstone as a contract attorney and settled a copyright infringement suit for a commercially-successful property. She earned her undergraduate degree from Westminster College of Salt Lake, majoring in Political Studies with an emphasis in Philosophy, and minoring in Theater, where she graduated summa cum laude.

OUTREACH AND EDUCATION

To increase public awareness about the issues affecting class action and other representative litigation in the consumer and employment areas, Capstone publishes the Impact Litigation Journal (www.impactlitigation.com). Readers have access to news bulletins, op-ed pieces, and legal resources. By taking advantage of social media, Capstone hopes to spread the word about consumer protection and employee rights to a larger audience than has typically been reached by traditional print sources, and to thereby contribute to the enforcement of California's consumer and workplace protection laws.

	Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-	3 Filed 09/30/20 Page 1 of 2					
1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Raul Perez (SBN 174687) Raul.Perez@capstonelawyers.com Tarek H. Zohdy (SBN 247775) Tarek.Zohdy@capstonelawyers.com Cody R. Padgett (SBN 275553) Cody.Padgett@capstonelawyers.com Trisha K. Monesi (SBN 303512) Trisha.Monesi@capstonelawyers.com Capstone Law APC 1875 Century Park East, Suite 1000 Los Angeles, California 90067 Telephone: (310) 556-4811 Facsimile: (310) 943-0396 Attorneys for Plaintiffs Michael Livingston and Sharon McGill						
10	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT						
11	NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA						
12	MICHAEL LIVINGSTON and SHARON	Case No.: 4:18-cv-05993-JST					
13	MCGILL, individually, and on behalf of a class of similarly situated individuals,	Hon. Jon S. Tigar					
14	Plaintiffs,	[PROPOSED] JUDGMENT					
15	v.						
16	MITAC DIGITAL CORPORATION, a California corporation,						
17	Defendant.						
18							
19							
20							
21							
22							
23							
24							
25							
26							
27							
28							
	JUDGMENT						

	Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-3 Filed 09/30/20 Page 2 of 2			
1	FINAL JUDGMENT			
2	Under Rules 54(b) and 58, it is adjudged as follows:			
3	1. The Court entered the Order Granting Motion for Final Approval of Class Action			
4	Settlement ("Final Approval Order") approving the Settlement;			
5	2. For the reasons stated in the Court's Final Approval Order, judgment is hereby entered			
6	in accordance with the Final Approval Order; and			
7	3. Plaintiffs' claims asserted against Defendants in this action are dismissed with prejudice,			
8	without costs to any party, except as provided for in the Final Approval Order or Settlement Agreement.			
9				
10	IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED.			
11				
12	Dated:			
13	Hon. Jon S. Tigar			
14	United States District Judge			
15				
16				
17				
18				
19				
20				
21				
22				
23				
24				
25				
26				
27				
28				
	Page 1			
	JUDGMENT			

	Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70	0-4 I	-iled 09	/30/20	Page 1 of 4
1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Raul Perez (SBN 174687) Raul.Perez@capstonelawyers.com Tarek H. Zohdy (SBN 247775) Tarek.Zohdy@capstonelawyers.com Cody R. Padgett (SBN 275553) Cody.Padgett@capstonelawyers.com Trisha K. Monesi (SBN 303512) Trisha.Monesi@capstonelawyers.com Capstone Law APC 1875 Century Park East, Suite 1000 Los Angeles, California 90067 Telephone: (310) 556-4811 Facsimile: (310) 943-0396 Attorneys for Plaintiffs Michael Livingston and Sharon McGill	5 DIST	RICT CO	DURT	
11	NORTHERN DISTR	ICT C	OF CALIF	FORNIA	
12	MICHAEL LIVINGSTON and SHARON	Case	e No.: 4:1	8-cv-059	993-JST
13	MCGILL, individually, and on behalf of a class of similarly situated individuals,	Hon	. Jon S. T	ʻigar	
14	Plaintiffs,	[PR	OPOSEI	D] ORD	ER GRANTING
15	v.				AL APPROVAL OF CTTLEMENT
16	MITAC DIGITAL CORPORATION, a California corporation,	Date Tim		lovembe :00 p.m.	r 4, 2020
17	Defendant.	Plac		Courtroon	n 6
18					
19					
20					
21					
22					
23					
24					
25 26					
20					
28					
	ORDER GRANTING MOTION FOR FINAL APP	PROVAL	OF CLASS	ACTION SE	TTLEMENT

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-4 Filed 09/30/20 Page 2 of 4

1	Plaintiffs' Motion for Final Approval of Class Action Settlement and Motion for Attorneys' Fees,			
2	Costs and Expenses, and Class Representative Incentive Awards came before the Court for hearing on			
3	November 4, 2020, pursuant to the Court's Order Granting Motion for Preliminary Approval of Class			
4	Action Settlement dated April 29, 2020 ("Preliminary Approval Order") (Dkt. No. 65.) Having considered			
5	the parties' Amended Joint Stipulation of Class Action Settlement and Release ("Settlement Agreement"),			
6	and all papers filed and proceedings had herein,			
7	IT IS HEREBY ORDERED:			
8	1. This Court has subject matter jurisdiction over this action.			
9	2. Capitalized terms not otherwise defined herein shall have the same meaning as set forth in			
10	the parties' Settlement Agreement.			
11	3. The Court finds, following a rigorous analysis and for purposes of settlement only, that the			
12	following settlement Class satisfies the requirements of Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 23:			
13	All persons who purchased a Magellan RoadMate Navigator device with Free Lifetime			
14	Map updates in the United States from September 28, 2014 to June 30, 2019.			
15	4. The Court finds for settlement purposes that: (a) the Class certified herein consists of over			
16	a hundred thousand persons, and joinder of all such persons would be impracticable, (b) there are questions			
17	of law and fact that are common to the Class, and those questions of law and fact common to the Class			
18	8 predominate over any questions affecting any individual Class Member; (c) the claims of the Plaintiffs are			
19	typical of the claims of the Class they seek to represent for purposes of settlement; (d) a class action on			
20	behalf of the Class is superior to other available means of adjudicating this dispute; and (e) Plaintiffs and			
21	Class Counsel are adequate representatives of the Class. The Court also concludes that, because the action			
22	is being settled rather than litigated, the Court need not consider manageability issues that might be			
23	presented by the trial of a nationwide class action involving the issues in this case. See Amchem Prods., Inc.			
24	v. Windsor, 521 U.S. 591, 620 (1997).			
25	5. Plaintiffs are suitable class representatives and are hereby appointed the representatives for			
26	the Settlement Class. The Court finds that Plaintiffs' investment and commitment to the litigation and its			
27	outcome ensured adequate and zealous advocacy for the Settlement Class, and that their interests are			
28	aligned with those of the Settlement Class.			

Page 1

6. The Court finds that the attorneys at Capstone Law APC have the requisite qualifications, experience, and skill to protect and advance the interests of the Settlement Class. The Court therefore finds that counsel satisfy the professional and ethical obligations attendant to the position of Class Counsel, and hereby appoints Capstone Law APC as counsel for the Settlement Class.

7. The Court finds that notice has been disseminated to the Class in compliance with the Court's Preliminary Approval Order and that the notice given was the best notice practicable under the circumstances, fully satisfied due process, and met the requirements of Rule 23 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. The Court further finds that the response of the Class Members to the Settlement supports settlement approval. Only four Class Members opted out of the Settlement, and no Class Members objected to the Settlement.

8. The Court finds that the proposed settlement is fair, reasonable, and adequate under Rule 23(e)(2), is in the best interests of the class, and should be and hereby is fully and finally approved. *See* Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(e)(1)(B)(i). The Settlement Agreement: (a) results from efforts by Class Representatives and Class Counsel who adequately represented the class; (b) was negotiated at arm's length with the assistance of a distinguished mediator and jurist, the Hon. Jay C. Gandhi (Ret.); (c) provides relief for the class that is fair, reasonable, and adequate, taking into account: (i) the costs, risks, and delay of trial and appeal; (ii) the effective proposed method of distributing relief to the class, including the method of processing class member claims; (iii) the terms of the proposed award of attorney's fees, including timing of payment; and (d) the settlement treats Class Members equitably relative to each other.

9. In so finding, the Court has considered all evidence presented, including evidence
regarding the strength of Plaintiffs' case; the risk, expense, and complexity of the claims presented; the
likely duration of further litigation; the amount offered in settlement; the extent of investigation and
discovery completed; and the experience and views of counsel. The Parties have provided the Court with
sufficient information about the nature and magnitude of the claims being settled, as well as the
impediments to recovery, to make an independent assessment of the reasonableness of the terms to which
the Parties have agreed.

27 10. The Court finds that the settlement is non-collusive, a product of arms'-length negotiations
28 between counsel for Plaintiffs and Defendants presided by over by an experienced third-party neutral. In

Case 4:18-cv-05993-JST Document 70-4 Filed 09/30/20 Page 4 of 4

reaching this finding of non-collusiveness, the Court considered "subtle signs" of collusion identified by In re Bluetooth Headset Prod. Liab. Litig., 654 F.3d 935, 947 (9th Cir. 2011).

- 11. Accordingly, the Court hereby approves the settlement as set forth in the Settlement Agreement and expressly finds that the settlement is, in all respects, fair, reasonable, adequate, and in the best interests of the entire Settlement Class and hereby directs implementation of all remaining terms, conditions, and provisions of the Settlement Agreement. The Court also finds that settlement now will avoid additional and potentially substantial litigation costs, as well as delay and risks if the Parties were to continue to litigate the case. Additionally, after considering the monetary recovery provided by the settlement in light of the challenges posed by continued litigation, the Court concludes that the settlement provides Class Members with fair and adequate relief.
 - 12. The Release set forth in the Settlement Agreement is incorporated herein and, as of the Effective Date and by operation of this Order, is binding and effective on all Class Members who have not properly excluded themselves from the Class. The Settlement Agreement, including the full Release that is incorporated herein, can be found on the Court's publicly available docket at Dkt. No. 62-1.
 - 13. Without affecting the finality of this Final Approval Order and the Final Judgment in any way, this Court hereby retains continuing jurisdiction over (a) implementation of the settlement; (b) further proceedings, if necessary, on applications for attorneys' fees, expenses, and costs in connection with the action and the settlement; and (c) the Parties and the Class Members for the purpose of construing, enforcing, and administering the Settlement Agreement and all orders and judgments entered in connection therewith.

14. The Court finds that no just reason exists for delay in entering the Final Judgment. Accordingly, the Clerk is hereby directed to enter Final Judgment.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated:

Hon. Jon S. Tigar United States District Judge

Page 3

ORDER GRANTING MOTION FOR FINAL APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT